

ISSN 2637-2878 (Online)  
ISSN 2232-867X (Print)

UDC 316(05)

# Sociological *discourse*

*Hollywood Western in Socialist  
Yugoslavia – Reception and Production*

*Bosnia and Herzegovina – State,  
or a specter for shady business*

*Ethic of Care and Its Reflections on  
the Feminist Theories of Law and Justice*

*Meeting Ilija Jakovljević: Sociological analysis of  
theatrical play Logorilijada in the context of  
contemplating an individual within totalitarian societies*

*Ethnic identity(s) in post-Yugoslav  
Bosnia and Herzegovina*

YEAR X | NUMBER 20 | BANJA LUKA | 2020

# SOCIOLOGICAL DISCOURSE

SCIENCE MAGAZINE IN THE FIELD OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

Year X, No. 20

**Indexed in:**

CEEOL; Google Scholar; ERIH PLUS; EBSCO; DOI SRPSKA

Banja Luka, July 2021

**The Publisher:**

Scientific Association Sociological Discourse  
Srpska 2/2, 78 000 Banja Luka;  
Republic of Srpska, Bosnia and Herzegovina

**For the Publisher:**

Duško Vejnović, PhD (Chairman of the Scientific association Sociological discourse)

**Executive Editorial Board:**

Duško Vejnović, PhD - Full Professor (Editor-in-Chief)  
Vladimir Stojanović, PhD - Full Profesor (Editor)  
Biserka Košarac, PhD - Associate Professor (Editor)  
Dušanka Slijepčević, MA - Senior Research Assistant (Editor)  
  
Ivan Šijaković, PhD (Honorable Editor)  
Braco Kovačević, PhD (Honorable Editor)  
Jagoda Petrović, PhD (Editor)  
Dragana Vilić, PhD (Editor)

**Scientific Editorial Board:**

Ivan Šijaković, Professor of Sociology, University of Banja Luka (B&H)  
Jagoda Petrović, Associate Professor of Social Work, University of Banja Luka (B&H)  
Ronaldo P. Munck, Professor of Political Sociology/ Head of Civic Engagement, President's Office,  
Dublin City University (Ireland)  
Lazo Ristić, Professor of Methodology, University of Banja Luka (B&H)  
Stephen P. Turner, Graduate Research Professor, University of South Florida (USA)  
Richard William Outhwaite, Professor of Sociology, Newcastle University, emeritus (UK)  
Saša Bosančić, Goethe University (Frankfurt), Institute of Sociology, Visiting Professor (Germany)  
Dragoljub B. Đorđević, Professor of Sociology, University of Niš (Serbia)  
Sergej Flere, Professor of Sociology, University of Maribor, emeritus (Slovenia)  
Gabriela Klein, Professor of Sociology, University of Hamburg (Germany)  
Chris Baldry, Professor of Human Resources , University of Stirling, emeritus (Scotland, UK)  
Slavo Kukić, Professor of Sociology, University of Mostar (B&H)  
Braco Kovačević, Professor of Sociology, Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Banja Luka (B&H)  
Duško Vejnović, Professor of Sociology, Faculty of Security Science, University of Banja Luka (B&H)  
Ivana Spasić, Professor of Sociology, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade (Serbia)  
Ewa Dąbrowska - Prokopowska, PhD, researcher and lecturer, Institute of Sociology Science, University  
of Białystok (Poland)  
Merima Čamo, PhD, Professor of Sociology, Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Sarajevo (B&H)  
Dželal Ibraković, Professor of Sociology, University of Sarajevo (B&H)

**Secretary of the Editorial Board:**

Mirjana Čeko, MA  
Vanja Nišić, MA

**Editorial Contact information:**

Srpska 2/2, 78 000 Banja Luka; Republic of Srpska, Bosnia and Herzegovina  
E-mail: naucnicas@gmail.com, profdusko@gmail.com, dusankaslijepcevic92@gmail.com  
Phone: +387 (0) 65 526 793

**Print:**

MARKOS design and print studio, Banja Luka

**Circulation:**

400

Ministry for Scientific-Technological Development, Higher Education and Information society of the  
Republic of Srpska co-finances publishing of this scientific journal.

---

By decision of the Ministry of Education and Culture of Republic of Srpska No: 07.030-053-85-6 / 11, from  
12. 05.2011 year, "Sociological Discourse" - Banja Luka was entered in the Register of Public Papers under serial  
number 616.

---

# CONTENTS

**NIKOLA BOZILOVIC**

Hollywood Western in Socialist Yugoslavia – Reception and Production . . . . .5

**DUSKO VEJNOVIC**

**VLADIMIR STOJANOVIC**

**BORIS TRIVANOVIC**

Bosnia and Herzegovina – State, or a specter for shady business . . . . .29

**AMILA ZDRALOVIC**

Ethic of Care and Its Reflections on the Feminist Theories of Law and Justice . . . .45

**SARINA BAKIC**

**NEDZMA DZANANOVIC MIRASCIJA**

Meeting Ilija Jakovljević: Sociological analysis of theatrical play  
Logorilijada in the context of contemplating an individual within  
totalitarian societies . . . . .67

**MILICA B. SILJAK**

Ethnic identity(s) in post-Yugoslav Bosnia and Herzegovina. . . . .85



**Nikola Bozilovic<sup>1</sup>**  
University of Niš  
Faculty of Philosophy

**Original scientific paper**  
UDC 791.43:791.223.1(497.1)  
DOI 10.7251/SOCEN2120005B  
COBISS.RS-ID 133791489  
Accepted: 21/05/2021

## **Hollywood Western in Socialist Yugoslavia – Reception and Production**

### **Abstract**

*This paper deals with social and aesthetic factors of the popularity of the American cinematic western with the Yugoslav audience, beginning in the middle of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The author first examines sociological determiners of film audiences and analyzes social conditions under which their taste is formed. The empirical basis consists of the research into the preferences of film audiences, conducted in Belgrade from the 1950s to the 1980s. In this period the Western genre was the most popular one along with the adventure film. This was the phase of Westernization or “Americanization” of the Yugoslav society that served the purpose of decisive distancing from the policy of the Soviet Union. The second part of the paper contains the sociological analysis of the so-called partisan Western, a subgenre of the partisan war film produced in the manner of the Hollywood Western. Using the works of Yugoslav directors (Mitrović, Krvavac), the author shows how and why the Hollywoodization of films dedicated to the people’s liberation war waged by the Yugoslav partisans took place at that time. Cowboys in partisan uniforms rekindled the interest of the audience in the domestic war film. It is also worth mentioning that these partisan Westerns, apart from being financially profitable, played a socially desirable role as they performed the function of strengthening Yugoslav patriotism.*

**Keywords:** *Western; Hollywood; Yugoslav socialism; partisans; film communication; audience*

---

<sup>1</sup> PhD in Sociological Sciences; E-mail: bonicult@gmail.com

### Introduction: The canonized features of the western

For most of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the American western was one of the most popular film genres, both in the world and in the former SFR Yugoslavia. Its genre identity is recognizable by a number of characteristics, of which the action that takes place in the American West in the second half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century stands out, in typical places such as a small town in the West, a saloon or a desert. Western personalities are typified (sheriff, bandit, gambler, gunslinger), and the plots are built mostly around breaking or establishing law and order.<sup>2</sup> The plot of the Hollywood “cowboy movie” takes place in the pre-industrial period, in which there are characteristic conflicts, which are artistically stylized and brought to stereotypes - between wilderness and civilization, newcomers and Indians, thugs and law enforcement. The canonized features of westerns are essentially reduced to the collision of antagonistic forces of good and evil, and this conflict usually takes place on the main (often the only) city street, on the river bank or on a ranch of the O.K. Corral type. Among the standard props, the western includes a ubiquitous pistol, rifle, alcohol, gambling table, lasso, horse and mail carriage.<sup>3</sup> The accompanying protagonists are, in addition to an attractive beauty - a naive woman or one of easy morals (usually a singer in a saloon), some good-natured funny old man, a doctor, a judge, an executioner and an undertaker.

It is characteristic that the action of the western never takes place in an American metropolis, but exclusively in a small and remote city, such as Abilene, Dodge City, Wichita or Gun Hill. As scenography, an inn, a casino, a sheriff’s office, a courtroom, a barber shop and a stable are enough. In addition to the obligatory heat, prairie and cacti, the classic western respects the old tradition: the tradition of *gunplay* (duel with guns) on the street and the tradition of *dancing hall*, full of smoke and noise, with the sounds of the obligatory piano, on which there is a strong and relentless pounding. This includes a group of beauties, which serve as a kind of decor. Their role is reduced to entertaining guys, eager for all kinds of adventures.<sup>4</sup>

By the way, many features of other film genres (action, historical, war, adventure) also flow into the western genre. The popularity of westerns is also evidenced by the considerable number of comedies recorded on “cowboy” themes. One of these is *Go West* (1940) by the Marx brothers (Marx bros), in

<sup>2</sup> Rafaela Moan, *Filmski žanrovi* (Beograd: Clio, 2006), p. 12

<sup>3</sup> Radina Vučetić, *Koka-kola socijalizam* (Beograd: Službeni glasnik, 2012), p. 125

<sup>4</sup> Žan-Luj Rjeveru, *Vestern ili pravi američki film* (Beograd: Jugoslovenska kinoteka, 1960), p. 71

which the famous trio goes to the West in search of gold. American western comedies with Bob Hope, such as *The Paleface* (1948) and *Son of the Paleface* (1952), as well as films with the famous comedian Don Notts, also had a large audience. There is a famous film in which Jesse Donald Knotts plays a dentist in the Wild West (*The Shakiest Gun in the West*, 1968). Dean Martin and Jerry Lewis were funny cowboys in the comedy *Pardners* (1956), and there are more hilarious comedies of more recent date, such as *A Million Ways to Die in the West* (2014), directed by Seth MacFarlane. There are also western comedies shot outside the United States. One of the most notable is the musical parody of the Czechoslovak production *Lemonade Joe* (1964), directed by Oldrich Lipský. In the area of the former Yugoslavia, some directors also tried their hand at this popular genre. The film *Around the World* (1964) by Soja Jovanović, in which there is a longer sequence with the Serbian peasant Jovanča Micić, as a cowboy-sheriff, achieved notable success with the audience. Radivoje Lola Đukić's western comedy *Zlatna pračka* (1967), which deals with the nature and behavior of our people in the Wild West, also met with great interest from cinema spectators.

Overall, the ambiance of the Wild West, in which the plot of a classic Hollywood western takes place, is very suitable for a film medium. This ambience, in addition to the mentioned cities that look like scenery, is made up of the picturesque natural beauty of the wonderful mountains of Arizona, the ban on cattle, post offices and crowded taverns, where people drink, play, sing and shoot.<sup>5</sup> The entire panorama of landscapes and characters is ideal for aesthetic transposition, performed by a complete film crew led by a director.<sup>6</sup> Observed from a sociological point of view, it is very important that the ambience and plot of the western is very attractive to a wide range of audiences, who are looking for entertainment in the darkened cinema halls. It is not enough to say that the Yugoslav audience in the 1950s and 1960s was simply in love with American westerns. The Yugoslav, so-called partisan westerns, made in the manner of classic Hollywood westerns contributed to that. Seen

<sup>5</sup> Vladimir Petrić, *Razvoj filmskih vrsta* (Beograd: Umetnička akademija u Beogradu, 1970), p. 221

<sup>6</sup> The structure of the western and the canons of the genre are respected, but the film manuscripts of the directors differ. There are many important authors, and several names stand out from that multitude. In every respect, the approaches of John Ford and Howard Hawks are typical. Ford is known for his heroic, idealized and epic westerns, in which he places his characters in the context of the history and mythology of American society, while Hawks in his “male” films deals exclusively with the existential problems of individuals and issues of friendship and solidarity within a small group. They were followed by directors such as Anthony Mann and Budd Boetticher, who are considered the progenitors of modern psychological or “mature” westerns in which they develop a tradition opposite to Ford's - realistic and anti-heroic. For more see: Devid A. Kuk, *Istorija filma II* (Beograd: Clio, 2007), p. 114–118

in the context of Balkan studies and the culture of remembrance in the former Yugoslavia, the current sociological analysis of aesthetic affinities and preferences of this audience has gained special significance.

### **Sociology of film communication**

Before considering the relevant reasons for the great commitment of the Yugoslav audience to Hollywood westerns, it is advisable to examine the phenomenon of film communication and determine the concepts of film audience and film taste. Film communication is a complex sociological phenomenon based on the interaction of viewers and film works.<sup>7</sup>

It is about a well-known artistic triad consisting of an author, a work and an audience, in our case a director, a film and a recipient. In film, unlike most other arts, this social relationship is multiplied, given that the art of film is very specific. In addition to the director, who signs the final film project, a whole team of creators participates in the creation of the film - screenwriters, producers, actors, editors, cameramen, etc. So, in the beginning we are dealing with a *collective communicator* or, communicologically speaking, the sender of messages which are contained in the work itself, towards the audience, who in the case of film is massive, socially layered and heterogeneous. Having in mind all these facts, it can be concluded that film, as a part of mass culture, has its artistic and industrial side. It is a typical representative of industrial culture, which is one big field where social classes communicate at the same time - "both worker and boss".<sup>8</sup> If we agree that cinematography is an industry, and film is an art, then we will define film as a spiritual (aesthetic) product, adapted to the norms of industrial production. At the same time, its industrial component does not have to collide with its artistic expression.

The act of film communication as artistic communication is based on the close interaction of the artist and his work with the recipient. Sociologists base their view on this fact that artistic communication is a kind of social event - only when the artist is confronted with a real receptive subject, when they witness the reaction of the recipient of their work, and when there is a mutual dynamic process between them, that psychological process turns into dialectical, historical-sociological events.<sup>9</sup> The film audience can receive only what the film industry offers them, but also vice versa - everything that is offered to them depends to a large extent on what the same audience has previously accepted. Because of all this, the film belongs to the group of arts in

<sup>7</sup> Nikola Božilović, *Filmska komunikacija* (Beograd: Nezavisno autorsko izdanje, 1996)

<sup>8</sup> Edgar Moren, *Duh vremena 1* (Beograd: BIGZ, 1979), p. 46

<sup>9</sup> Arnold Hauser, *Sociologija umjetnosti 1* (Zagreb: Školska knjiga, 1986), p. 9

which the hypothesis of the so-called “feedback” effect has found the widest application. To the extent that the film creates a certain audience, the audience, with its needs, preferences, tastes and desires, influences the creation of the film.<sup>10</sup>

Psychological and sociological elements of artistic, and therefore film communication, are complementary. Namely, art, according to Edgar Morin, is understood as a kind of affective gratification, which is in the realm of the imaginary. “Aesthetically imaginary” is intended for the viewer, who is aware of the absence of practical reality of what the film represents to them.<sup>11</sup> Affective need is an integral part of any artistic communication. Film communication, however, is by no means pure aesthetic communication because it always carries strong social layers. In that sense, film criticism is an inseparable link in the communication chain, and the film critic becomes in a way a mediator between the author and their work, on the one hand, and the audience, that is, its taste, on the other.<sup>12</sup> Interpretation and critique of a film do not have to be decisive and decisive in the choice of film viewers, but as expert recommendations they can be a kind of guide through the impassable jungle, in which films of unequal aesthetic quality intersect.

According to most of its characteristics, the film audience belongs to the category of mass audience, which speaks of its numerically unlimited and socially heterogeneous composition. Strictly sociologically speaking, this audience belongs to the order of a structural social groups, given the differences in terms of social origin, economic status, class affiliation and other differentiations, such as age, gender, educational level, professional orientation. Hauser speaks of the millions of people who fill thousands of cinemas around the world as a “unique alliance of the human race.” The only connection between these people is that they come out of the cinema as amorphous as they entered. That is why they can hardly be called a real “audience” - they remain a diverse, unconnected, shapeless mass, which does not belong to any single class or culture.<sup>13</sup> Through the film, the key problems of the complex fabric of social and cultural life can be revealed. In this context, the words of Leo Rosten have a strong and convincing effect: “Hollywood can be placed under the microscope of the social sciences, as a tile that allows us to see, with enlarged and isolated details, the organic process of the whole social body.”<sup>14</sup>

<sup>10</sup> Miloš Ilić, *Sociologija kulture i umetnosti* (Beograd: Naučna knjiga, 1974), p. 284; Hidajet Repovac, *Sociologija simboličke kulture* (Sarajevo: Fakultet političkih nauka, 2009), p. 168

<sup>11</sup> Edgar Moren, *Film ili čovek iz mašte* (Beograd: Institut za film, 1967), p. 75

<sup>12</sup> Nikola Božilović, „The Film Critique as a Factor of Film Communicativity“, *Facta universitatis: series Philosophy and Sociology*, Vol. 1, No 5, 1998, p. 494–495

<sup>13</sup> Arnold Hauser, *Socijalna istorija umetnosti i književnosti 2* (Beograd: Kultura, 1966), p. 450

<sup>14</sup> Cited according to: Enriko Fulkinjoni, *Civilizacija slike* (Beograd: Institut za film, 1980), p. 25

Viewers of films come from various strata of society and there are numerous differentiations in their tastes. Within the audience, as a social aggregate, a multi-layered stratification is created, which corresponds to different tastes, understanding of art and the power of reasoning of individual subjects. In that sense, not only different groups of consumers are created, but also sub-groups are created within each group, which do not have a clear social and psycho-physiological specification.<sup>15</sup> As an audience, fans of the “seventh art” have some specifics through which they stand out from the group of other consumers of the content of mass culture. In this case, we are talking about the “youngest” audience, created and mature thanks to the invention of cinematograph, a great technical invention, which revolutionized the ways of social and cultural communication. Thanks to this device, unimagined and almost unlimited possibilities of communication with a large number of people in different places and in different environments were created. There was a breakdown of social (economic and class) barriers and the creation of conditions for communication on a planetary scale.<sup>16</sup> Having in mind the heterogeneity of the film audience, the fact that that audience is not amorphous but diverse and layered, it is concluded that it should not be seen as a bunch of depersonalized people. Artistically valuable films influence the creation of aesthetic sensibility in individuals and contribute to the education of film taste. In that way, an educated and highly demanding audience is created, which has a feedback effect on the further production of films. Thus, when inviting a film audience, it should not be forgotten that the audience is composed of audiences. By losing sight of that fact, the taste of one of its part is universalized, and the motivation that leads its other part to the film screening hall is proclaimed the motive of all.<sup>17</sup>

Aesthetic taste undoubtedly has a psychological dimension, but it is a sociological category *par excellence*. Taste, from a social perspective, can be viewed not only from the receptive but also from the productive side, because artistic production takes place in constant interaction with the recipients of aesthetic content. In this sense, the classical aesthetic messages of Karl Marx are always relevant: “(artistic) production delivers not only material to the need, but also the need to the material”, hence “production not only produces the object for the subject, but also the subject for the object”.<sup>18</sup> The connection between the tastes of the audience and the creativity is especially visible in the

<sup>15</sup> Arnold Hauser, *op. cit.*, p. 130–131

<sup>16</sup> Miloš Nemanjić, *Filmska i pozorišna publika Beograda: socijalno-kulturni uslovi formiranja u periodu 1961–1984*. (Beograd: Zavod za proučavanje kulturnog razvitka, 1991), p. 47

<sup>17</sup> Milan Ranković, *Društvena kritika u savremenom jugoslovenskom igranom filmu* (Beograd: Institut za film, 1970), p. 17

<sup>18</sup> Compare: Karl Marks – Fridrih Engels, *O književnosti i umetnosti* (Beograd: Rad, 1976), p. 66–67

film, which belongs to the arts that are produced industrially. The commercial side of the film requires producers to closely follow any sign of the audience's affection or aversion to certain genres and content. Primarily for financial reasons, it is approached to imitate, retell and paraphrase everything that was once crowned with success. Directors and producers take care to satisfy the taste of the current audience at all costs, because they see in it the reason for the existence of the film and their source of income.<sup>19</sup>

The theorists who saw the film as the largest and most powerful “taste factory”, and defined Hollywood as a “dream factory”, are right.<sup>20</sup> Hence, it makes sense to create and shape taste and raise it to a level from which the audience will be able to communicate with those works that have a complicated aesthetic structure. Béla Balázs expressed a concise statement about the two-way character of taste education, which sublimates the whole philosophy of artistic communication: “Art educated the taste of the audience, whose differentiated taste sought and enabled greater art.”<sup>21</sup> This statement, which has the character of a message, is universally applicable, and thus also pertinent to the situation related to the production and reception of film and, in particular, the western film in the culture of the Yugoslav socialist society.

### Audience of western film in Yugoslav society

From the moment it appeared, in 1895, the film has constantly shaped our lives in the sense that it sends messages, conveys attitudes and redefines our attitude towards everyday life. On the scale of art, the film, despite many oppositions, established itself as the “seventh” in a row. It is interesting that the inventors of the cinematograph and kinescope did not intend to create an artistic means of expression from “moving images”, but only to enable the visual recording of pictures from real life. This means that the invention of “film machines” preceded the birth of any awareness of their aesthetic potential, because cinema is in its material basis a technological form in which “technological innovation precedes the aesthetic impulse.”<sup>22</sup>

However, the artistic in the film could not obscure its other social functions - ideological (cognitive), moral, educational, upbringing and others. Politicians of all colors were, above all, interested in the practical side of mov-

<sup>19</sup> Žilber Koen-Sea, *Ogled o načelima jedne filozofije filma* (Beograd: Institut za film, 1971), p. 54

<sup>20</sup> Hortense Powdermaker, *Hollywood, the Dream Factory* (Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1950)

<sup>21</sup> Bela Balaš, *Filmska kultura* (Beograd: Filmska biblioteka, 1948), p. 19

<sup>22</sup> Dejvid A. Kuk, *Istorija filma I* (Beograd: Clio, 2005), p. 19

ing images, which referred to the propaganda and promotion of ideology. The post-war communist government in Yugoslavia tried to use the political-propaganda function of the film to indoctrinally shape the social consciousness of its citizens. There were many difficulties and controversies in the implementation of that idea, starting with the one according to which a capitalist (industrial, market) invention had to be adapted to the socialist (collective and state-directed) consciousness. This was especially true of film genres, such as westerns, which portrayed the atmosphere of the Wild West, quite different from that advocated by the socialist community. The question is how to fit violence, lawlessness, human intolerance, racial discrimination and imperialism into a society that cultivates the ideals of brotherhood and unity, political and military non-alignment, pacifism, philanthropy and socialist morality? In the first years after the liberation, it was difficult to reconcile the opposites of two seemingly irreconcilable social systems.

However, after 1948 and Tito's "no" to Stalin, there was a complete weakening of the influence of the Soviet Union in Yugoslavia and the strengthening of interstate relations with Western countries, especially with the United States. It was a real "Westernization" in which the film played a very important role. A special advantage for Yugoslav viewers was that the cinema was the cheapest and most affordable entertainment, in addition to being devoid of artificial glamor, etiquette and various forms of conventionality. The old cinemas were a feature of a time that was poor and exuded modesty in every way. Cinemas were the cheapest places to go out and have fun, so viewers did not pay attention to their technical shortcomings, such as poor picture and sound quality. It was not uncommon for wood and coal stoves to be lit in the halls on cold winter days, so the overall atmosphere was truly "homey". The satisfaction of the spectators was complemented by nibbling on seeds and peanuts, and cigarette smoke was inhaled secretly (in fear of strict distributors). With a murmur and occasional heckling (especially during some love scenes), everything together seemed free, relaxed, a bit comical, and sometimes debauched - similar to the cowboy way of life.

The first post-war decade of socialist Yugoslavia was accompanied by numerous difficulties, upheavals and controversies. The new ideology, which grew out of the war and the revolution, was established by strong propaganda in all spheres of life, in which the film was at the forefront. Social events could be followed, among other things, through the repertoire of cinemas and the number of foreign films in that repertoire. The screening of foreign films was determined by external and internal political circumstances. The period of consolidation of the new authorities was characterized by turning towards the Eastern bloc. At that time, the state was under complete Soviet influence,

and social-realistic films from the Soviet Union formed the backbone of the repertoire of Yugoslav cinemas.<sup>23</sup> The Sovietization of society, in the cinematic context, was obvious when it is known that, for example, Yugoslavia imported 169 films in 1946, of which 102 were Soviet, 9 American, 35 French, etc. So, 60 percent of the films, imported from the USSR, were the result of the state policy, which extended the screening and collective viewing of those films, which was taken care of by the Agitprop commission.<sup>24</sup>

The year 1948 marked the culmination of the screening of Soviet film. This trend was programmed by the state, since these were films dedicated to the heroism of the Soviet people, their labor exploits and the time of socialist construction. It is interesting that the American and Western European film had a large audience, despite the fact that it was consciously declared “reactionary”, “idealess” and “harmful”. The year 1949 brought a real turnaround when it came to showing a foreign film in Belgrade.<sup>25</sup> During this year, Soviet film lost on screenings and ratings. This film dropped to 52.80% in the total number of viewers in the Federal People’s Republic of Yugoslavia, with a slightly better percentage of 55.88% in Serbia. At the same time, there was a strong expansion of American film in our area. The conflict between Tito and Stalin undoubtedly contributed to that, which the United States used to cause a rift within the communist world. In the first years of the Cold War, America provided political support, and then economic and military assistance to Yugoslavia, in the form of various loans and credits. A favorable atmosphere for cultural cooperation was created, and on that occasion there was an expansion of American film in Yugoslavia. During 1951, for the first time since 1944, American films with 53.26% occupied an absolute majority in the repertoire of Belgrade cinemas. Although the popularity of films about the Wild West was recorded over the past decade, for the first time in 1951, on the list of the ten most screened films, there were two “cowboys movies” - *Western Union* (1941) and *The Oklahoma Kid* (1939).

---

<sup>23</sup> Milan Dević, *Između zabave i propagande: strani film u beogradskim bioskopima od novembra 1944. do kraja 1955. godine* (Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije, 2015), p. 16

<sup>24</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 30–31

<sup>25</sup> Numerical indicators in this paper refer to the research of the audience of Belgrade cinemas. Belgrade was not only the capital of the Socialist Republic of Serbia (the state bears that name from the 1963 Constitution), but also the capital of Yugoslavia in every respect, especially in the cultural one. Therefore, although the results of the research of the film audience in Belgrade cannot be generalized, they can tentatively show the preferences and quality of the film taste of the Yugoslav audience, especially the youth. Given that the then federal regime emphasized ideological unanimity, the social consciousness of the Yugoslav “working man” was formed through strong ideological propaganda, so one could speak of the Yugoslav film audience as a solid, rather monolithic cultural aggregate.

The opening to the West was initially timid, as people had to be prepared to accept “other people’s ideals.” The decisive role in that was played by the mass and popular media. “Pro-Western xenomania” was mostly spread by musicians who had the opportunity to travel to the West, mostly music (heard from the radio), as well as films, which attracted the audience like a magnet to cinemas. The main point of “soft” power and propaganda is the high standard of living in the West, and especially in the United States.<sup>26</sup> In this regard, the film repertoire in Yugoslavia, especially from 1950 onwards, was dominated by foreign films of Western origin.<sup>27</sup> It is interesting that the genre of western film was almost always at the top of popularity with the Yugoslav audience. Although, in the first decade of the new socialist government, such a trend was not transparent. Given such a high ratings of the film, there was a type of crime in the former Yugoslavia, related to visits to cinema performances and ticket resale. Due to the large crowds in front of the cinemas, it was not easy to get the desired cinema ticket. Such a situation led to the institutionalization of “tappers” (ticket buyers and resellers). It is a matter of systematically organized and illicit trade, which was dealt with by the territorialized network of tapper “gangs”, with the “kings” of certain city districts. According to the perpetrators of these socially forbidden actions, the government was very rigorous, and the police solved all problems mainly through repression. Western in the cinema, “cowboyness” in front of the cinema.

During the 1950s, there was an absolute predominance of American films in Yugoslav cinemas, with the dominant genres being adventure and western films. Although Yugoslav film critics did not show any preference to the western genre, these films were at the top of the ratings. The most watched westerns of that period include: *Law of the West* (1949), *Rio Grande* (1950), *Winchester '73* (1950) and *Broken Arrow* (1950). That time in Yugoslavia, when it came to showing and watching movies, can be spoken of as the age of westerns. In that sense, *Viva Zapata* (1952) was highly ranked in 1953 and *Across the Wide Missouri* (1951), and in 1954, in addition to the longest-running film *Gone with the Wind* (1939), the list of most watched films in Belgrade also includes the western *Jesse James* (1939), *High Noon* (1952) and *The Duel at Silver Creek* (1952). The most shown ratings also match the most viewed ratings, so among the three most watched films in 1955 is the American cult western from 1953 - *The Naked Spur*. The whole trend showed a significant

<sup>26</sup> Zoran Janjetović, *Od Internacionalne do komercijale: popularna kultura u Jugoslaviji 1945-1991* (Beograd: Institut za noviju istoriju Srbije, 2011), p. 186

<sup>27</sup> Until 1949, Yugoslavia was under complete influence of the Soviet Union, thus the new governing communist circle imported and showed primarily Soviet films that corresponded to the state ideology and values it advocated.

liberalization in terms of film imports and market thinking of the authorities, when it came to the commercial side of cinema. As far as the audience of American western films was concerned, the most numerous were young people, including students.<sup>28</sup> Statistics on the number of viewers of individual films show which films were the most watched, but not why, i.e. what was the structure of the audience. Therefore, we draw conclusions indirectly. As far as the Yugoslav audience is concerned, as a whole, it was mostly committed to light and entertaining contents. It did not stand out in taste from the majority of audiences around the world, to whom such films are offered the most. Hence, the most popular film genres belonged to entertainment and commercial achievements, which included adventure, historical, love and, of course, western films.<sup>29</sup>

At that time, there were few relevant, methodologically exemplary sociological studies of the taste of the film audience. One of the rare ones referred to the examination of film taste in 1970 among high school youth (10th Belgrade Grammar School) and young people attending industrial schools (Electrotechnical “Rade Končar” and Leather school center). The sample included 200 respondents from these schools. Therefore, the research had a limited character, but its results provided an orientation insight for deeper and more comprehensive reflections on this issue. Empirically, it was shown on the basis of what young respondents made the choice of films they watched, what was the influence of “external”, i.e. non-film factors on film taste, how important film stars were in the choice of films and the like. As for the western, it was always at the top of the interest of young people, with the preferences of girls differing from the preferences of young men. The boys cited the western as a “first wish” (combined with an adventure film), while the girls listed this genre only as a “second wish”, coming after the first, in which they preferred films with social and historical themes. The research also showed a distinct differentiation regarding the choice of film genres, depending on the type of school that the respondents attend. The difference was especially obvious in relation to the western genre. Students of industrial schools opted for the western in an impressive percentage of 55.5%, while grammar school students expressed interest in this film genre with only 27.5%. The significantly higher commitment of male respondents to westerns can be attributed to the traditional masculine or *macho* pattern of western films that was characteristic of the culture of Yugoslav society, while the higher affinities of industrial school students towards this film genre, compared to high school students, can be explained by the breadth of educational program in grammar schools,

<sup>28</sup> More details in: Milan Dević, *op. cit.* p. 78–100

<sup>29</sup> Zoran Janjetović, *op. cit.*, p. 209–210

which developed the sensitivity to a variety of cultural (film) contents, raising the level of aesthetic taste and critical judgment.<sup>30</sup>

Regarding preferences towards westerns, when it came to the age structure of the respondents, young people aged 16 to 17 voted for this film genre with 51.4%, young people aged 17 to 18 with 36.45%, and young people older than 18 opted for the western with 35.8%. In that way, the initial assumption of the research was confirmed, that the majority of young people would opt for adventure and western films, before those with love and war themes.<sup>31</sup> The appeal of the theme of western films to young people is generally linked by John Cawelti to the myth, which evokes the experience of harmony that is established between him and the unconscious inner needs and tensions of the personality. According to him, the western reflects an archetypal pattern, such as the desire of adolescents to grow up, but also their fears of growing up.<sup>32</sup>

Considering the number of cinemas and the cinema offer, Belgrade, as the capital and largest city, was in the lead in relation to other Yugoslav cities. Research shows that viewers were mostly interested in foreign films - primarily American, and then French, Italian and English. Thus, in the period from 1961 to 1965, the performances of foreign films were represented with over 80%, suggesting a tendency that would become even more pronounced in the following period. When it came to the ratings of western films, according to the report of "Belgrade Film" for 1974, out of a total of 210 premiered films, 39.0% belonged to crime and western films. In the same year in Serbia, out of the total number of performances, 40.1% were occupied by these two film genres, and out of the total number of spectators, 42.2% preferred crime and western content. The dominance of these genres, which have their origins in American national cinematography, was explained in part by the predominance of American films from total imports, and by another, in view of their artistic perfection, which played a major role in shaping film taste

<sup>30</sup> This observation is confirmed by other studies. Thus, at the beginning of the 1980s, an interesting tendency of the youth who went to Belgrade cinemas was noticed: while the student youth preferred the American ones, the working youth was much more in favor of domestic films. This testifies to the influence of educational and social status on the formation of taste. The young intelligentsia was more open to the new and the unknown, and the working class enjoyed watching the domestic and the familiar more. The division into intellectual (educated) and working (less educated) audiences was also noticed in a Slovenian audience survey from 1963, when more educated young people, although entertainment was their main motive for watching movies, cited the artistic value of film as the second most important motive (See: Janjetović, *op. cit.*, p. 214).

<sup>31</sup> See: Aleksandar Todorović, *Filmski ukus kod omladine* (Beograd: Institut za film, 1971), p. 77–80

<sup>32</sup> John G. Cawelti, *The Six-Gun Mystique* (Ohio: Bowling Green Popular Press, 1971), p. 82

in the world. and in Yugoslavia. In the period from 1976 to 1980, visitors to American films continued to be the dominant category. As before, belonging to a film genre also played a significant role in shaping the taste of the cinema audience then. Of the 26 genres into which distributors categorized films, plays and viewers, between 80 and 90 percent fall into ten film genres, among which the western occupies an enviable place.<sup>33</sup>

In the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the classic American western in the SFRY, according to many sociological indicators, was always highly positioned. Various factors contributed to this, and aesthetical ones were not primary. The denial of obedience to the USSR, turning to the West and accepting Western values, then the numerical superiority and quality of Hollywood film production, along with other social circumstances, had a large share in the ratings of American film. However, another fact could have contributed to the Yugoslav audience's choice of western. It is known that President Tito, a "dictator who loved westerns"<sup>34</sup>, was a passionate film lover and a big fan of cowboy movies.<sup>35</sup> Tito's undisguised fondness for westerns and American film in general could also be interpreted as sending a certain political message that the doors were wide open to westerns and the country of their origin - not only cinema, but also the wider society. In connection with the mass reception of the American western in the whole of Yugoslav society, there was also the production of a specific subgenre of partisan film, which, in a way, became an alternative to the Hollywood western. Thus began the era of the so-called partisan western i.e. cowboy movie *made in Yugoslavia*.<sup>36</sup>

### **Partisan western - universal characteristics and local features of the genre**

The western film in socialist Yugoslavia can be viewed from the receptive, but also from the productive side. Following the example of the classic American western and its stereotypes, in the country of *light* socialism, films that possessed all the features of the popular Hollywood genre began to be made.

<sup>33</sup> Compare with: Miloš Nemanjić, *op.cit.*, p. 176–185

<sup>34</sup> Ante Perković, *Sedma republika* (Zagreb, Beograd: Novi Liber, Službeni glasnik, 2011), p. 28

<sup>35</sup> Zoran Janjetović, *op. cit.*, p. 77; Radina Vučetić, *op.cit.*, p. 125; Milan Dević, *op.cit.*, p. 72; Greg De Kjur, *Jugoslovenski crni talas* (Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije, 2019), p. 69

<sup>36</sup> Since the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century, American westerns spread across Europe, Africa, Asia, and South America. Beginning in the 1970s, Italy, Spain, Germany, and Japan began making their own western films (See: Will Wright, *Sixguns and Society: A Structural Study of the Western*, Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1975, p. 5). Yugoslavia used its geographical space and cultural milieu to make partisan films in the spirit of American westerns.

The only difference was that they were placed in a new temporal and spatial environment - the years of the Second World War and the picturesque ravines and gorges of Yugoslavia. In the new context, the cowboys were replaced by partisans, and their opponents, instead of Indians and bandits, were now German occupiers and a lavish range of quislings ("domestic traitors"), led by Chetniks, Ustashas and ballists. As for the audience, it received the partisan "westerns" with undisguised enthusiasm and thus encouraged the producers to create other works of the newly established genre. Its taste had already been formed in classic western films and thus "prepared" for the reception of the domestic film subgenre. In that sense, it can be talked about a specific culture of film (western) communication, based on a built-in sensitivity to the visual, content and narrative components of the western - the classic Hollywood and the "newly composed" partisan.

Partisan war film was one of the most effective tools used by the League of Communists of Yugoslavia to maintain its collective myths. Similar to the Hollywood western that mythologized the creation of the USA (and became a kind of film archetype), such a task was performed by a propaganda partisan film, through identical conventions and iconography for SFR Yugoslavia. In both cases, there were simplified dichotomies and conflicts between good and evil, large expanses in the interior of the country, horses, rifles and shootings. In addition to exaggerated, mythical proportions, partisan films embodied a method that would fit the name of "romantic socialist realism." As for the content of this type of film, it belonged to the genre of historical war film, more precisely it referred to the Second World War. These were mostly stories about brave Yugoslav partisans in the fight against the external and internal enemy, embodied, on the one hand, in the Nazi invaders and, on the other, in the domestic forces of royalist Chetniks and Nazi-friendly Ustashas. Partisan war film encompassed the basic genre conventions of westerns and, in a formal-aesthetic sense, followed the rules of classical construction. In the editing procedure, it adhered to the continuity of space and time, the style was uniform, the lighting was naturalistic, as well as the decor and acting, and the narrative followed the traditional structure in three acts.<sup>37</sup>

Unlike most of the classic films about Yugoslav partisans described above, made in a patriotic manner with all the features of epics that glorify the revolution and the ideology of nationwide resistance to the occupying regime, in one period of Yugoslav cinematography films related to the same war period were made, with a completely different aesthetic and social orientation. Because these films were made in the manner of American westerns, they were colloquially called "southwestern", "partisan", "red" ("ostern" or "east-

<sup>37</sup> Greg De Kjur, *Jugoslovenski crni talas* (Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije, 2019), p. 61–63

ern”) westerns.<sup>38</sup> These films strictly adhered to the genre conventions of the authentic western, whose fame was spread by actors such as John Wayne, Gary Cooper or Kirk Douglas. While classic partisan films were inspired by communist ideology and portrayed resistance to the enemy with much pathos, as a mass movement of people sacrificially fighting for freedom and the ideals of a new society, a new subset of Hollywood partisanship with a typically Westernized plot highlighted fearless individuals endowed with fighting skills, similar to the ones seen in the classic “cowboy movies”. Our “heroes without flaws and fear” were unsurpassed in cowboy pugilism, and in some films they demonstrated their knowledge of techniques used in Eastern martial arts, such as judo, karate or jiu-jitsu! Yugoslav cowboys, in partisan uniforms, skillfully handled pistols, but they also showed dexterity in the use of ropes and knives in battles.<sup>39</sup> This “cowboyization of partisans” helped popularize the Yugoslav partisan film, which until then had not met with great understanding among young people.<sup>40</sup>

The Partisan Western adhered to the tried and tested manners of its American role model, which means that the aesthetic settings of all elements of films about the Wild West were respected, from the script through directing, editing and camera to acting. The only difference was that certain local features (geographical, historical, cultural) of the environment in which the work of the “domestic” western was located were added to the universal genre conventions. The emergence of a new subgenre in Yugoslav film showed that not all films from the The National Liberation Struggle were monolithic, in the sense that they presented a one-sided picture of partisan warfare, but that some of them treated the war as an action spectacle, respecting elementary patterns of Hollywood narration. The similarity of the western with the Yugoslav marking and the older one, the American one, exists in the plane of their ideological and mythological sphere, and is manifested through at least two levels. The first is indicated in the explicit takeover of certain visual film conventions from the American genre, while the second refers to the implicit ideological contents and messages that exist in the images of both film genres.<sup>41</sup>

The classic plot of the Hollywood western was redesigned in the Yugoslav version so that the viewer could easily consume it. This “hypothesis” can be

<sup>38</sup> Nemanja Zvijer, *Ideologija filmske slike: sociološka analiza partizanskog ratnog spektakla* (Beograd: Filozofski fakultet u Beogradu, 2011); Radina Vučetić, *op.cit.*; Dragan Batančev, „Cenzura partizanskog vesterna Kapetan Leši (1960).“ *Historijski zbornik*, god. LXVII, No. 2, 2014; Greg De Kjur, *op.cit.*

<sup>39</sup> Actor Boro Begović in the role of Tihi in the Yugoslav film “Most” (1969) by Hajrudin Krvačević showed all the knife handling skills, no worse than those demonstrated by James Coburn, as Brit, in the anthological American western “The Magnificent Seven” (1960) by John Sturges.

<sup>40</sup> Radina Vučetić, *op.cit.*, p. 137

<sup>41</sup> Nemanja Zvijer, *op.cit.*, p. 49

confirmed in many domestic works, made in the manner of real “cowboy movies”. The first feature film by the Yugoslav/Serbian director Živorad Žika Mitrović, *Echelon of Doctor M* (1955), is characteristic of this. It is an action spectacle, which followed many elements of western dramaturgy: fierce confrontations, galloping horses through picturesque landscapes and a horse race, seen many times in the famous westerns of John Ford. With this film, Mitrović began to create a completely new poetics of the Yugoslav western.<sup>42</sup> According to the application of genre conventions of the classic western, Mitrović’s film follows the universal patterns of this genre, which imply action and excitement in the Hollywood way, while in accordance with the place of action or events (Kosovo and Metohija), it bears certain local characteristics. In the landscape, which is irresistibly reminiscent of the gorges of the Wild West, a caravan travels (like American caravans of white immigrants) and is attacked by bandit-ballists, who replace the Indians from the well-known American “caravan” westerns.

Considering the place of the event, Žika Mitrović’s films carry the epithet of “Kosmet” westerns. The same type of film will be continued, elaborated and perfected by this director in some subsequent works, the most famous of which is the one called “Captain Leshi” (1960). The iconography of the westerns in this film is related to the exteriors, which were almost identical to those seen in the Wild West in American westerns, and are recognizable in canyons and gorges, where Albanian partisans and ballists move, gallop on horses and fight each other. And the scenes that were filmed in the taverns looked as if copied from the ambience of the Texas saloons. Even the characters were modeled on western patterns.<sup>43</sup> That is how the character of Captain Leshi was turned into a legend - he is a fighter for the “right thing”, an indisputable authority, who emerges victorious from all fights and conflicts. Women adore him and as the main protagonist, according to the postulates of the western, he also has a constant companion in charge of relaxing and comic scenes. His elderly friend, a certain Shock, who appears in this and the next Mitrović’s film “Obračun” (1962), is somewhat reminiscent of the character of Stampi from Hawks’ film *Rio Bravo* (1959). The exclusivity is that, thanks

<sup>42</sup> Radina Vučetić, *op.cit.*, p. 133

<sup>43</sup> Mitrović opted for a model of national hegemony, judging by the fact that Albanian characters speak Serbian. In addition to the linguistic, the director resorted to standard solutions on the visual level as well. “Leši rides a horse like a cowboy and fires a gun, and the impeccably clean partisans are opposed by dirty ballists who wear traditional Albanian clothes, which underlines their conservatism.” Ballists hide in the mountains that look like rocky hiding places from the westerns of John Ford and Anthony Maine, and the final showdown with them takes place in the eerie ambience of the sculptural miracle of nature Đavolja Varoš“ [Dragan Batančev, „Cenzura partizanskog vesterna Kapetan Leši (1960)“, *Historijski zbornik*, No. 2, 2014, p. 368–369].

to these films, we also got the first Yugoslav film star, embodied in Aleksandar Gavrić, as Captain Leshi.<sup>44</sup>

The mentioned films, including the first partisan ones, share one essential feature of the early westerns, in which the hero proves his loyalty to social values, by separating himself from the community in order to eliminate the enemy of the system. Some theorists in Westerns, and therefore in this partisan one, recognize the phenomenon they call *national cosmogenesis*, within which a group of immigrants of different nationalities, languages, religions and value systems want to create an integrated society embodied in a new nation and a new order. In that sense, Captain Leshi is presented as a soldier of the People's Army with a supranational identity. The idea of Yugoslavia in this film comes from below, from a hero close to the (Albanian) people, and not from above (from the supreme commander Tito and the Party), as later in the spectacles "Sutjeska" or "Užice Republic".<sup>45</sup>

Other films by this director that do not concern the Second World War have dramaturgy with exciting action plots that are also reminiscent of westerns, of course in a local environment known only to Yugoslavs. These are "Mis Ston" (1958), "Solunski atentatori" (1961) and, above all, "Marš na Drinu" (1964). In the latter, which is done in the manner of Ford's "equestrian" westerns, there is a range of stereotypical characters, characteristic of many cowboy movies.<sup>46</sup> There is a budding commander, a passionate gambler, an irresistible lover, and a young and brave naive fellow called Veca, an inexperienced lieutenant who in a way represents a copy of the character played by Horst Buchholz in "The Magnificent Seven". The action film "Marš na Drinu" is similar to those westerns that are dedicated to the fight of the American army, especially cavalry, with various Indian tribes. The film ends with the scene of the death of Major Kursula, when the ancient ideal of victory in defeat and defeat in victory is symbolically merged, while a powerful

---

<sup>44</sup> Radina Vučetić, *op.cit.*, p. 134

<sup>45</sup> See: Dragan Batančev, *op.cit.*, p. 367–369

<sup>46</sup> The treatment of mythologized historical themes exists in many American, but also some domestic films. Two typical and similar ones are *The Alamo* (1960), directed by John Wayne, and "Boj na Kosovu" (1989), authored by director Zdravko Šotra. In the first, which takes place in 1836, a small unit of Texas fighters raises an armed rebellion against the Mexican government, with the goal of keeping the Mexican army and thus enabling their detachments to gather for a decisive conflict. At the same time, they die almost to the last man. In the second, the Serbian army led by Prince Lazar opposes the larger Ottoman army and through defeat "wins" the battle by allegedly saving Europe from the strongest onslaught of the Ottomans with the bodies of its heroes. In both cases, these are historical events, lost battles that have the power of triumph for their nations. Both films, with the exception of the historical and mythological dimension, have a Westernized plot that emphasizes the heroism and sacrifice of individuals in the struggle for the "common cause."

composition is heard as a musical background, composed precisely as part of this victory.<sup>47</sup> When it comes to comparisons concerning the film as a musical performance, the music from the aforementioned Sturgis Western is no less powerful, which is the dramatic leitmotif of the entire film. According to Will Wright, film is the only modern narrative medium, in which everyday events and language are connected with music, and in the western its mythical meaning is especially enhanced.<sup>48</sup>

When it comes to the western *High Noon* (1952) or the Eastern, like *Captain Leshi*, the question arises as to how faithful these films are to the historical truth. This question opens another wider one, and it concerns the relationship between film and social reality. Since it is a work of art, and it is primarily a matter of imagination, then it is clear that film, as a construct, cannot (and should not) replace reality. And no matter how realistic it is, it is always equally distant from reality. Therefore, it is desirable for the recipient of the film to be aware of the discrepancy between historical reality and its film construction. Finally, credibility as such is not a predetermined category, but is firmly rooted in the social context and limited by its ethical, political, ideological or religious views.<sup>49</sup> Considering the issues of film credibility on the example of westerns, André Bazin stated in the Preface to Jean-Louis Rieueyrou's book on American western films that, in a purely quantitative sense, westerns that explicitly care about historical truth are a minority. The famous French film critic and theorist does not hesitate to say that in its most romantic and naive forms, the western is the complete opposite of historical reconstruction, but he believes that, even though they are primarily works of imagination, it is wrong to ignore their historical basis. "Because the relations between historical reality and the western are not direct, but dialectical. Tom Mix is the opposite of Abraham Lincoln, but he perpetuates his cult and memory in his own way."<sup>50</sup>

There are other films of Yugoslav production in which there are traces of western dramaturgy and iconography. The most impressive are those from the opus of the Sarajevo director Hajrudin Siba Krvavec. Today, we consider his action films, made according to the pattern of American westerns<sup>51</sup>, to be cult achievements, which have strengthened the already laid foundations of

<sup>47</sup> Aleksandar S. Janković, *Redefinisanje identiteta: istorija, zablude, ideologije u srpskom filmu* (Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije, Fakultet dramskih umetnosti, 2017), p. 19

<sup>48</sup> Will Wright, Will, *Sixguns and Society: A Structural Study of the Western*, Berkeley (Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1975), p. 12

<sup>49</sup> Nemanja Zvijer, *op.cit.*, p. 15–16

<sup>50</sup> See: Žan-Luj Rjeperu, *op.cit.*, p. 8

<sup>51</sup> „Diverzanti“ (1967), „Most“ (1969), „Valter brani Sarajevo“ (1972), „Partizanska eskadrila“ (1979)

a new genre in Yugoslav cinematography - the partisan western. In the good tradition of Hollywood action film dramaturgy, Krvavac created a “nationally useful western”. His example, as well as Mitrović’s, reveals the mechanisms that the Yugoslav government used to make American influences suitable for its own ideological needs. At the same time, a concession was made to the audience who got what they wanted to see. In an easy and attractive form, these films not only relaxed the viewers but also influenced their consciousness, thus fulfilling a certain “pedagogical” function.<sup>52</sup> At the same time, they created a feeling of catharsis due to the economy of poverty in which they found themselves. From the very beginning of the film, so to speak, it was realized that this medium is an ideal means of imposing socially desirable values that, directly or indirectly, could be placed very suggestively and convincingly. In this case, they were tied to the politics and ideology of socialist society.

Greg DeCuir notices that the partisan westerns of the Sarajevo director, with the exception of one film, take place in the natural expanses of Bosnia and Herzegovina, which was the main symbol of this genre. One of the reasons why the national liberation struggle was fought mostly on the territory of this Yugoslav republic was that with its mountains, canyons and “rainforests” it provided optimal conditions for maneuvering, and that best suited the guerrilla, partisan way of warfare. However, Bosnia and Herzegovina had another advantage over other areas of the former Yugoslavia - its multiethnicity was most conducive to nationwide resistance.

“Rural spaces and lush naturalism often included horses, just like in westerns. Chetniks, who supported the monarchy, were usually depicted riding horses in battle, in keeping with their rustic, perhaps provincial nature, similar to the simplified representations of these films. The Germans drive into battle on tanks, while the virtuous partisans move exclusively on foot, which should emphasize their modest origin. Accordingly, in these films, the portrayal of different types of movement has ideological implications.”<sup>53</sup>

Yugoslav producers and, in general, film workers knew that the film image was one of the most important mediators in conveying a certain ideological message, that is, that the constitution of ideological meanings, through the film image, was in the function of direct and indirect political propaganda.<sup>54</sup> Film painting, as an ideological message, also played an important role in the partisan western as a very popular film genre. Hence the benevolence of the Yugoslav government towards the partisan spectacles, dressed in the spirit of westerns. The influence of politics here also existed exclusively for ideologi-

<sup>52</sup> Radina Vučetić, *op. cit.*, p. 142–143

<sup>53</sup> Greg De Kjur, *op.cit.*, p. 66

<sup>54</sup> Nemanja Zvijer, *op.cit.*, p. 21

cal reasons. Allowing American influence, when it came to partisan action films, suited the authorities, in terms of diverting attention from the burning problems of society to everything that made up the essence of Hollywood - getting out of gray and gloomy everyday life into the false world of luxurious, fluttering and pink life. In short, the Yugoslav authorities desperately needed a Hollywood happy ending.<sup>55</sup> In this way, the socialist government, with the League of Communists as the “vanguard of the working class,” fulfilled a two-fold goal: on the one hand, it met the needs of the general public, indulging its tastes, and, on the other, achieving its vital political and ideological interests.

## Conclusion

The post-war Yugoslav socialist society was characterized by numerous contradictions, which did not bypass the sphere of culture. At that time, it could be said that film was the leading art - not because of its aesthetic possibilities, which were undoubtedly there, but because of the great ideological and propaganda-political power of that medium, in that it could convey messages to a large mass of people in a short time. At first, the complete Sovietization of Yugoslav society was obvious, which, in the cinematic context, was marked by the enormous import of Soviet films. However, after 1948 and Tito's historic “no” to Stalin, there was a complete reversal and Westernization - the strengthening of interstate ties with Western countries (especially with the United States), in which the film played a significant role. From then on, Soviet film lost both its screenings and ratings.

Using the conflict between Tito and Stalin, the United States was given an incentive to cause a split within the communist world. In the first years of the Cold War, in addition to moral support, America provided Yugoslavia with assistance in the form of various loans and credits. A special kind of cooperation manifested itself on the cultural level, when there was a real expansion of American film in the SFRY. Since the early 1950s, American films had an absolute majority in terms of screenings and ratings. The genre of classic Hollywood western was at the top of popularity, especially among Yugoslav youth, and this tendency continued for the next few decades. The high positioning of westerns did not exist (only) due to the aesthetic qualities of that type of film or due to the artistic preferences of the audience, although these factors cannot be denied. American films, as well as westerns, were socially desirable, primarily because of the pro-Western orientation of the then political leadership.

<sup>55</sup> Radina Vučetić, „Kauboji u partizanskoj uniformi (američki vesterni i partizanski vesterni u Jugoslaviji šezdesetih godina 20. veka)“, *Tokovi istorije*, No. 2, 2010, p. 150–151

In addition to the fact that the American western in Yugoslavia was the leading film genre in the receptive sense, in the country of “soft” socialism, works based on the model of films from the Wild West began to be shot. It was the case of the so-called partisan western, created in the process of Hollywoodization of partisan film, which included the “cowboyization” of partisans. In the domestic social environment, cowboys were replaced by partisans, and Indians by various quislings, “domestic traitors” and collaborators of the occupiers. As for the genre conventions, they were respected, as in every western - there was a lot of singing, gunfighting, horseback riding, attacking caravans and the like.

Although the Wild West, as a word and as a syntagm, contains an a priori negative connotation - as a society of anarchy, anomie, lawlessness, crime, brutality and immorality, in Yugoslavia there were ways to emphasize some virtues, which were attributed mainly to heroes, who fought against these vices. They were characterized by courage, honesty, humanity and a protective attitude towards those weaker than themselves, which were, in fact, the values on which (at least declaratively) the Yugoslav socialist community rested. In this way, the antinomies between socialism, as a society of equal people, and capitalism, which was fraught with class antagonisms and a number of other social opposites, were somewhat overcome. By finding closeness in differences, through a western film, a twofold benefit was achieved - film producers were satisfied, but so was the audience, whose taste was nurtured in a spirit that impressed the manipulative political elite.

## Literature

- Balaš, Bela. *Filmska kultura*. Beograd: Filmska biblioteka. 1948.
- Batančev, Dragan. „Cenzura partizanskog vesterna Kapetan Leši (1960)“. *Historijski zbornik*, god. LXVII, br. 2, str. 361–380. 2014.
- Božilović, Nikola. *Filmska komunikacija*. Beograd: Nezavisno autorsko izdanje. 1996.
- Božilović, Nikola. „The Film Critique as a Factor of Film Communicativity“. *Facta universitatis: series Philosophy and Sociology*, Vol. 1, No 5, pp. 491–497. 1998
- Cawelti, John G. *The Six-Gun Mystique*. Ohio: Bowling Green Popular Press. 1971
- De Kjur, Greg. *Jugoslovenski crni talas*. Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije. 2019.
- Dević, Milan. *Između zabave i propagande: strani film u beogradskim bioskopima od novembra 1944. do kraja 1955. godine*. Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije. 2015.

- Fulkinjoni, Enriko. *Civilizacija slike*. Beograd: Institut za film. 1980.
- Hauser, Arnold. *Sociologija umjetnosti 1*. Zagreb: Školska knjiga. 1986.
- Hauzer, Arnold. *Socijalna istorija umetnosti i književnosti 2*. Beograd: Kultura. 1966.
- Ilić, Miloš. *Sociologija kulture i umetnosti*. Beograd: Naučna knjiga. 1974.
- Janković, Aleksandar S. *Redefinisanje identiteta: istorija, zablude, ideologije u srpskom filmu*. Beograd: Filmski centar Srbije. Fakultet dramskih umetnosti. 2017.
- Janjetović, Zoran. *Od Internacionale do komercijale: popularna kultura u Jugoslaviji 1945-1991*. Beograd: Institut za noviju istoriju Srbije. 2011.
- Koen-Sea, Žilber. *Ogled o načelima jedne filozofije filma*. Beograd: Institut za film. 1971.
- Kuk, Dejvid A. *Istorija filma I*. Beograd: Clio. 2005.
- Kuk, Dejvid A. *Istorija filma II*. Beograd: Clio. 2007.
- Marks, Karl – Engels, Fridrih. *O književnosti i umetnosti*. Beograd: Rad. 1976.
- Moan, Rafaela. *Filmski žanrovi*. Beograd: Clio. 2006.
- Moren, Edgar. *Film ili čovek iz mašte*. Beograd: Institut za film. 1967.
- Moren, Edgar. *Duh vremena 1*. Beograd: BIGZ. 1979.
- Nemanjić, Miloš. *Filmska i pozorišna publika Beograda: socijalno-kulturni uslovi formiranja u periodu 1961–1984*. Beograd: Zavod za proučavanje kulturnog razvitka. 1991.
- Perković, Ante. *Sedma republika: pop kultura u YU raspadu*. Zagreb, Beograd: Novi Liber, Službeni glasnik. 2011.
- Petrić, Vladimir. *Razvoj filmskih vrsta: kako se razvijao film*. Beograd: Umetnička akademija u Beogradu. 1970.
- Powdermaker, Hortense. *Hollywood, the Dream Factory*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company. 1950.
- Ranković, Milan. *Društvena kritika u savremenom jugoslovenskom igranom filmu*. Beograd: Institut za film. 1970.
- Repovac, Hidajet. *Sociologija simboličke kulture*. Sarajevo: Fakultet političkih nauka. 2009.
- Rjeperu, Žan-Luj. *Vestern ili pravi američki film*. Beograd: Jugoslovenska kinoteka. 1960.
- Todorović, Aleksandar. *Filmski ukus kod omladine*. Beograd: Institut za film. 1971.
- Vučetić, Radina. „Kauboji u partizanskoj uniformi (američki vesterni i partizanski vesterni u Jugoslaviji šezdesetih godina 20. veka)“. *Tokovi istorije*, br. 2, str. 130–152. 2010.
- Vučetić, Radina. *Koka-kola socijalizam: amerikanizacija jugoslovenske popularne kulture šezdesetih godina XX veka*. Beograd: Službeni glasnik. 2012.

Wright, Will. *Sixguns and Society: A Structural Study of the Western*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press. 1975.

Zvijer, Nemanja. *Ideologija filmske slike: Sociološka analiza partizanskog ratnog spektakla*. Beograd: Filozofski fakultet u Beogradu. 2011.



**Dusko Vejnovic<sup>1</sup>**

*Faculty of Security Sciences  
University of Banja Luka*

**Vladimir Stojanovic<sup>2</sup>**

*University of Modern  
Sciences CKM, Mostar*

**Boris Trivanovic<sup>3</sup>**

*European Defendology  
Center Banja Luka*

**Preliminary announcement**

UDC: 323.1(497.6):[316.334.3:316.614.5/.6  
DOI 10.7251/SOCEN2120029V

COBISS.RS-ID 133791745

Accepted: 19/03/2021

## **Bosnia and Herzegovina – State, or a specter for shady business**

### **Abstract**

*In Bosnia and Herzegovina (furthermore: B&H), as a state with a complex state organization, the opposing and particular national and social interests that exclude unity and social compromise are dominant. Such a state of society is significantly contributed by political parties in B&H, whose activities do not lead to a change in social conditions, but are exclusively aimed at struggle for votes and gaining power in order to achieve their own particular interests. If “parity democracy”, which is a distinctive feature of the political system in B&H as a specific form of pluralistic democracy in which the focus is on the group and not on the individual citizen, is applied as the only form of democracy in a society and state, then there is a real danger that individuals and the narrow groups usurp power and figure as the only “protectors” of the national interest, which is significantly influenced by the deficit of democratic tradition and the low level of education of the population in B&H. Consequence of the parity principle of decision-making in institutions of B&H is that national sovereignty is placed above people’s sovereignty, i.e. it leads to strengthening the power of national elites, therefore it is necessary to establish an appropriate balance between parity decision-making and majority*

---

<sup>1</sup> PhD; Full Professor, Faculty of Security Sciences, University of Banja Luka;  
E-mail: dusko.vejnovic@unibl.org

<sup>2</sup> PhD; Full Professor, University of Modern Sciences CKM in Mostar;  
E-mail: vladastojanovic.ppf@gmail.com

<sup>3</sup> MA; European Defendology Center Banja Luka; E-mail: boristrivanovic@yahoo.com

*decision-making in a manner that protects the rational functioning of the system, but at the same time eliminates any possibility of majorization. Establishing such a balance is significantly hampered by national and religious divisions, which are very pronounced in B&H, and the presence of such political and cultural divisions is an obstacle to the creation and functioning of civil society. One of the dominant factors slowing down the integration processes in B&H is the populist model of public policy, which implies a change of government institutions through democratic elections, and the removal of all institutional democratic restrictions on their rule after gaining power on the basis of "democratic electoral legitimacy". B&H needs a high degree of political socialization in order to build unity and common goals, and to promote integration processes.*

**Keywords:** *political parties; Bosnia and Herzegovina; democracy; parity; populism; autocracy; national and religious divisions; political socialization*

### **The specter of the state as an alibi for shady business**

Bosnia and Herzegovina is a political society, a society of different, contradictory and conflicting interests, both social and national. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, it can be said that there is a "triangle" of power, a union of political, economic and financial oligarchy, or euphemistically "leading groups", which create the specter<sup>4</sup> of the state, as an alibi for "hunting in the dark"<sup>5</sup>. Organized corruption and crime (kleptocracy) are carried out in various forms of usurpation of power and privatization of public ownership (plunderous privatization) with complete disrespect of the law. Slogans and phrases in Bosnia and Herzegovina have worn out and no longer have a motivational charge. The state needs work, creation, not cheating. However, the devaluation of the economic, social and moral values in general is present. Bosnia and Herzegovina is increasingly a political provisional, a locus of agreement between the two entities, the Brčko district and the three constituent peoples, and the eternal problem of the others, it is a mechanical sum, not organic unity (after all, organic unity cannot be agreed, it can only be produced), possibly an alibi for failures and coverage for debts. In our country, the general interest

<sup>4</sup> Description of a ghost in mythology and folklore: "A ghost is described as a terrifying creature, which walks awkwardly and hides in dark places (in holes or abandoned houses) where it waits to grab, take away and devour its prey. The only way a ghost can be driven away is with strong light and noise". Špiro Kulišić et al, *Srpski mitološki rečnik* (Belgrade: NOLIT, 1970)

<sup>5</sup> Unfortunately, kleptocracy is increasingly present in Bosnia and Herzegovina, manifested as corruption and crime.

is not constituted on the functional-working, nor on the political-territorial principle. Neither the market nor the state functions in Bosnia and Herzegovina. The interest of Bosnia and Herzegovina cannot be the sum of particular interests, egoisms and particularisms. Unity in Bosnia and Herzegovina is not possible on the exclusivity and particularism of the national. Bosnia and Herzegovina can only function with its internal logic<sup>6</sup>, i.e. the interdependence of its entities and peoples. Collective consciousness as a cohesive force of community grows stronger in difficulties and in the face of dangers. But even that awareness must have positive social stimuli. One such stimulus must be a consistent social policy. Not the egalitarianism that people are otherwise prone to in crisis social situations, such as ours, but equal opportunities for all. The unemployed in Bosnia and Herzegovina are the most discriminated category of the population. Question: what can society do for the unemployed, needs to be radicalized with the question: what can employed (non) workers do for the unemployed? In the work itself, as the philosopher would say, is the great craftiness of the mind. The sacrifices we are forced to make cannot have significant and long-term effects, if they are not accompanied by stimulation of work and creativity. The willingness to sacrifice quickly wears off and dwindles if one does not feel, in the act and purpose of sacrifice, not only a prospect for the future, but also a tangible present. There is no authority in Bosnia and Herzegovina that could compensate for possible, even current disunity, which, among other things, necessarily follows from the Dayton confederate organization of Bosnia and Herzegovina. Political parties by their social structure, and that means by their awareness, are not parties of social compromise. Political parties must not be classic political parties that fight for power and votes, they must be parties that fight for people, mobilize them and lead them in battles to change social conditions, for more space for freedom, creativity and human dignity. The party, which is afraid of the temptations of the political government, and persistently proclaims its distance from it, is not up to the tasks that these times put on the “agenda”. It is therefore not capable of resolving them by other (non-political) means as an ideological, moral, educational force of society. The well-known idea of socialist workers in the former Yugoslavia is ... “that workers will continue to pay the bill for what they did not drink and for what they did not break until the Party (now political parties) and the Union stand on their side, without any hesitation and demagogy. As long as their top ranks are not closer to workers’ interests than to the state and their own seats. “

---

<sup>6</sup> For Bosnia and Herzegovina to function, it must be accepted by all citizens, as a common guarantee of democracy, the rule of law and coexistence.

## **Power in Bosnia and Herzegovina - parity and democracy: national and religious divisions, political and cultural divisions**

It is historically known that no government, in any country and at any time has (nor by its very nature can have), the “internal legitimacy” of all. Political legitimacy survives on the constant justification and challenging of power, regardless of the means used by the holders or challengers of power. Every government is undemocratic, but every government is not equally undemocratic. The defense of the values of democracy should be built on that small but significant and sensitive difference. The principle of decision-making by parties does not satisfy some elementary requirements and achievements of democracy of private property (civil democracy), let alone modern types of democracy. There is no public interest in the internal logic of the political system in Bosnia and Herzegovina. There is only agreement and determination of common interests in Dayton Bosnia and Herzegovina. Bosnia and Herzegovina is not meant as a political community, as something general in the world of special interests, but only as an opportunity to agree on particular interests around a measure of common interest. And even in that agreement, a particular interest is systematically preferred (and in practice absolute). That is why there is so much trouble and consumption of energy regarding determination and realization of common interests in Dayton Bosnia and Herzegovina. The parity principle of decision-making in the institutions of Bosnia and Herzegovina (which practically comes down to the right of veto) starts from the assumption of a single, homogeneous and non-contradictory national (entity) interest. National sovereignty in Bosnia and Herzegovina is increasingly taking precedence over people’s sovereignty. This absolutization of the national, parity principle is needed by national political bureaucracies, which thereby strengthen their power and strengthen the foundations of their reproduction. Our “parity democracy” is a form of pluralistic democracy, a democracy that respects the group but does not respect the individual. In such a complex, multinational community as Bosnia and Herzegovina, such a form of pluralistic democracy is unavoidable. However, if it is an exclusive form, if it is favored (and these tendencies are evident), if it pushes the individual as a subject of politics out of the political process, then the danger of usurping the power by individuals and narrower groups as “representatives and defenders” of the group-national interest is quite realistic. Such dangers and tendencies are helped by the circumstances of the insufficiently rooted democratic tradition in Bosnia and Herzegovina as well as by the institutional political system tailored to the measure of “group de-

mocracy”. If the foundation of such democracy is a nation, then it is only one step from the usurpation of power to some of the variants of totalitarianism. Now, the majority principle has been suspended in Bosnia and Herzegovina, so we can talk about “veto federalism” in Bosnia and Herzegovina. The democratic principle of majority decision-making on all issues in institutions of Bosnia and Herzegovina would devalue the principle of equality of entities as federal units, which means equality of peoples, and the tendency to absolutize the parity principle violates not only the democratic principle but also the fundamental principles of federalism. There are, of course, some issues, such as the fundamental issues of the determination of global relations in Bosnia and Herzegovina that must be addressed on a parity basis, in order to avoid any majorization and national discrimination. If this principle is applied too widely, it blocks any possibility of rational functioning of the system, or better said, the system becomes a scene of daily conflicts of particular interests. The output of such temporary condition is that everyone is at a loss. A balance needs to be found between majorization as the decisive power of the majority and a solution for the “tyranny of the minority”. A major obstacle to this balance is national and religious divisions in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Political (national) and cultural (religious) divisions are recognizable features in Bosnia and Herzegovina, which is a serious problem for the creation of civil society for a longer period of time. Our history was military and diplomatic history, not economic and cultural history. Here one must do without friends, but one cannot do without enemies, because the internal or external enemy is used as an integrative principle. National heroes and national identity in Bosnia and Herzegovina are always in the forefront, while democratic compromises are neglected, which is not only a consequence of internal divisions, but also a consequence of the policies of great powers (Ottoman, Venetian, Habsburg) that adhered to the *divide et impera* principle (divide and rule). The basic features of political culture in Bosnia and Herzegovina are provincialism, patriarchal mentality and distrust of the other and the different. The low educational level of the population in Bosnia and Herzegovina is a constant companion, regardless of political changes<sup>7</sup>. In the current state of society in Bosnia and Herzegovina, it is very difficult to provide functionality and implement the Dayton Peace Agreement.

The Dayton Constitution of Bosnia and Herzegovina is a given that our arbitrary verbalism cannot change, but, on the contrary, can make the path to those changes more difficult. The Constitution of Bosnia and Herzegovina is an authoritative, formally firm, codified and written constitution, which en-

---

<sup>7</sup> Duško Vejnović, *Politička kultura, dijalog, tolerancija i demokratija u Bosni i Hercegovini* (Banja Luka: Klub studenata Fakulteta političkih nauka Univerziteta u Banjoj Luci i Evropski defendologija centar, Banja Luka, 2014)

visages a federal state system, a republican form of government and a political regime of consociational democracy.<sup>8</sup> The Constitution is not a vision or utopia, it is a constitutive, realistic-programmatic act. This means, among other things, that its categories must be clear, they must indicate the real situation and be a suitable tool for a better understanding and change of that situation. If it ignores the reality, the Constitution cannot be a suitable framework and projection for something new. Bosnia and Herzegovina is a matter of agreement between two entities, the Brčko District and the three constituent peoples, so it survives only conditionally: as much, if and how the entities and constituent peoples agree. No form of forced unitary unity is acceptable to Serbs in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Only unity of diversity is acceptable, unity in differences. If, however, we insist on specifics and differences, only on the particular, then unity becomes fiction or an alibi for separatisms and nationalisms. What makes Bosnia and Herzegovina a community in general, if not the awareness of community as an expression of its social being, therefore, a cultural, spiritual synthesis. It is not only the institutional normative order (“system”) that seems to make it a community. The current model of federalism in Bosnia and Herzegovina, although it contains essential elements of a confederation, is not (the only) obstacle to integration processes. All the more so, one should ask about other, “non-systemic” causes of the obvious phenomena of disintegration. They are certainly not economic — regardless of the fact that the economic consequences are not only noticeable but also catastrophic — because economic logic requires integration and concentration. These causes are primarily political. The will to power of political oligarchies prepares all moments of social life for its own use. When it needs a little nationalism for that purpose, it will deliver it pronto, when it needs a little higher dose of enemies, it will produce-invent them (or it will “invoke” already existing and known enemies). Increasingly drastic manifestations and eruptions of nationalism in our country have taken place and are taking place either under the direct baton of political oligarchies, or with their tacit consent. This consent is withdrawn only when nationalism escalates so much that it begins to threaten its mentors and instigators. Only the will to power is often short-sighted, the summoned spirit from the bottle knows how to explode uncontrollably and not to return to the bottle - from the servant it becomes the master.

The legitimation of a political will that has no foundation in the nation-citizens is sought to be gained in the nation. These are already legally unlocked

---

<sup>8</sup> Goran Marković, *Ustav Bosne i Hercegovine. u: Zborniku Uvod u politički sistem Bosne i Hercegovine-izabrani aspekti* (p. 57-83) (Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Fondacija Konrad Adenauer, Predstavništvo u Bosni i Hercegovini, 2009)

doors to nationalism, which is always waiting for its opportunity. The social crisis is very good for him. If once politics was defined as the wisdom of managing people and things for the purpose of achieving the highest values (truth, justice, freedom, holiness of life, etc.), then today it is defined as a naked and bloody struggle of social groups and individuals to conquer, preserve and increase the power, authority and benefits that go along with it. The essence of politics in Bosnia and Herzegovina is the struggle for the distribution and control of social power - politics is drama. The philosopher of the will to power said: the time has come to rethink what politics is, because as it is now and here, it is the place where all mental illnesses have scheduled a meeting. With sufficient reason, it can be said that mythical and pagan notions and beliefs are still very powerful in the area of Bosnia and Herzegovina, which, as a rule, come to life in moments of political and social crises. Whenever crisis situations recur, these mythical and pagan patterns are always renewed. In crisis situations, a teacher is not sought but a savior: a charismatic leader always has a chance when it is not possible to resolve the crisis in a rational way, which is the case in Bosnia and Herzegovina as well.<sup>9</sup> Expert and scientific analyzes of the state of politics in Bosnia and Herzegovina agree on the lack of real social projects that would be presented and implemented by politicians. Unfortunately, it can be said that the slogan “Let’s forget about tomorrow” has turned into national and nationalist anthems in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Populism, autocracy and harsh rhetoric in Bosnia and Herzegovina have suppressed democracy, law, justice and legal procedures, and political elites are to a good extent in the function of, not using, but abusing power and introducing nations and peoples into so-called “voluntary slavery”.

### **Populism, autocracy and harsh rhetoric - danger for Bosnia and Herzegovina**

Bosnia and Herzegovina, like others, must position itself on the international market of knowledge, ideas, goods, capital and everything else. One of the existential threats to the further development of global “multilateral competition” in the coming period could be a broad inclination towards a populist model of public policy, which could make any request to create a transparent and accountable government of trust and credibility meaningless, a government that could successfully coordinate a new structure of change which is in sight. In conditions when it is difficult to expect social changes that do not exclude mass violence both in the developed democratic world and in periph-

---

<sup>9</sup> Vejnović, *op.cit.*

eral communities, such a model of public policy could lead to the absence of any responsibility of the populist government.<sup>10</sup>

What is common for “modern” populists, and there are many of them in Bosnia and Herzegovina, is the change of government institutions through democratic elections, and then removal of all institutional democratic restrictions on their rule (free media, political opposition, institutional protection of minorities and individuals) in a “democratic” manner. This strategy legalizes the interruption of the democratization process and opens the way to the establishment of a “democratic authoritarian regime”<sup>11</sup> capable of implementing changes in public policy without legal (democratic) obstacles that prevented liberal democracy from effectively responding to urgent social problems.<sup>12</sup> Through the creation of a “democratic authoritarian regime”, and some of its elements are present in Bosnia and Herzegovina, which is increasingly growing into a personal dictatorship of leaders and eliminating the democratic legitimacy of resistance against personal dictatorship, the way is paved for the dissolution of constitutionalism and democracy in an era of global structural change which poses the greatest threat to the development of democracy in the 21<sup>st</sup> century.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>10</sup> The UK vote on Brexit and the election of Donald Trump in the United States are undoubtedly examples where a relatively well-informed electorate voted against their economic self-interest. When the Nigerian government announced a sharp reduction in fuel subsidies in early 2012, protests erupted across the country. Although subsidy cuts disproportionately harmed rich people, many protesters were poor. Why? Because the levels of corruption and mismanagement in Nigeria have been so high that fuel subsidies are the only way ordinary Nigerians see any benefit from the country’s oil wealth. When the government promised to use part of the savings from cutting fuel subsidies to compensate the poor, protests continued. Since the government has done little in the past to help the poor, why would it do so now?

<sup>11</sup> Democracy is often abused, used in the name of someone and for someone, as in the 1930s, when Hitler himself came to power through democratic elections, elected by the democratic will of the people, later establishing an autocratic form of government within a totalitarian regime. Hence, it turned out that democracy and fascism are often the face and reverse of modernization.

<sup>12</sup> William A. Galston, *The populist Challenge to Liberal Democracy. Journal of Democracy*. Johns Hopkins University Press. Vol. 29, No. 2, (April 2018), p. 8

<sup>13</sup> „Data on authoritarian regimes show that until recently, coups have been the primary threats to democracy. From 1946 to 1999, 64 percent of democracies failed because of such insurgencies. In the last decade, however, populist-fueled authoritarianization has been on the rise, accounting for 40 percent of all democratic failures between 2000 and 2010 and matching coups in frequency. If current trends persist, populist-fueled authoritarianization will soon become the most common pathway to autocracy. Data show that just under half (44 percent) of all instances of authoritarianization from 1946 to 1999 led to the establishment of personalist dictatorships. From 2000 to 2010, however, that proportion increased to 75 percent. In most cases, the populist strongmen rose to power with the support of a political party but then proved effective in sidelining competing voices from within.“ Andrea Kendall-Taylor & Erica Frantz, *How Democracies Fall Apart, Foreign Affairs*, Council on Foreign Relations, (December 5, 2016), p. 1-2

This populist threat to democracy comes precisely from the sphere of legitimacy of the democratic election of the populist authoritarian regime (leader), which on the basis of this “democratic electoral legitimacy” is authorized to make further political and economic changes without any public oversight. The populist regime (leader) derives from this “democratic electoral legitimacy” the legitimate right to abolish any possibility of public criticism which usually qualifies as political resistance of the opposition, or as hostile provocations of the “fifth column”, or as a conspiracy of national or religious minorities or migrant groups, which creates a climate of fear and mistrust in which new perspectives are opened for authoritarian regimes, in whose hands all political power is concentrated. Such concentrated political power enables the control of the legislative, judicial and executive branches, which opens the transformation of authoritarian regimes into a personal dictatorship of a populist leader. Today, this process is a recognizable political phenomenon in Bosnia and Herzegovina, the region and the modern world. Religion in Bosnia and Herzegovina is being abused and used for dirty political purposes.

The history of each religion shows and proves that from the very beginning there were different ways of believing and that all these beliefs satisfied the individual and collective needs and desires of the believers. Only when one form of belief was declared the official system (e.g. Christianity in the ancient Roman Empire), then all other forms of religion were considered a deviation from the true faith (mystics, monks, heretics, schismatics, etc.). In societies where the church is separate from the state, the law on religious communities treats all religious groups as equals. However, the specificity of the Islamic community (mind) is that the religious and legal norms (prescribed by the state) are in fact identical (Sharia law).<sup>14</sup> In Bosnia and Herzegovina, the society, the state and the party are often identified with religion and belief.

It is known that society is not the same as the state. The desires, needs, and interests of society are always broader and deeper than the power of the state to satisfy them through its institutions. Therefore, it should not be surprising that a good part of social life takes place outside the system of state institutions. Non-governmental organizations in Bosnia and Herzegovina should be engaged in protecting society from the state, that is, to constantly prove that political life takes place in mutual relations of people, and not only in the relations of institutions - this free area of life should be protected from state control and coercion.<sup>15</sup> The ubiquitous hate speech in Bosnia and Herzegovina should be opposed.

---

<sup>14</sup> Duško Vejnović, *op.cit.*

<sup>15</sup> *Ibidem*

Words can tell the greatest truths and the meanest lies. Today, words have become weapons - language and speech are a field of struggle for power and authority. Relations between the three political communities in Bosnia and Herzegovina are reflected in language and speech as in a mirror. These are words that have visible consequences: there are unpleasant, poisonous and deadly words that have a terrible effect on the human soul and collective memory. All diseases of these communities, as well as Bosnia and Herzegovina, are first visible in language and speech - if language and speech are sick, then the individual and the community are sick. The ancient Chinese sage warned: when the language is corrupted, the people are also corrupted! Sick language and speech always precede sick societies: the first dungeons, the first crimes, and the first tombs are prepared in language and speech. The first mines are language mines. Even today, we in Bosnia and Herzegovina are not aware of all the diseases that short-sighted politics has introduced into language and speech.<sup>16</sup>

### **System and crisis in Bosnia and Herzegovina - the problem of spiritual indolence**

The current model of Bosnia and Herzegovina contains essential elements of a confederation, but it must not be an obstacle to integration processes. The causes of integration and disintegration of Bosnia and Herzegovina are primarily political. The will to power of political oligarchies prepares all moments of complex social life for its own use. Increasingly drastic manifestations and eruptions of nationalisms and national exclusivities in Bosnia and Herzegovina have taken place and are taking place, either under the direct baton of the political oligarchies or with their tacit consent. The legitimation of a political will that has no foundation in the people is sought to be gained in the nation. Nationalism is very much affected by the social crisis in the functioning of Bosnia and Herzegovina, where the decisive subject is not the citizen, but the nation. The civic is de facto subordinated to the national, to the state, the entity. All our divisions and national bunkers in Bosnia and Herzegovina from which we negotiate and agree have at their core, not trust and awareness of the community, but fear and mistrust, and in their background is the notion of national and political as private-property. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, it is difficult to take off the baggage of the past. Our spiritual space is still overcrowded with our traumas, hypersensitivity, revanchisms. Instead of the truth of the future, we are still making “balances of hatred”, so we are

---

<sup>16</sup> *Ibidem*

picking up partial “truths” of the past. This, of course, does not mean that black balance sheets should be forgotten, but they cannot and must not be a guide and a criterion for the future. For many years and decades in Bosnia and Herzegovina, the process of “disabling consciousness” lasted in ethnic, geopolitical and cultural areas, producing ignorance, primitivism and conflict at the expense of others, so that we would be ready (“trained”) for critical self-reflection. The problem of Bosnia and Herzegovina is the law of spiritual inertia as the only law<sup>17</sup> in the milieu of our political culture. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, one should be an opponent of all hegemony and unitarism, but also anyone’s separatism and nationalism is the greatest danger and “historical plague” for Bosnia and Herzegovina. The formula of unity in Bosnia and Herzegovina is a precondition for the independence, autonomy and modern survival of Bosnia and Herzegovina. The various paraphrases of that formula: nationalist, separatist, liberal, unitarian (and they are all “in circulation”), are working not only against Bosnia and Herzegovina as a whole but also against the people in whose name they would speak. The people do not live comfortably, they only want “bread and games”, the people have a longer memory than individuals: they think from the collected historical experience, from the troubles, ups and downs of entire generations, so they do not care for things to be different, but to be better. For some today, Bosnia and Herzegovina means almost nothing, which is not good because it is an internationally recognized state and a place and agreement should be sought in it for all nations and national minorities, with maximum respect for human rights and freedoms regardless of race, religion and nation. Centralist-unitarian Bosnia and Herzegovina is not possible and it is destroying the foundations of this Dayton Bosnia and Herzegovina.

States based on national culture (as is the case in Bosnia and Herzegovina) can hardly fit into a new world order in which universal values, norms and rules of conduct apply. For these parts of the world, the area of Bosnia and Herzegovina, it can be freely said that people are divided by what they have in common: common origin, common customs, common institutions, common language, etc. Here we have a rich experience with the illogical fact that three peoples (Serbs, Croats, Bosniaks - Muslims) share the same language, because over 90% of words are the same, and several percents of the language are different. Intolerance and hatred do not cause big differences, but small ones, so psychologists are right when they talk about “narcissism of small

---

<sup>17</sup> B&H is inhibited for social change towards the social progress of all, due to the partial interests of governance. By deepening the crisis in B&H, citizens have lost motivation for public action, participation in public affairs, and this activity has been left to a minority of pathocrats, who manage most normal people.

nations” - every tribe wants to be a nation. Despite all the social differences among individuals of the same nation, the nation is perceived as a fraternal community: in the national consciousness all inequalities are erased in the name of the unity of the nation! This is achieved by skillful manipulation of political symbols (flag, coat of arms, anthem, mythical heroes, etc.) because myth offers personal identity and collective identification with the community (national, religious, etc.): it answers the question of who I am and where my place is in the structure of society. A community based on a national myth opposes change: identity and change do not go together. These closed patterns of the archaic spirit are certainly an obstacle to broader integrative processes and tolerance between the three peoples and their cultures in Bosnia and Herzegovina: instead of democratic negotiations and co-habitation, each nation emphasizes its libertarian traditions and national heroes. - Fear of the living is regulated by the law, fear of the dead is regulated by the myth - the dead as the moral policemen of society. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, democracy is taught because the people have no experience with democratic forms of opinion, belief and decision-making: here the transition from the rule of one will (the will of the leader) to the rule of law is at work. In other words, the rule of fear is gradually being replaced by the rule of law. And that is a very difficult and long process, because the clan-tribal consciousness and way of life in this area can hardly rise to the level of universal values, norms and rules of conduct. If Christianity and Islam as universal religions have failed to eradicate this pagan way of thinking and acting for so many centuries, then even today we cannot hope to have more success in the near future.

We in Bosnia and Herzegovina have a very important and difficult task ahead of us. We have to learn dialogue and tolerance, because all our troubles stem from the fact that we do not know how to communicate with each other. Only by proper upbringing and educating for dialogue and tolerance can the awareness be gained that the other man and our culture are our complement and not our hell. He who is not patient cannot be a modern man: he has not yet reached the height of a man! In order to achieve that, he must listen to different voices of time and different ways of speaking, because only then he will have the ability to compare, choose and create. A truly dialogical way of thinking and living would result in no dogmatists among thinkers, no fanatics among believers, and no tyrants among politicians.<sup>18</sup>

---

<sup>18</sup> Duško Vejnović, *op. cit.*

## **Where are we and how to proceed? The problem of (ir) responsibility**

“I’m an optimist, because you can’t go on like this.” The theory is called upon, even forced to prove and defend its practicality, to help eliminate or at least mitigate the consequences of the misfortune from the mentioned metaphor. But from the standpoint of our professions, disciplines, our prohibitions and plots of science and politics can we say like Rousseau did: I believe I can solve this question. All changes in Bosnia and Herzegovina are accompanied by the growth of the bureaucratic, parasitic apparatus, which multiplied by the logic of self-reproduction, looking for new spaces and possibilities for its expansion and finding them in new systemic changes. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, it is necessary to establish the external authority of the system. This primarily means establishing a respectable system of accountability. Responsibility is a derived category. To be responsible means to perform one’s job, one’s function conscientiously and professionally. To be irresponsible means to act differently, it means to be able to act differently. And “being able to act differently” is an indication of a system that “does not work” for the proclaimed social relationship and its fundamental values, but on the contrary endangers them. Society is an alibi for all kinds of usurpations, both usurpations of government and property. The consumer syndrome has taken over our social organism so much that we can justifiably claim that our society is a paradigm of consumer behavior. Things must not be taken from workers to be given to non-workers. There are too many universities, academies of sciences and arts and too many students in the small area of Bosnia and Herzegovina, there are too many scientific institutes, and unfortunately there are few practical results from all of the above. In a little while, every one of our scientists, researchers, experts (or, as Lj. Ršumović would say: “Secretary for the South Wind”) will be able to hang a foreign license around his neck in addition to his diploma and title. What a millstone around the neck of society in Bosnia and Herzegovina that is. It is expensive and often uncertain to invest in one’s own intellect, but buying someone else’s intellect is many times more expensive. It must not be our basic motto to incorporate foreign intellect into Bosnia and Herzegovina as a primary one for development and prosperity. We must cooperate with those who know, can and have, and not close ourselves to our borders and our slogans. The energy of science and knowledge can alleviate and even compensate for the lack of any other form of energy. The fragmentation of scientific research institutions and programs not only weakens the possibility of significant research, but eludes any evaluation. And

here, unfortunately, science follows politics: each section is a sovereign entity, everyone is a criterion and a reference point for itself. It is necessary to develop the third mission of the university. The third mission of the university consists of two dimensions - social, civil and economic, which should be equal. Therefore, in addition to education and research, universities should be more engaged in the community.<sup>19</sup> Universities in Bosnia and Herzegovina should serve its needs, because the story of the university is inseparable from its responsibility to society and the economy, while on the other hand, what is new is the depth and scope of interaction between communities and universities. The third mission of the university implies both a social and economic dimension, so that they should be equally important. It is based on private-public partnerships, cooperation between universities, the economy and the state.<sup>20</sup> Dominant technologies become technologies of economic, political, cultural and any other domination.

### **Political corruption suppresses political socialization**

Republic of Srpska and Bosnia and Herzegovina are entering a new phase of (non) politics in which they need to get out of ideological trenches. Dramatic conflicts and divisions in political parties, schisms, negotiations and trade are being done under wraps so everything is blurry, gray and hidden. Political corruption of the coalition and betrayal of principles in the parties are a reality, therefore, coalitions of everything and everyone. Political campaigns are turned into orgies of emotions in order to divert attention from real issues, and in order to paralyze even those few intellectual, cerebral, mental abilities. A moral washing machine is needed for politicians. Experiences from all fights against corruption confirm that it is not easy to declare war on immorality in politics and political immorality and get out of it alive. From legitimate and reasonable demands for pure politics, a small step leads to the other side, in purity in politics. In politics in Bosnia and Herzegovina, the majority are losers, with due respect for certain individuals and groups, because living with principles, honestly and smart is the fastest way to poverty. It is anti-civilization with all human values violated. The struggle against blindness and ignorance, which is spreading and threatening to annul all values, takes

<sup>19</sup> Duško Vejnović & Vladimir Stojanović, Visoko obrazovanje u Bosni i Hercegovini na raskršću treće misije razvoja Univerziteta, In: Zborniku radova *Bosna i Hercegovina u izazovima različitosti* (Visoka škola Union u Mostaru, Udruženje Sport za sve, Banja Luka i Evropski defendologija centar Banja Luka, 2019)

<sup>20</sup> *Ibidem*

us back to the beginning, to the question of the relationship between good and evil, towards morality. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, a moral renaissance is necessary in all structures and at all levels. The example of humanity in contrast to so many inhumanities unfortunately does not pass for now. A small lamp should turn the great darkness into nothingness, so that “evil comes and goes, and good returns to good.” Political (in) security, political corruption, changing jerseys from party to party, use and abuse of power are a great danger for the people and citizens of Bosnia and Herzegovina. Glory always belongs to the martyrs, never to the executioners. All around us and among us, there are those who want to see us torn and divided. Everyone should be called to spiritual vigilance and wisdom. All those who divide peoples from the struggle for power, regardless of race, religion and nation, because of their pride and vanity, should know that when justice arrives, God’s justice will come to them. Politics is a sharp game when it is played in the first league, and a good team is not born but must be made, envy is a matter of moral disorder, and jealousy is a matter of external disorder. We can build unity in the Republic of Srpska, Bosnia and Herzegovina and the region only on the unity of goals. In order to achieve that, moral revival and maximum political socialization are necessary.

Political socialization is the process of shaping and transmitting political culture (symbols, values, norms, rules, experiences, knowledge, skills - political memory) to new generations. This must begin at an early age, if society and even Bosnia and Herzegovina want to be open, democratic and stable later. Political socialization is in the function of maintaining, strengthening and stability of the political system - reaching consensus on key issues (obedience to legally elected authorities). In Bosnia and Herzegovina, a number of generations have grown up and matured in an authoritarian political culture, so it is difficult to expect them to reorient themselves to a democratic way of thinking, believing and behaving, because it is a completely different scale of values and norms. Primary (family) and secondary (school, peer group, political parties, mass media, etc.) factors of political socialization will have to work actively to make this transition from a tribal to a democratic type of society in Bosnia and Herzegovina - from particular to universal norms. From what and how they work (for example, the mass media), it could not be concluded that they are on the way to accomplish these tasks. The ruling three cliques in Bosnia and Herzegovina (the so-called elites) are creating the public opinion they need: to have a privileged position (monopoly) in the media means the same as having a public on your side! Public opinion is no longer listened to, it is created: the media image of reality replaces reality itself! He who has power and authority, who has access to information and

who knows the techniques of persuasion, can convince anyone, to think, believe and do anything.<sup>21</sup>

## Literature

- Galston, William A. The populist Challenge to Liberal Democracy. *Journal of Democracy*. Johns Hopkins University Press. Vol. 29, No. 2, April, 2018
- Kendall-Taylor, Andrea & Frantz, Erica. How Democracies Fall Apart. *Foreign Affairs*. Council on Foreign Relations, December 5, 2016
- Kulišić, Špiro et al. *Srpski mitološki rečnik*. Belgrade: NOLIT, 1970
- Marković, Goran. Ustav Bosne i Hercegovine. In: Zborniku *Uvod u politički sistem Bosne i Hercegovine-izabrani aspekti* (p. 57-83). Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Fondacija Konrad Adenauer, Predstavništvo u Bosni i Hercegovini. 2009
- Vejnović, Duško & Stojanović, Vladimir. Visoko obrazovanje u Bosni i Hercegovini na raskršću treće misije razvoja Univerziteta. In: Zborniku *rado-va Bosna i Hercegovina u izazovima različitosti*.
- Vejnović, Duško. *Politička kultura, dijalog, tolerancija i demokratija u Bosni i Hercegovini*. Banja Luka: Klub studenata Fakulteta političkih nauka Univerziteta u Banjoj Luci i Evropski defendologija centar. Banja Luka, 2014
- Visoka škola Union u Mostaru. Udruženje Sport za sve, Banja Luka i Evropski defendologija centar Banja Luka, 2019

---

<sup>21</sup> Vejnović, *op. cit.*

**Amila Zdralovic<sup>1</sup>**  
University of Sarajevo  
Faculty of Law

**Original scientific paper**  
UDC 159.922-055.1/.2:[305-055.2:141.72  
DOI 10.7251/SOCEN2120045Z  
COBISS.RS-ID 133792001  
Accepted: 19/03/2021

## **Ethic of Care and Its Reflections on the Feminist Theories of Law and Justice**

### **Abstract**

*Although feminism brings together varied and often conflicting feminist ideas, the concept of feminist legal theory (feminist jurisprudence) is often defined unequivocally. A common foothold for many feminist theories can be found, directly or indirectly, in the concept of ethics of care. This paper focuses on the fundamental features of this concept relevant for further sociological and legal discussion of justice and fairness. Feminist debates, marked by a distinctive divergence of opinions in feminist theories (of rights and justice), are observed through the prism of critical reflections on the theoretical concept of ethics of care, without losing sight of the feminist experiences in the region. The ultimate intention of this discussion is to consider the potential for integration of ethics of care with the ethics of rights and justice through the gender mainstreaming strategy.*

**Keywords:** *feminism; feminist theories of rights; ethics of care; ethics of justice*

### **Introduction: Theoretical and Conceptual Framework**

This paper discusses the influence of ethics of care on feminist legal theories. In her writings that define the boundaries of this concept, Carol Gilligan, although a psychologist, has substantially steered and shaped the discussion on the theories of rights and justice. Direct lines of influence can be identified in relation to cultural feminism, also known as difference feminism. An offshoot of radical feminism, this approach evolved in the 1980's and its focus was mainly on examination of legal systems. Cultural feminists like Leslie

---

<sup>1</sup> E-mail: a.zdralovic@pfsa.unsa.ba

Bender<sup>2</sup> believe that current justice systems base their frameworks and foundations on the men's ethics of rights and justice, and that they completely disregard different voices from the ethics of care that could result in significantly different legal norms. In this context, the authors analyse the ways in which ethics of care could reshape different branches of the law.<sup>3</sup>

Cultural feminist, similarly to Gilligan, take an "agnostic" stance towards the matter of biological roots of gender differences and focus their efforts on demonstrating that traditionally feminine qualities, such as care and empathy, are useful traits that have been unjustly devalued by the society<sup>4</sup>. However, unlike Gilligan, cultural feminists favour the "ethos of care" over the "ethos of rights" and believe that "basing legal rules on communitarian values and an ethos of care would result in the making of dramatically different choices".<sup>5</sup> Their essential claim is that "virtually all our existing legal system is the product of the male ethos of rights"<sup>6</sup>.

Still, we should note that the problem with these discussions is essentially epistemological and boils down to the issue of knowledge production in science, which pervades even legal science. Over the recent decades, feminist theories became profiled as the hub of discussions in the field of social science and humanities, however the practice of ignoring them persists in institutional circles. Feminist discussions find their space yet remain isolated and ghettoized. In the region, they take place in, for example, conferences labelled as feminist (and most often organised outside the institutional academic framework) or in separate panels on general topics, but are not treated as a scientific paradigm that is integrated into discussion on specific issues in a broader context or as a dimension that should be taken into account.

The discussion in this paper was primarily motivated by the predominantly ignorant treatment of the sociology of law as an interdisciplinary field towards feminist debates about/in law. If we consider the purpose of the feminist legal theory, this paper treats it primarily as a sociological legal theory. Namely, following in the footsteps of Robin West, we can conclude that its purpose is descriptive, critical and normative. Descriptive because it describes the social reality of law; critical due to analyses that explain in an attempt to describe how law, despite accepted principles, still fails to deliver

---

<sup>2</sup> Leslie Bender, 'From Gender Difference to Feminist Solidarity: Using Carol Gilligan and an Ethic of Care in Law', In: *Vermont Law Review* 15/1, 1990

<sup>3</sup> William Turnier et al., 'Redistributive Justice and Cultural Feminism' U: *The American University Law Review*, Vol. 45/5, 1996. (1275-1322.), <http://www.aulawreview.org/>, [17/07/2013]

<sup>4</sup> Margery Lucas, 'Difference Feminism Now', In: *Society*, Vol. 52 Issue 5, 2015. p. 499

<sup>5</sup> William Turnier et al., *op. cit.*

<sup>6</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 1285

on gender equality; normative on account of changing and transforming the law.<sup>7</sup>

The first part of the paper maps the various feminist approaches used to construct feminist legal theories and points out their mutual correlations. The second part focuses on emotional and cognitive psychology approaches to justice, to identify the features of Carol Gilligan's model of ethics of care. Conclusions based on this model are in literature often taken as the common feature of feminist legal theories. The objective of discussion in the third part is to point out the divergence of opinions between feminist legal theories. Disagreements will be observed through a prism of critical reflection against the theoretical concept of ethics of care, while not losing sight of the feminist experiences in the region. And finally, the fourth part examines the potential models of ethics of care and the viability of transposing it from the domain of private life and civil society to the domain of politics and public life.

### **Feminist legal theories**

The main feature of feminism are disagreements that result in different theoretical approaches. Ann Snitow, American writer, professor and activist, in her last book *Visitors: An American Feminist in East Central Europe*, says that feminism is not an ideology because it “doesn't offer a consistent world-view” and “has never been a fixed configuration of beliefs”.<sup>8</sup> Essentially, it is not possible to derive a syncretic view of feminism and therefore feminist legal theories, but we can discuss the disagreements that define them and, in this way, track the genesis of certain ideas.

The key disagreements from the 1980' were summarised in the debate between liberal and radical feminists. However, according to Robin West, although their “oppositional nature” should not be underestimated, “in some contexts their approaches are complementary”.<sup>9</sup> So, for example, even with opposing views on issues such as “the regulation of pornography and the legalization or criminalization of sex work”, on some other issues (such as direct and/or indirect workplace discrimination, women in politics, right to abortion, etc.) there was less disagreement.<sup>10</sup> Although this does not serve

---

<sup>7</sup> Robin West, 'Introduction to *Research Handbook on Feminist Jurisprudence*', U: Robin West & Cynthia Grant Bowman (ur.) *Research Handbook on Feminist Jurisprudence*, Cheltenham, UK/Northampton, MA, USA: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, 2019, p. 1-4

<sup>8</sup> Ann Snitow, *Visitors: An American Feminist in East Central Europe* (New York: New Village Press, 2020), p. 123, 180, 181

<sup>9</sup> Robin West, *op.cit.*, p. 16

<sup>10</sup> *Ibidem*

to overcome the theoretical differences, solidarity within the movement becomes possible only on selected issues where agreement exists.

Loud arguments between radical and feminist liberalism were quieted but also deepened by new theoretical approaches that converged, *inter alia*, on their critique of liberalism<sup>11</sup>. Based on the work of Robin West<sup>12</sup> as an alternative feminist legal theory, we can identify the relational feminist legal theory, the vulnerability theory, intersectional feminism, socialist feminism and postmodern and queer feminist legal theories. Old disputes were only seemingly settled with the ‘new’ feminist legal theories, considering that these were shaped by the old debates. Their relationship to Carol Gilligan’s theory can be described in a similar vein because they both critically surpass it and remain rooted in some of its fundamental approaches.

So, for example, law professor and originator of critical race theory Kimberlé Crenshaw introduces the concept of intersectionality to highlight the intersection of various social identities. Insights into the difference between experiences of social inequality of women and men are still present, but are now viewed also in terms of how “various forms of inequality often operate together and exacerbate each other”.<sup>13</sup> As Crenshaw explains:

“We tend to talk about race inequality as separate from inequality based on gender, class, sexuality or immigrant status. What’s often missing is how some people are subject to all of these, and the experience is not just the sum of its parts.”<sup>14</sup>

Intersectional approaches, same as other modern feminist legal theories, start from the critique of existing approaches (primarily those specific to cultural feminism, which rests firmly on the model of ethics of care) that are based on the thesis of women’s generally subordinated position and their common, universal experience of otherness. At the core of these criticisms is the view that generalization of the experience of otherness fails to take into account the particularly bad position of marginalised groups, whether as various and intersecting forms of exclusion or through recognition of specific positions of the most vulnerable groups. However, such approaches ultimately expect feminism to remain sensitive to even the most minute differences and causes of variations in circumstances of specific groups.

<sup>11</sup> Despite the criticisms, many female authors emphasise the values of feminist liberalism (see, for example, Sylvia A. Law ‘In defense of liberal feminism’, In: Robin West & Cynthia Grant Bowman (eds.) *Research Handbook on Feminist Jurisprudence*, Cheltenham, UK/Northampton, MA, USA: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, 2019).

<sup>12</sup> *Ibidem*

<sup>13</sup> Katy Steinmetz, ‘Q+A: Kimberlé Crenshaw’ *TIME Magazine* 195 (7/8), 2020, p. 82 <http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=asn&AN=141838309&site=ehost-live>.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibidem*

Cultural feminism based on the ethics of care treats the female experience of otherness as sufficient grounds for analysis of social inequality and opens the door for further analysis of intersections between gender identity and other grounds for exclusion. On the other hand, authors like Kimberle Crenshaw see that individuals often experience “subordination at the intersection of their identities, rather than on the basis of one identity or another”.<sup>15</sup> In a similar vein, Haleigh Prevost and Jennifer M. Kilty point out that “intersections of sexism, racism, and colonialism operate through the segregation framework to produce and consolidate gendered and raced inequities”.<sup>16</sup>

Still, by pointing out the shortcomings of cultural feminism and Carol Gilligan’s theory, all these approaches ‘splinter’ the unified, homogenised ‘female identity’ to a multitude of particular female identities. The subjects of their theoretical approaches are still coherent group identities. So in terms of ‘new’ approaches, we can identify postmodern, post-structuralist feminist and queer theories. However, these approaches are ‘subversive’ to the extent that “they question traditional, hegemonic understandings of sex and gender, for example”.<sup>17</sup> But only through such questioning can the feminist debate rise out of patriarchal dichotomies and free itself from the assumption that “gender always and exclusively means the matrix of the ‘masculine’ and the ‘feminine’”<sup>18</sup>.

Still, we can identify at least two problematic consequences of this approach. First, gender is a category that allows us to describe and explain the social reality. Second, although many female theorists recognise the importance of identity deconstruction, at the same time it concerns them because it also undermines the foundations of feminist theory.<sup>19</sup>

<sup>15</sup> Lezlie L. Green, ‘Erasing Race’, *SMU Law Review Forum*, 73 (2020), p. 70

<sup>16</sup> Haleigh Prevost & Jennifer M. Kilty, ‘You Start to Feel like You’re Losing Your Mind: An Intersectionality-Based Policy Analysis of Federal Correctional Segregation Policy and Practice’, *U: Canadian Journal of Women and the Law*, vol. 32, no. 1, 2020, p. 192

<sup>17</sup> Martha Albertson Fineman, ‘Introduction: Feminist and Queer Legal Theory’, U: Martha Albertson Fineman, Jack E. Jackson i Adam P. Romero (ur.) *Feminist and Queer Legal Theory: Intimate Encounters, Uncomfortable Conversations*. London/New York: Routledge, 2009, 2016, p. 1

<sup>18</sup> Judith Butler, *Raščinjavanje roda* (Sarajevo: TDK Šahinpašić, 2005), p. 39

<sup>19</sup> An illustrative example of such debates about the subjectivity of feminist theory can be found in the book: Seyla Benhabib et al, *Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange* (New York: Routledge, 1995).

## (Emotional and) Cognitive Psychology Interpretations of Justice

The concept of justice as the foundation of law can be observed from different and mutually complementary perspectives, one of which is the view that focuses on individual moral judgement. One of the first versions of cognitive psychology interpretations of justice, aimed at establishing the rules of individual moral judgement, was Protagoras' myth on virtue (Plato, 1968, p. 18 - 24).<sup>20</sup> In this dialogue, Parmenid says that justice and other political virtues are given equally to all men, but individuals must develop them through practice and learning before they can be manifested<sup>21</sup>.

From antiquity to this day, various cognitive theories of individual moral judgement and moral development of individuals have been developed. A decisive turning point in thinking on this issue came with Piaget's theory of social learning, subsequently further developed by Lawrence Kohlberg. Kohlberg offered a model with three levels of moral development (with each level consisting of two stages): pre-conventional, conventional, and post-conventional.<sup>22</sup> At the first level, moral (i.e. *pre-moral*) judgement is conditional upon the consequences of disobeying external rules; on the second level, social norms and expectations are adopted as one's own; only at the third level the individual constructs his/her own individual value system.<sup>23</sup> However, one of the conclusions of Kohlberg's theory is that women often do not reach higher levels of moral development and are unable to be impartial and objective. Authors such as Sigmund Freud, Erik Erikson, Jean Piaget and Lawrence Kohlberg believed that women are "constructing the problem differently" and that "they're starting from a different set of premises".<sup>24</sup> Such critical observations were the starting point for Carol Gilligan's writings.

This psychologist published her first text in 1977 under the title *In a Different Voice: Women's Conception of the Self and of Morality*, which subsequently (in 1982) led to the book *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development*. With these the author constructs a critical view of earlier theories, whose primary focus was on masculine subjects. The problem is essentially methodological and related to sampling, but it ultimately produces

<sup>20</sup> Platon, *Gorgija/Protagora* (Beograd: Kultura, 1968), p. 18-24

<sup>21</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 20-24

<sup>22</sup> Lawrence Kohlberg, 'Moral stages and Moralization: The Cognitive developmental Approach', U: Lawrence Kohlberg, *The Psihology of Moral Development; The Nature and Validuty of Moral Stages*, San Francisco: Harper and Row, San Francisco, p. 172, 175-177, 1984

<sup>23</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 173

<sup>24</sup> Carol Gilligan, 'Revisiting 'In a Different Voice', *LEARNing Landscapes*, 11 (2), 2018, p. 27

significant theoretical consequences. Still, a critical approach does not imply rejection of earlier theories, rather their supplementation.

Gilligan points to the shortcomings, the main one being Kohlberg's response scoring scale. She repeated his research and tested the judgement of girls and boys using the case of the Heinz dilemma<sup>25</sup>. The boy Jake solves the dilemma by giving priority to the value of life and uses this logic to justify his choice:

For one thing, a human life is worth more than money, and if the druggist only makes \$1,000, he is still going to live, but if Heinz doesn't steal the drug, his wife is going to die. (Why is life worth more than money?) Because the druggist can get a thousand dollars later from rich people with cancer, but Heinz can't get his wife again. (Why not?) Because people are all different and so you couldn't get Heinz's wife again.<sup>26</sup>

The boy Jake does not see breaking the law as wrong and justifies his opinion with the thesis that laws were made by men, so they are changeable and can also be wrong.<sup>27</sup> His argument is based on assumed fundamental moral values and the belief that laws, under certain circumstances, do not necessarily correspond to those values. Through ethical and logical consideration of the problem, Jake arrives at a rational, correct solution, independent of the power of any authority.<sup>28</sup> However, in response to the same dilemma, a girl by the name of Amy uses different arguments, does not take a firm moral stand and considers the consequences of the different choices available to Heinz. Unlike Jake, she is not sure if Heinz should steal the drug and asks herself if there is any way Heinz can find the money.<sup>29</sup> When asked why Heinz should not steal the drug, as Gilligan explains, Amy does not refer to the law but to potential consequences of that action on Heinz's ability to care for his wife in the future:

If he stole the drug, he might save his wife then, but if he did, he might have to go to jail, and then his wife might get sicker again, and he couldn't get more of the drug, and it might not be good. So, they should really just talk it out and find some other way to make the money.<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> This dilemma was developed by Kohlberg to measure moral development and consists of the following: should a man called Heinz steal a drug that he cannot afford to buy if he needs it to save his wife's life? (See more in: Carol Gilligan, *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development*. Cambridge/Massachusetts/London: Harvard University Press, 2003, p. 25-26).

<sup>26</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 26

<sup>27</sup> *Ibidem*

<sup>28</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 27

<sup>29</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 28

<sup>30</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 28

But, as Gilligan notes, Kohlberg's scale assumed only logical and rational responses, i.e. mathematical weighing of solutions to a moral dilemma. On the other hand, the girl's responses go deeper and multiply the moral dilemma by contemplating the long-term consequences of each choice.<sup>31</sup> Looking at specific features of girls' responses, Gilligan offers a somewhat different theory of moral development and concludes that moral development in women proceeds through three stages: selfishness, marked by concern only for herself; caring, characterised by concern for others close to her; and universal caring, characterised by the ability to care for the welfare of mankind as a whole.<sup>32</sup> While developing the theories of care, Gilligan offered a different emotional and cognitive approach.

The book *In a Different Voice* incited many feminist theorists to criticize ethics of justice and develop ethics of care instead. The debate on ethics of justice vs. ethics of care initially concentrated on the question whether men and women truly deliberate moral issues differently, as well as the advantages of ethics of care over the ethics of justice. Feminist proponents of ethics of care emphasise its superiority over ethics of justice on account of the fact that ethics of care focuses, first and foremost, on the development of moral disposition and virtue and not on learning moral principles and rules. It is more adequate because it seeks contextual answers to moral problems rather than abstract, universally applicable rules.<sup>33</sup>

In some of the later feminist legal theories, especially those that espouse cultural feminism, ethics of care was given primacy over the masculine ethics of rights and justice. In Carol Gilligan's theory, it is just a different voice. If we look at it this way, her theory essentially does not contradict earlier theories, particularly Kohlberg's, but is a theory that considers a different, 'female' voice in addition to the 'male' voice. The difference between these two voices is that the 'male' voice favours rights and justice while the 'female' voice accentuates care and interpersonal relationships. However, with respect to further interpretation of Carol Gilligan's theory and understanding of her impact on sociological and legal determinations of justice and rights, we must go back to two previously noted contradictions often encountered in feminist (legal) theory. The first has to do with the context in which we place the dichotomy of the 'male' vs. 'female' approach, and the other with the theoretical

---

<sup>31</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 28

<sup>32</sup> More on focuses and transitional stages: Sara Ann Reiter, 'Kohlberg – Gilligan Controversy: Lessons for Accounting Ethics education', In: *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, No. 7, 1996, p. 33-54

<sup>33</sup> Jasminka Babić-Avdispahić & Asim Mujkić, *Etika* (Zenica: Udruženje za filozofiju i društveno-humanistička istraživanja, Eidos, 2019), p. 141-142

disposition of the ethics of justice and the ethics of care. Only then can we proceed to review the possibility of integration of these two approaches.

### **On the Contradictions in Feminism**

The identity-based approach matrix – ethics of care and ethics of justice – both reflects and supports the patriarchal dichotomy of ‘male’ vs. ‘female’. Unlike the first wave of feminists who were predominantly inspired by liberal ideas of universality of human rights and equality of human beings, the second wave focused on the differences between men and women with a tendency to universalize the female experience as a constant experience of otherness. Such assumptions, characteristic of the early days of the second wave, are still present today in various debates and not just those on moral development but also, for example, debates on leadership styles and management skills, feminist epistemology, female peace activism and eco-feminism. The assumption in each of these approaches is that of the universality and specificity of the ‘female’. It is assumed to be universal and in common to all ‘women’ and specific as a locus of difference from the ‘male’.

This homogenisation of collective female identity is becoming particularly problematic in its essentialist versions. Each of those versions includes claims about the essence, the core of the ‘female’ identity and assigns to it certain common, primordial traits (such as the more peace-loving gender, caring, emotional, etc.). These strategies are similar to patriarchal strategies that are based on a series of binary oppositions. Although fundamentally the same in their approach, their outcomes are different. The patriarchal approach uses dichotomies (such as rational – emotional) to keep women in the private sphere, while the feminist one wants to engage them in the sphere of politics and public life. However, unlike the first wave of feminism, the second wave directed its efforts not on equal participation in firmly entrenched masculine structures but on questioning them and transforming them through a ‘different’ voice.

Clearing the female identity of all differences is not necessarily embodied in the biological, so in an effort to avoid essentialism the basis for homogenisation is sought mainly in the various forms of social behaviour, most of all in gender socialisation and specific experiences of subordination. The contradiction inherent in these approaches is that patriarchally defined women’s roles produce experiences which develop the ‘feminine’ virtues of emotion, compassion and care. At the same time, their potential depends on the possibility to transfer these virtues into the domain public and political life. Theo-

retical concepts inspired by the work of Carol Gilligan find their confirmation in empirical studies attempting to ‘measure’ the difference between the ‘male’ and ‘female’ approach in different areas. Such studies were also conducted in our region, mostly in the field of economics. For example, Jasna Kovačević and Jelena Milinović present the results of empirical research on ‘male’ and ‘female’ leadership.<sup>34</sup>

In effect, the historical perspective allows us to track fundamental similarities and specific differences in the articulation of second-wave feminist ideas in the region and in the Western, democratic societies.<sup>35</sup>

Both Western feminists and Yugoslav feminists demanded fundamental structural changes, basing their demands on theoretically similar insights into women’s generally subordinated position. Still, their respective circumstances largely resulted in a different intensity of events. While feminists in the West, mainly in the US and primarily in radical feminist circles, marched to legalize abortion and advocated laws to ban pornography, Yugoslav ac-

<sup>34</sup> Jasna Kovačević, “Rodne razlike u etičkom donošenju odluka”, In: Amila Ždralović (ed.), *Rod i ekonomija*, Sarajevo: SOC, 2019; Jelena Milinović, *Liderke izbliza. Prilog proučavanju liderstva žena u Bosni i Hercegovini* (Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar, 2017)

<sup>35</sup> The narrative about women’s single identity, women’s affairs and antagonisms between genders has shaped the feminists’ efforts and activities in the region during the 1970s. The end and the culmination of the first phase of the Yugoslav feminist movement (this paper uses periodization provided by Đurđa Knežević in her article “Kraj ili novi početak? – Feminizam od šezdesetih do danas u Jugoslaviji/Hrvatskoj”, In: Andrea Feldman (ed.), *Žene u Hrvatskoj, Ženska i kulturna povijest*, p. 248-249, Zagreb: Ženska infoteka, 2004) was marked by the conference “Drug-ca Žena, Žensko pitanje – novi pristup?” (*Comrade Woman. Woman’s Issues – New Approach*), which took place at the Student Cultural Centre in Belgrade in 1978. Discussions at this conference can also be seen as an inauguration of the second phase of the feminist movement, considering that they brought up a unified category of the female and a unified approach by highlighting the ‘differences’ between ‘Western’ and Yugoslav feminism. The differences arose from different ways of life in substantially different social and political circumstances. As Žarana Papić writes in 1992, women in Yugoslavia lived in a “different civilization” from women in the West (Žarana Papić, “Mogućnost socijalističkog feminizma u Istočnoj Evropi”, In: Adriana Zaharijević, Zorica Ivanović and Daša Duhaček (eds.), *Žarana Papić, Tekstovi 1977-2002*, Beograd: Centar za studije roda i politike, Fakultet političkih nauka i Žene u crnom, p. 197). In Western democratic societies, the issue of women’s right to their own bodies and legalization of abortion is accentuated, while women are strengthened through work in small groups that emphasise the importance of sisterhood and solidarity (Milena Karapetrović, “Istorija borbe za prava žena i rodnu ravnopravnost”, In: Amila Ždralović and Saša Gavrić, (eds.), *Uvod u rodne studije: Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka*, Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar and Pravni fakultet, p. 25). On the other hand, in the society of socialist equality and exercised rights (such as the right to work, education, divorce and abortion), women “were silenced”, “lulled into passivity” and pulled “into the trap of socialist ideology” that claimed to have solved the so-called “women’s” issue. Still, as feminists and Marxists, feminist theorists spoke out about the patriarchal character of the socialist society and the general subordination of women in the society.

tivists were equally radical about the political circumstances in their society and raised the issues of restrictions and reach of the socialist equality of men and women. Their narratives about women's subordination and the need for solidarity, regardless of their many differences, are essentially the same. Remembering the 1978 conference, Nada Ler Sofronić says:

We spoke out in public, took the risk of media, institutional and party slaps and smacks, especially because we invited the most important women to this conference, feminists from the developed West who told an almost identical story but about how the West, which brags so loudly about its democracy, is actually a democracy without women; it was the fact that they were feminists and about how they and we got abandoned by our marvellous leftists after '68 and pushed away from lecterns back to copiers and cafeterias, of course not all of us. Women were definitely realising that they need their own movement and that they must fight for their rights independently and in solidarity with other women, in their own independent movement.<sup>36</sup>

The continuity of this idea was interrupted by the breakup of the society and the state, and with the concept of democracy "which is conservative, traditional, nationalistic and simplified"<sup>37</sup> feminism entered a different phase. In her article "Telo kao proces u toku" (*Body as an Ongoing Process*), published in the magazine *Sociologija* in 1992, Žarana Papić notes that in the course of "development and branching of feminist theories", "mature feminism" directs the same criticisms at the "early feminism" as it "in its earliest stages directed at the 'male theory' that disregarded the issue of gender division."<sup>38</sup>

Knowing that the category of "woman" is neither homogeneous nor static/universal but rather a heterogeneous, multi-faceted category that can both synchronously and diachronously assume different positions and roles, points to a specific historical gender dynamics in which superior-subordinate relationships may vary depending on the cultural patterns of masculinity and femininity. The universalism of the previous phase of feminism was subsequently rightly criticised, because "empty" universalism cannot be used to understand or shed light on the cultural wealth and diversity of possible relations between the sexes."<sup>39</sup>

Žarana Papić finds support and grounds for her claims in an essay by the sociologist Judith Stacey. Stacey recognises Carol Gilligan's book as extremely important because the author "challenged the false universalism in scholar-

<sup>36</sup> Nada Ler Sofronić, "78 Revisited", In *ProFemina*, 2011, p. 3

<sup>37</sup> Žarana Papić, *Mogućnost socijalističkog feminizma u Istočnoj Evropi*, p. 195

<sup>38</sup> Žarana Papić, *Telo kao 'proces u toku'*, In: Adriana Zaharijević et al, (eds.), *Žarana Papić, Tekstovi 1977-2002*. (Beograd: Centar za studije roda i politike - Fakultet političkih nauka i Žene u crnom, 2012), p. 165

<sup>39</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 166

ly narratives about (putatively human) moral development that were rooted exclusively in studies of the experiences and subjectivities of males.”<sup>40</sup> Following this course, we can recognise at least four conceptual frameworks arising from Carol Gilligan’s theory. First, she shook the epistemological foundations of objectivity and neutrality of masculine scientific theories and introduced analytical categories which generally cannot be ignored in any analysis in the field of social science and humanities. Second, she created a framework for future feminist theories, particularly those developed in the framework of cultural feminism. Third, the feminist critique that followed paved the path for postmodern and post-structuralist feminist perspectives. And four, the book was a direct influence on various women’s movements and it also provided a conceptual framework for interpretation of the scope and limitations of their activist action (primarily in the domain of women’s peace activism and eco-feminism).

An illustrative approach in this context is the women’s (peace) movement in the region after the 1990s. Namely, towards the end of the 1980s there was a spontaneous flourishing of women’s lobbies, women’s parliaments, independent women’s associations in Serbia, Slovenia, Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina.<sup>41</sup> In the words of Tatjana Žarković and Jelena Gaković:

“Women’s peace activism in the countries of the former Yugoslavia is a unique example of solidarity which knows no physical or symbolical boundaries imposed by the nationalist ideology. [...] The approach to peace, security and conflict resolution which is traditionally characterised as women’s approach primarily focuses on thinking and action based on the model of ethics of care and responsibility.”<sup>42</sup>

In their interpretation of women’s peace activism, female authors’ theoretical explanations reach for categorization devices provided by Carol Gilligan. In that, they consider the (postmodernist) criticisms of this approach but they also believe that the need for critical reflection on the importance and potential of women’s peacebuilding association is precisely the reason why the above debate must be placed into its social context. Without disputing the importance of this approach, and with the necessary critical remarks about

<sup>40</sup> Judith Stacey, On Resistance Ambivalence, and Feminist Theory: A Response to Carol Gilligan, In: *Michigan Quarterly Review*. Vol. XXIX, No. 4, 1990, p. 537

<sup>41</sup> Sanja Licht & Slobodan Drakulić, When the Word for Peacemaker was a Woman: War and Gender in the Former Yugoslavia”, In: Jelisaveta Blagojević & Dušan Dorđević Mileusnić (eds), *Belgrade Women’s Studies Journal - Selected Papers Anniversary Issue*, 2002, <http://www.zenskkestudie.edu.rs/en/publishing/online-material/women-s-studies-journal>

<sup>42</sup> Tatjana Žarković & Jelena Gaković, Women’s Peace Activisms, In: Amila Ždralović et al., *What is the Gender of Security? 20 years of the Security Council Resolution 1325 ‘Women, Peace and Security’ and its implementation in Bosnia and Herzegovina* (Sarajevo: Sarajevo Open Centre i OSCE, 2020), p. 111

the essentialist grounds for association, we can conclude that feminisms in Bosnia and Herzegovina and its neighbouring countries have entered a different phase. Research generally confirms significant involvement of women in civil society and development of various women's policies.<sup>43</sup>

### **Theoretical Dispositions of the Ethics of Justice and Ethics of Care**

Based on past research, it can be concluded that although women often associate around the patriarchal matrix, these associations have grown into a strong movement. Particularly when it comes to associations in small local communities where the activists identify, at least declaratively, the idea of women's solidarity as extremely important; they articulate a common female identity and raise it as an issue only occasionally, by recognising the intersecting grounds for discrimination and the position of women in vulnerable groups. The range of activities carried out by associations and informal groups is versatile and includes organisation of social gatherings and outings, programmes for economic strengthening of women, humanitarian activities, prevention and combat against domestic violence, organisation of preventive medical check-ups, etc.<sup>44</sup> Most associations self-identify as women's associations and organisations and individuals create networks for further cooperation and support, such as *Ženska mreža BiH*<sup>45</sup>, *Ženska romska mreža*<sup>46</sup>, *RING mreža*<sup>47</sup> and *Sigurna mreža*<sup>48</sup>. Activist action in general is marked by different activities, but the dominant and clearly identifiable model is the ethics of care which is complementary to a patriarchal-defined female identity as a basis

<sup>43</sup> Ristin Thomasson, *To make room for changes – Peace strategies from women organisations in Bosnia and Herzegovina*. The Kvinna till Kvinna Foundation, 2006. <http://www.peacewomen.org/node/90314>; Zlatiborka Popov-Momčinović, *Ženski pokret u Bosni i Hercegovini: artikulacija jedne kontrakulture*, Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar, Centar za empirijska istraživanja religije u Bosni i Hercegovini, Fondacija CURE, 2013; Amila Zdralović and Miela Rožajac – Zulčić, *Ženski mirovni aktivizam i njegov utjecaj na mir i sigurnost*, In: Andriana Zaharijević (ed.), *Neko je rekao feminizam? Kako je feminizam uticao na žene XXI veka*, Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar Fondacija Heinrich Böll – Ured u BiH Fondacija CURE, 2012

<sup>44</sup> I base this conclusion on past empirical research on the women's/feminist movement, the findings of which were to a large extent already published in: Amila Zdralović & Zlatiborka Popov Momčinović, *Activisms on the Margins: Capacity Assessment in Ten Selected Women's Organizations*, Sarajevo: Fondacija CURE, 2019

<sup>45</sup> See more at: <https://zenskamreza.ba/o-nama/>.

<sup>46</sup> See more at: <https://www.zrm-uspjeh.ba/index.php/bs/o-nama>.

<sup>47</sup> See more at: <https://www.ring.ba/index.php/nama/o-mrezi-ring>.

<sup>48</sup> See more at: <https://www.sigurnamreza.ba/en>.

for association and activism. Still, it should be noted that in fighting for their rights, women also articulate theoretical views that correspond to feminist liberalism.

In that, activist action still suffers from the general failings of civil society action and often receives criticism that it has NGO-ised feminisms and reduced them to project activities guided by donor policies. This also reflects on feminist theories, because most of them are generated in 'major' feminist/women's associations linked to individuals from the academic community and fill the gaps that result from the general situation and the lack or absence of financial investment in research and publications in the field of social science and humanities. In extra-institutional spheres of the civil society, it was also easier to initiate various research and education programmes.<sup>49</sup>

The above is not meant to diminish the value of activities taking place in the non-governmental sector, which include informal education programmes and scientific research. The findings of that research provide information about the social reality of the law with respect to gender equality and serve as guidelines for further advocacy activities and transformation of rights. The wealth of that research is demonstrated by, for example, publications published by organisations such as Sarajevski otvoreni centar and Fondacija Cure.<sup>50</sup> Research results are used by organisations to periodically produce reports on the status of (women's) human rights, such as the reports of civil society organisations on the application of key findings and recommendations of the CEDAW committee for Bosnia and Herzegovina.

However, a question that remains justifiably open is the extent to which knowledge production in project cycles is theory-impaired, considering that the objectives and subjects of study are defined within the scope of a broader project. Specifically, their outputs give us a 'snapshot' of the present situation and useful background information but, justifiably so considering their primary purpose, often fail to provide deeper theoretical analysis and productive criticism. One such example is the treatment of the UN agenda on Women, Peace and Security, which is theoretically firmly based in ethics of care.<sup>51</sup>

<sup>49</sup> Midhat Izmirlija & Amila Ždralović, *Feministička teorija, nauka i istraživanje u Bosni i Hercegovini*, In: Amila Ždralović and Saša Gavrić, (eds), *Uvod u rodne studije: Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka*, Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar and Pravni fakultet, 2019

<sup>50</sup> To learn more about these organisations' publications, please see: <https://fondacijacure.org/category/publikacije/istrazivanja/> and <https://soc.ba/>.

<sup>51</sup> "Feminists who come from the Western, liberal countries [...] are often sharply critical of the UN Agenda 'Women, Peace and Security'. The criticism is especially prominent with respect to how Resolution 1325 is implemented, emphasising that the states use this document as a smokescreen for other foreign policy interests, instead of dealing with the problem of women's safety within their borders" (Amila Ždralović et al, *Kojeg je roda sigurnost: 20 godina*

Namely, for the last ten years Bosnia and Herzegovina is continuously working on the implementation of the UN Resolution 1325 and the national plans for its implementation are continuously updated. The *Implementing the Women, Peace and Security Agenda in the OSCE Region* report finds that in Bosnia and Herzegovina and in Serbia the second and the third national action plan “sought to focus more on human security, in an attempt to make the plans more relevant to immediate, real security threats faced by the population, including for example responses to natural disasters”.<sup>52</sup> Still, all the shortcomings of this approach became apparent with the first signs of the looming Covid-19 pandemic. From the moment state of emergency was declared, the Agency for Gender Equality of Bosnia and Herzegovina (ARS B&H) issued warnings that the authorities in charge of pandemic-related measures must pay attention to the impact of their activities on gender equality, and in late April ARS B&H developed the *Recommendations for integration of the gender equality perspective into the process of planning, adoption and implementation of decisions, measures and plans in the combat against the COVID-19 pandemic*. Recommendations primarily relate to the area of prevention and protection from gender-based violence, women’s work engagement, economic position of women and equal representation of women in decision-making bodies<sup>53</sup>.

Needs assessments will certainly be required in the coming period, but in the context of this discussion we can also identify the problem of excessive focus on women’s ethics of care rather than gender mainstreaming in policy-making. So, in analysing Bosnia and Herzegovina’s action plans (i.e. the first two national action plans), Ebru Demir points out two weaknesses: first, the problem of excessive focus on descriptive representation of women - which is important but does not lead to substantive representation; and second, the absence of policy gender mainstreaming.<sup>54</sup>

Her conclusions about the weaknesses inherent in national action plans can also be indirectly interpreted in a broader theoretical context. Activities aiming to introduce changes into political and public life are primarily

---

*Rezolucije Vijeća sigurnosti 1325, Žene, mir i sigurnost i njezina provedba u Bosni i Hercegovini*, Sarajevo: Sarajvski otvoreni centar i OSCE, 2020, p. 13).

<sup>52</sup> Henri Myrntinen et al, *Implementing the Women, Peace and Security Agenda in the OSCE Region*, 2020. Beč: OSCE, 2020, p. 56

<sup>53</sup> ARSB&H. (28/4/2020), *Preporuke za integrisanje perspektive ravnopravnosti spolova u proces planiranja, donošenja i provođenja odluka, mjera i planova u borbi protiv pandemije COVID-19*. Broj: 10-37-2-728-2/20. <https://arsbih.gov.ba/preporuke-za-integrisanje-perspektive-ravnopravnosti-spolova-u-borbi-protiv-pandemije-covid-19/>

<sup>54</sup> Demir Ebru, The role of the United Nations women, peace and security agenda in promoting gender justice in post-conflict societies: Is the agenda transformative. *International Journal of Rule of Law, Transitional Justice and Human Rights*, 7 (7), 2016

focused not on their fundamental transformation but on the matter of so-called “women’s” quotas. Moreover, women’s policy based on the ethics of care profiles female and male identities in a way that is similar to patriarchal approaches and thus results in limited change. Women’s activism in Bosnia and Herzegovina in the civil domain has articulated its demands, but it has also seriously shaken the belief in a homogeneous female identity and placed a stronger accent on the problems faced by women in marginalised groups. However, by being grounded in the ethics of care, different female identities remain trapped in patriarchally defined roles.

Ethics of care - although complementary to the ethics of justice in the political and public sphere - has transformational potential, provided that we treat it, same as the ethics of justice, as an ideal type model rather than as an a priori female and male model. This is not about potential that should be exhausted - in the form of personal resources of the women who provide care for their homes and household members, or activists’ care for the life of the local community and attempts to bridge the gaps in the social welfare system - instead, the potential of this approach should be used as part of public policy. Also, the ideal type constructs should be freed from the prefix of ‘female’ or ‘male’. However much empirical data validates the use of these prefixes, we can also find validation for the opposite. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, for example, feminisation of the legal profession and the resulting high percentage of women in the justice system<sup>55</sup> did not mean that a female/feminist paradigm was introduced into the judicial authorities.

This is not meant to negate the importance of ethics of care; it certainly remains a “corrective”<sup>56</sup> of the ethics of justice because it contextualizes the ethics of justice and implies a (gender) sensibility that considers long-term consequences of certain decisions and policies. However, feminist approaches based in the ethics of care at the expense of ethics of justice tend to follow strict patriarchal lines of gender division.

On the other hand, the integration of ethics of care and ethics of justice can be found in the strategy of gender mainstreaming, which arose in response to the shortcomings of specifically female policies. As Zorana Antonijević explains: “At the First World Conference on Women held in Mexico City in 1975, United Nations member states made a commitment to formulate national strategies, goals and priorities aimed at improving gender equality and eradication of gender-based discrimination”, but ten years later, “at the Third World Conference on Women held in Nairobi in 1985, it was acknowledged

---

<sup>55</sup> Data on the gender structure of judicial authorities are available in Annual Reports of the High Judicial and Prosecutorial Council.

<sup>56</sup> Jasminka Babić-Avdispahić & Asim Mujkić, *Etika*, p. 142

that the programmes which focused on women and mostly treated them as a homogeneous group failed to provide adequate results”.<sup>57</sup> This was the reason for further development of the gender mainstreaming strategy, presented at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995.<sup>58</sup> Gender mainstreaming is an approach which embeds the gender perspective in all programmes and activities and at all levels of decision-making, planning and implementation of activities.<sup>59</sup>

Discussions in literature about the gender mainstreaming strategy and its transformation potential<sup>60</sup> abounded, but some authors warn that the changes it offers are slow rather than revolutionary:

We suggest analysing the transformative potential of gender mainstreaming with a different notion of change in mind. This means that the changes achieved through mainstreaming gender can simultaneously reproduce certain forms of gender inequality, while making small steps in subverting the power relations installed in this inequality, depending on the context. Gender mainstreaming strategies therefore might partly subvert and partly comply with existing power relations but certainly not bring the revolutionary change as might have been anticipated by the inception of gender mainstreaming as a global strategy. Rather they could be seen as little movements, steps forward, backward and sideways in a very, very slow revolution and process of change.<sup>61</sup>

We should take into account that this is a relatively new global strategy with a wide field of application, in which we talk about gender-mainstreamed policies, budgets, education, etc. Some authors also note that gender mainstreaming as a strategy is inconsistently applied in different states and even within a single state<sup>62</sup>, which certainly makes its interpretation more diffi-

---

<sup>57</sup> Zorana Antonijević, Gender mainstreaming: urođnjavanje, In: Amila Ždralović i Saša Gavrić (pr.) *Uvod u rodne studije. Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka* (p. 275-284), Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Pravni fakultet, 2019, p. 275

<sup>58</sup> *Ibidem*

<sup>59</sup> Zorana Antonijević, Gender mainstreaming: urođnjavanje, p. 275; Adnan Kadribašić, Institucionalni mehanizmi i javne politike za rodnu ravnopravnost, In: Amila Ždralović i Saša Gavrić, *Uvod u rodne studije. Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka* (p. 137-150), Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Pravni fakultet, 2019, p. 146

<sup>60</sup> See more in: Jane L. Parpart, Exploring the Transformative potential of Gender mainstreaming in International Development Institutions, In: *Journal of International Development*, 26, 2014, p. 382–395, 2014, Anouka van Eerdewijk, The Micropolitics of Evaporation: Gender Mainstreaming instrument sin Practice, In: *Journal of International Development* 26, p. 345–355, 2014

<sup>61</sup> Tine Davids et al, Feminist Change revisited: Gender Mainstreaming as Slow Revolution, *Journal of International Development*, Vol. 26 Issue 3, April 2013, p. 396-408

<sup>62</sup> Francesca Scala & Stephanie Paterson, Bureaucratic Role Perceptions and Gender Mainstreaming in Canada, In: *Gender, Work & Organization*, Vol. 24 Issue 6, p. 579-59., 2017

cult but also provides for the necessary contextualisation as required by the ethics of care. Many feminist theory writings are characterized by rejection of abstract universalities and objective standards, showing that “abstract statements about human nature inevitably ignore differences and ultimately are insensitive to those outside of the experience of the person making the generalizations.”<sup>63</sup> Theses such as this form the foundations of a large part of feminist liberalism based in the ethics of rights and justice. Considering that the gender mainstreaming strategy is more of a universal approach than a universal rule, it offers a response to the criticisms coming from the feminist theory based in ethics of care.

### **Instead of a Conclusion**

Ethics of justice and ethics of care can be broadly interpreted as the difference between the discourses of justice and fairness: justice formulates the universal principles, while fairness contextualises them. Gender mainstreaming as a strategy provides for contextualisation of universal principles in the design, implementation and evaluation of policies, programmes, measures, etc. The strategy is impact-oriented, which points to its continuous contextualisation. Broader interpretation permits us to speak about impact not on assumed unified groups (men – women) but on different individuals and different groups. A reasonable objection to this approach would be that it reverts back to the field of feminist liberalism and that its way of thinking is dominated by Rawls’ paradigm. However, it should be noted that all approaches directly or indirectly based in the concept of ethics of care also share a common feature in that they criticize (feminist) liberalism and subvert its fundamental values. Liberalism is an idea that seeks the kind of transformation that is offered by its subsumption under the feminist paradigm.

### **Literature**

Antonijević, Zorana. Gender mainstreaming: urođnjavanje. In: Ždralović, Amila & Gavrić, Saša. (eds.) *Uvod u rodne studije. Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka* (p. 275-284). Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Pravni fakultet, 2019

---

<sup>63</sup> Linda J. Lacey, Introducing Feminist Jurisprudence: An Analysis of Oklahoma’s Seduction Statute, 25, In: *Tulsa Law Review. Volume Symposium on Feminist Jurisprudence*, Vol. 45, Issue 4, 2013, p. 775-798, <https://digitalcommons.law.utulsa.edu/tlr/vol25/iss4/4>, p. 781

- ARSBiH (28/4/2020). *Preporuke za integrisanje perspektive ravnopravnosti spolova u proces planiranja, donošenja i provođenja odluka, mjera i planova u borbi protiv pandemije COVID-19*. Broj: 10-37-2-728-2/20. <https://arsbih.gov.ba/preporuke-za-integrisanje-perspektive-ravnopravnosti-spolova-u-borbi-protiv-pandemije-covid-19/>
- Babić-Avdispahić, Jasminka & Mujkić, Asim. *Etika*. Zenica: Udruženje za filozofiju i društveno-Humanistička istraživanja *Eidos*. 2019
- Bender, Leslie. From Gender Difference to Feminist Solidarity: Using Carol Gilligan and an Ethic of Care in Law“, U: *Vermont Law Review*, vol. 15, no. 1, 1990, p. 1-48
- Benhabib, Seyla et al. *Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange*. New York: Routledge, 1995
- Butler, Judith. *Raščinjavanje roda* (transl. Jasmina Husanović). Sarajevo: TDK Šahinpašić, 2005
- Dauids, Tine et al. Feminist Change revisited: Gender Mainstreaming as Slow Revolution. In: *Journal of International Development*, Vol. 26, Issue 3, April 2013, p. 396-408
- Demir, Ebru. The role of the United Nations women, peace and security agenda in promoting gender justice in post-conflict societies: is the agenda transformative. In: *International Journal of Rule of Law, Transitional Justice and Human Rights*, 7 (7), 2016, p. 81-91 [https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=3558508](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3558508), [23/11/2020]
- Eerdewijk, Anouka. The Micropolitics of Evaporation: Gender Mainstreaming instrument sin Practice. In: *Journal of International Development* 26, p. 345–355, 2014
- Fineman, Martha Albertson. Introduction: Feminist and Queer Legal Theory. In: Fineman, Martha Albertson et al (eds.). *Feminist and Queer Legal Theory: Intimate Encounters, Uncomfortable Conversations*. London/ New York: Routledge. 2009, 2016
- Gilligan, Carol. *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development*. Cambridge/Massachussts/London: Harvard University Press, 2003
- Gilligan, Carol. Revisiting ‘In a Different Voice’. *LEARNING Landscapes* 11 (2), 2018, p. 25–30, <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1245466>
- Gilligan, Caroll. In a Different Voice: Women's Conception of the Self and of Morality. *Harvard Educational Review*, 47 (4), 1977, p. 481-517
- Green, Llezlie L. Erasing Race. *SMU Law Review Forum*, 73, 2020, p. 63-72
- Izmirlija, Midhat & Ždralović, Amila. Feministička teorija, nauka i istraživanje u Bosni i Hercegovini. In: Ždralović, Amila & Gavrić, Saša. *Uvod u rodne studije. Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka* (p. 57-68). Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Pravni fakultet.

- Kadribašić, Adnan. Institucionalni mehanizmi i javne politike za rodnu ravnopravnost. U: Ždralović, Amila & Gavrić, Saša (eds.). *Uvod u rodne studije. Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka* (p. 137-150). Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Pravni fakultet. 2019
- Karapetrović, Milena. Istorija borbe za prava žena i rodnu ravnopravnost. In: Ždralović, Amila & Gavrić, Saša. *Uvod u rodne studije. Teorija, pravo, politika – za studentice i studente društvenih nauka* (p. 15-37). Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar i Pravni fakultet. 2019
- Knežević, Đurđa. Kraj ili novi početak? – Feminizam od šezdesetih do danas u Jugoslaviji/Hrvatskoj. In: Feldman, Andrea (ed.). *Žene u Hrvatskoj: Ženska i kulturna povijest* (p. 247- 260). Zagreb: Ženska infoteka. 2004
- Kohlberg, Lawrence. Moral stages and Moralization: The Cognitive developmental Approach. In: Kohlberg, Lawrence. *The Psychology of Moral Development: The Nature and Valuduty of Moral Stages*. San Francisco: Harper and Row. San Francisco. p. 170-205, 1984
- Kovačević, Jasna. Rodne razlike u etičkom donošenju odluka. In: Ždralović, Amila (ed.). *Rod i ekonomomija* (p. 28-38). Sarajevo: SOC, 2019
- Lacey, Linda J. Introducing Feminist Jurisprudence: An Analysis of Oklahoma's Seduction Statute, 25. In: *Tulsa Law Review. Volume Symposium on Feminist Jurisprudence*, Vol. 45, Issue 4, 2013, p. 775-798, <https://digitalcommons.law.utulsa.edu/tlr/vol25/iss4/4>
- Law, Sylvia A. In defense of liberal feminism, In: West, Robin & Grant Bowman, Cynthia (ed.). *Research Handbook on Feminist Jurisprudence* (p. 24-43). Cheltenham, UK/Northampton, MA. USA: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, 2019, <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781786439697.00009>
- Ler Sofronić, Nada. 78 Revisited. In: *ProFemina*, 2011
- Licht, Sonja & Drakulić, Slobodan. When the Word for Peacemaker was a Woman: War and Gender in the Former Yugoslavia. In: Blagojević, Jelisaveta & Đorđević Mileusnić, Dušan (ed.). *Belgrade Women's Studies Journal - Selected Papers Anniversary Issue*. <http://www.zenskestudie.edu.rs/en/publishing/online-material/women-s-studies-journal>.
- Lucas, Margery. Difference Feminism Now. *Society*, Vol. 52, Issue 5, 2015, p. 499-502
- Milinović, Jelena. *Liderke izbliza. Prilog proučavanju liderstva žena u Bosni i Hercegovini*. Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar, 2017
- Myrntinen, Henri et al. *Implementing the Women, Peace and Security Agenda in the OSCE Region*. Beč: OSCE, 2020 <https://www.osce.org/files/f/documents/3/4/444577.pdf>
- Papić, Žarana. Mogućnost socijalističkog feminizma u Istočnoj Evropi. In: Zaharijević et al. (ed.). *Žarana Papić. Tekstovi 1977-2002*. (p. 195-202). Beograd: Centar za studije roda i politike - Fakultet političkih nauka, Žene u crnom. 2012

- Papić, Žarana. Telo kao proces u toku. In: Zaharijević et al. (ed.). *Žarana Papić. Tekstovi 1977-2002*. (p. 149-177). Beograd: Centar za studije roda i politike - Fakultet političkih nauka i Žene u crnom. 2012
- Parpart, Jane L. Exploring the Transformative potential of Gender mainstreaming in International Development Institutions. In: *Journal of International Development*. 26, 2014, p. 382-395. DOI: 10.1002/jid.2948
- Platon. *Gorgija/Protogora*. (Prev. Albin Vilhar). Beograd: Kultura. 1968
- Popov-Momčinović, Zlatiborka. *Ženski pokret u Bosni i Hercegovini: artikulacija jedne kontrakulture*. Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar, Centar za empirijska istraživanja religije u Bosni i Hercegovini. Fondacija CURE. 2013
- Prevost, Haleigh & Kilty, Jennifer M. You Start to Feel like You're Losing Your Mind: An Intersectionality-Based Policy Analysis of Federal Correctional Segregation Policy and Practice. In: *Canadian Journal of Women and the Law*, vol. 32, No. 1, 2020, p. 162-195
- Reiter, Sara Ann. Kohlnerg – Gilligan Controversy: Lessons for Accounting Ethics education. In: *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, No. 7, 1996, p. 33-54
- Scala, Francesca & Paterson, Stephanie. Bureaucratic Role Perceptions and Gender Mainstreaming in Canada, In: *Gender, Work & Organization*, Vol. 24 Issue 6, 2017, p. 579-593, DOI: 10.1111/gwao.12182
- Snitow, Ann. *Visitors: An American Feminist in East Central Europe*. New York: New Village Press. 2020
- Stacey, Judith. On Resistance Ambivalence, and Feminist Theory: A Response to Carol Gilligan. In: *Michigan Quarterly Review*, Vol. XXIX, No. 4, 1990, p. 537-546
- Steinmetz, Katy. Q+A: Kimberlé Crenshaw. U: *TIME Magazine*, 195, No. 7/8 (Mart, 2020), <http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=asn&AN=141838309&site=ehost-live>
- Thomasson, Ristin. *To make room for changes – Peace strategies from women organisations in Bosnia and Herzegovina*. The Kvinna till Kvinna Foundation. 2006, <http://www.peacewomen.org/node/90314>
- Turnier, William et al. Redistributive Justice and Cultural Feminism. In: *The American University Law Review*, Vol. 45/5, 1996. (str. 1275-1322.). <http://www.aulawreview.org/>, dana 17.07.2013.
- West, Robin. Introduction to Research Handbook on Feminist Jurisprudence. U: West, Robin & Grant Bowman, Cynthia. (ur.). *Research Handbook on Feminist Jurisprudence* (p. 1-22). Cheltenham, UK/Northampton, MA. USA: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited. 2019. <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781786439697.00007>

- Žarković, Tatjana & Gaković, Jelena. Women's Peace Activisms. In: Ždralović, Amila et al (ed.). *What is the Gender of Security? 20 years of the Security Council Resolution 1325 'Women, Peace and Security' and its implementation in Bosnia and Herzegovina* (p. 111-131). Sarajevo: Sarajevo Open Centre i OSCE. 2020
- Ždralović, Amila & Rožajac – Zulčić, Mirela. Ženski mirovni aktivizam i njegov utjecaj na mir i sigurnost. In: Zaharijević, Adriana (ed.). *Neko je rekao feminizam? Kako je feminizam uticao na žene XXI veka* (p. 390-415). Sarajevo: Sarajevski otvoreni centar Fondacija Heinrich Böll – Ured u BiH. Fondacija CURE
- Ždralović, Amila et al. Introduction: What is the Gender of Security 2.0?, In: Ždralović, Amila et al (ed.). *What is the Gender of Security? 20 years of the Security Council Resolution 1325 'Women, Peace and Security' and its implementation in Bosnia and Herzegovina* (p. 11-25). Sarajevo: Sarajevo Open Centre and OSCE. 2020
- Ždralović, Amila & Popov Momčinović, Zlatiborka. *Activisms on the Margins: Capacity Assessment in Ten Selected Women's Organizations*. Sarajevo: Fondacija CURE. 2019

Sarina Bakic<sup>1</sup>  
Nedzma Džananović Mirascija<sup>2</sup>  
University of Sarajevo  
Faculty of Political Studies

*Original scientific paper*  
UDC 792.01:821.163.41.09-2  
DOI 10.7251/SOCEN2120067B  
COBISS.RS-ID 133792257  
Accepted: 19/01/2021

## Meeting Ilija Jakovljević: Sociological analysis of theatrical play *Logorilijada* in the context of contemplating an individual within totalitarian societies

### Abstract

*This article presents reception and sociological analyses of the theater performance Logorilijada from the aspect of the position of an individual in totalitarian societies. The play is about Ilija Jakovljević's time spent in prison, his tragic life and death, accentuating several universal questions and lessons from his destiny that could be substantial for the future as well. It can be concluded that tragic position of Ilija Jakovljević is not only the result of unfortunate historical and social circumstances, but it is tragic because of the deprivation of all human, moral, and legal assumptions related to the idea of human being and its truly existence and meaning in the world.*

**Keywords:** *Logorilijada; Ilija Jakovljević; camp; individual; totalitarianism*

*Once upon a time we dreamed of a sweet imaginary fire and the vaults of a crowning feast, but he, Sackever, saw man in his utter ugliness, in his physical and spiritual degradation.*

Marc Chagall

---

<sup>1</sup> PhD, Assistant Professor; Sociology Department; E-mail: sarina.bakic@fpn.unsa.ba

<sup>2</sup> PhD, Professor; Department of Political Science; E-mail: nedzma.džananovic@fpn.unsa.ba

## Introduction

Art that aims to be constructive should have its affirmative social and humanistic tendency. Regardless of changes in the context of understanding art today, populist and quasi neo-liberal thinking that this tendency has no place in art, anti-tendency and *l'art pour l'art* principles cannot be accepted by anyone who cares about art becoming an instrument of progress for a society. Placing art and its purpose in itself is a lie and mimicry, speaking in a historical context and it is also a reaction, in the context of contemporary social needs. This attitude towards art and artistic creation affirms art as an equal manifestation of a wider spectrum with science and technology. The objections art is exposed to have their basis and justification in antisocial action by individual artists. The basis of artistic creation remains, quite naturally, much broader than could be determined in a strict analytical framework, but the end result, the goal of art, should be projected into the sphere of intellectual and humanist understanding.

Art that does not create a 'new life' and that does not act as transformation in the direction of elementary human values and ideals, comes down to a conscious or unconscious tool in the hands of both surviving and constructed realities. The difficult position of a large number of today's artists, especially in Bosnia and Herzegovina, lies in the deep irreconcilability of the idea grasped by the personal situation of artists and intelligent observation of development laws, and the force of supported vain social values. The position of today's artists and art institutions represents a compromise between awareness of the better and 'forced labor' for the values that prevail. One of the results of this situation is often excessive individualism, such as social resignation and 'invisible' protest. In this way, the artist seeks absoluteness in himself, because the society he creates in does not provide it (Hegel's 'unhappy consciousness').

In contrast to such passive protests, conscious artists go in such a way that within the society they operate in, they draw ideological power from the real bearers of ideological forces and thus question them. This kind of art is clear, it enlightens the subject and the non-metaphysical, devoid of irrational darkening and discretion in emphasizing the reality that hurts. For the confirmation of artistic truths lies in its last resort, the formation and strengthening of consciousness. Therefore, artists give neither advice, nor solutions, nor a cure. They should beware of 'giving lessons'. Certainly, they should not be moralists, in the sense that they remind others of their obligations while relieving themselves of personal responsibility. They should just give 'suggestions'. This

term, regardless of its daily use and wear and tear, remains the most impressive, because it emphasizes the ethical relationship. Precisely by working to change oneself under the influence of acting upon the conditions of one's existence, it is pointed out, someone else is also suggested a way of acting upon conditions that equally affect them, and which are ultimately common to us. Advancing in his artistic work, he shows an example of how acting under these conditions produces a new, better environment, and demonstrates how this new and better environment creates space for new experiences and how finally this whole path is the path of another.

One example of such art is the play *Logorilijada*<sup>3</sup> by the Croatian National Theater in Mostar in co-production with the Marin Držić Theater in Dubrovnik. Thus, in this work, in the context of the applied methodology, the method of content analysis was used, more precisely the method of visual content analysis.

The play talks about the days of Ilija Jakovljević's detention, his tragic life and death, but what is important to emphasize is that it opens several universal questions and lessons from his destiny that would be valid for the future. Every day and every hour brings us opportunities to make a decision that determines whether or not we will be subjected to various forces that threaten to destroy our integrity, degrade our personality, annul our rights, endanger our freedom. This play directly reminds us of the need for critical analysis on an individual level, what Hemingway calls a 'shit detector', or what Hegel considers self-reflection from the aspect of placing the Self as an object of observation.

As the creators of the play themselves emphasized, this is a dramatic synthesis of the last seven years of Ilija Jakovljević's life, based on material from Ilija Jakovljević's diabout his detention in the Ustasha camp Stara Gradiška 'Concentration Camp on the Sava', a collection of his poems 'Storm lyrics' and a novel, 'Tomb of Boris Davidovič' by Danilo Kiš.

Danilo Kiš built a 'tomb of words' for the victims of all totalitarian systems, 'the only service that a real tragedy does when it leaves the survivors, as well as its victims, speechless', as Josif Brodski wrote in the preface to the American edition of this space-scale service for all of us.

---

<sup>3</sup> The play *Logorilijada* was performed in Zenica during the 18<sup>th</sup> Festival of Bosnian-Herzegovinian drama in Zenica entitled 'Walls of Freedom', April 28<sup>th</sup>, 2019, at the Bosnian National Theater in Zenica, as part of the competition program. The play was directed by Ivan Leo Lemo and the dramaturgy is signed by Dragan Komadina.

## Who was Ilija Jakovljević?

According to the Croatian Biographical Lexicon of the Miroslav Krleža Lexicographic Institute, Ilija Jakovljević, a writer, critic, publicist and lawyer, was born in Mostar in 1898. He was educated in Sarajevo and Zagreb, where he spent the majority of his adult life. As a supporter of the Croatian Peasant Party, he also edited *Croatian Journal*, where he tried to use his temperamental style and unusually individualized political articulation to make a liberal-democratically based critical deviation from the royal Yugoslav regime, Bolshevik internationalism and revolutionism, but also from wild nationalism<sup>4</sup>. He was a journalist and editor of *Tinder*, *People's Politics*, *Croatian defense*, the already mentioned *Croatian Journal* and *Contemporary*. He was the president of the Croatian Writers' Association in the period of 1939-1941.

During the Independent State of Croatia, he was arrested in October 1941 in Zagreb and detained in the infamous Ustasha camp Stara Gradiška together with the so-called Masonic group (professors, scientists, doctors, intellectuals) until December 1942. After leaving the Stara Gradiška camp, Jakovljević joined the Partisans in 1944, and after the Second World War, more precisely in 1948, he was arrested again, but this time by the Communists on charges of colluding with former Croatian Peasant Party leaders. According to some other sources, Jakovljević was arrested in order to be forced to testify in the "Hebrang case"<sup>5</sup>. He died in the Glavnjača prison in Belgrade on October 28<sup>th</sup>, 1948. Due to the totalitarian nature of the communist regime and the method of liquidating dissidents, his death was officially recorded as 'death under unexplained circumstances', alleged to be a suicide, although it is reasonable to assume that he was killed in a prison cell. He was only 50 years old.

The most significant works of Ilija Jakovljević are *Studies and Columns* (1919), collections of poems *Poison of Memories* (1940), and *Storm Lyrics* (1945), as a valuable and authentic testimony of captivity and suffering in Stara Gradiška imbued with religious humanism. Jakovljević expressed his social and humanistic engagement in the collection of native short stories *Home* (1923) and in the novels *At the Crossroads* (1925) and *In the Dark* (1945).

His deeply moving records of the Stara Gradiška concentration camp were published in the book *Concentration Camp on the Sava* (1999). 'In Stara

<sup>4</sup> Ivan Lovrenović, *Ilija Jakovljević i zemlji grobova*, <http://ivanlovrenovic.com/clanci/zapisi/ilija-jakovljevic-u-zemlji-grobova>, objavljeno 07/02/2012, p. 1; [17/06/2019]

<sup>5</sup> Mile Lasić, *Kultura sjećanja (Pledoaje za izgradnju kulture sjećanja i u regiji Jugoistoka Evrope)* (Sarajevo: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 2011), p. 68

Gradiška, detainee Ilija Jakovljević, through the bars of his cell, recognizes famous people under the moonlight who are taken to their deaths by Ustasha guards and listens to footsteps from the corridor that may be coming for him, and at the same time writes fragments giving birth to the most valuable literary testimony from Ustasha concentration camps.<sup>6</sup>

Lovrenović reflects: 'Now, with this newly discovered manuscript from Stara Gradiška, this unfortunate and strong man is disturbing us again - from half a century of grave distance - and warns us that nothing has essentially changed. Describing the world of criminals and victims of the Stara Gradiška camp with Dürer's precision, hovering over the phenomenon of evil and crime by the insatiable interest of moralists and anatomists at the same time, but also elaborating political and civic events, Jakovljević, in many places, even with striking detail - writes as if he was writing about our past war and current time<sup>7</sup>.

Ilija Jakovljević, as a survivor of Stara Gradiška, still preserved his faith in the unconditional meaning of life and the meaning of the role of a true intellectual. His faith continued even after he was detained once more, in the Glavnjača prison in Belgrade, and died there.

In Frankel's vocabulary, it is about the meaning of '*in extremis*'.

### **Tragedy of the individual within totalitarian societies**

A man living in a totalitarian society feels the reality that surrounds him as a set of various pressures, each of which is inhuman in nature and aimed at man as an individual. Primarily, it is a reality that puts the collective in the first place and not the individual, doing essentially everything to destroy the authenticity of the human being. Then, such a reality, fills the needs and concrete desires of people exclusively with empty phrases and general places. It is also a reality that instead of living, changeable, concrete language, is addressed by hackneyed phrases, empty slogans, and words of distorted meaning. Furthermore, in the context of different models of totalitarian societies, there are common characteristics. The model of any totalitarian society is a model in which there has been a complete centralization of power and which is in the hands of a relatively small group of people. It is based on a perfectly trained and obedient bureaucracy only interested in maintaining the state of things, the state of reality, in a petrified state, without any changes, be-

<sup>6</sup> Slavko Golstein, 1941. *Godina koja se vraća* (Beograd: Službeni glasnik; Sarajevo: Synopsis, 2012), p. 45

<sup>7</sup> Lovrenović, *op. cit.*, p. 2

cause change threatens their existence. Such systems, which, as a rule, always speak in the name of the people ("The whole people!"), in all its declarations, totalitarianism, in fact, does not count at all with the state and the people. Every totalitarianism also contains an element of contempt for those it rules. Totalitarianism in culture is only a fraction of such systems, which in the twentieth century, as it seems to us, affected the whole humanity, taking the most different forms and colors. But their essence, their external and internal vibrations are similar. Their mechanisms are similar. "Totalitarian politics, far from being only anti-Semitic or racist or imperialist or communist, uses and abuses its own ideology or political factors until the basis of true reality completely disappears, from which ideologies originally draw their power and propaganda potential"<sup>8</sup>. Thus, the 'results' of totalitarian policies spawned one of the worst aspects of totalitarian societies - the incomprehensible became comprehensible and the unimaginable conceivable<sup>9</sup>. These are societies where a well-organized leading political group bases its power on the silence of the majority.

In order to continue to warn and develop conversations about critical intellectual engagement and critical art and its poetics of resistance to totalitarian ideologies, the example of Ilija Jakovljević, although unknown to the general public, can also help place reflections on the position of the individual in totalitarian societies in a more modern context. European writers and intellectuals in the world would have a clearer and better understanding of his fate than all the local 'condensed provincials', who dread people with 'different' attitudes, integrity and opinion. Those who know or have known what the conscience of people like Ilija Jakovljević means in today's European opinion, such as the greats Solzhenitsyn, Levi, Miloš, Brodsky, Kundera, Kertes, Konrad, Kiš, Rushdie, Pamuk, and many others, understand very well and will confirm that the distance and disobedience of individuals to the service of totalitarian ideologies does not mean abandoning their spiritual, cultural habitus or leaving it to others, but, on the other hand, that it means a free search for the best way to fight for the idea of human freedom. Those people who have a good understanding of the works of these and other such artists and the true value of their intellectual achievements, see and know that the original intellectuals never gave up the fight and that they led their fight mostly alone. In this struggle, intellectuals who did not obey various totalitarianisms did achieve the basic condition to incorporate their critical

<sup>8</sup> Hannah Arendt, *Izvori totalitarizma* (Beograd: Feministička izdavačka kuća 94, 1998), p. 12

<sup>9</sup> 'Modestly, twenty million people lost their lives during the period of Stalinist terror, which was later delicately called the period of mistakes and distortions'. Aleksandar Solženjicin, *Arhipelag Gulag* (Beograd: Rad, 1988), p. 11

consciousness into their art. Their intellectual engagement, social and cultural sensitivity, their critical art stood up against every kind of dilettantism, mediocrity, one-mindedness, vulgarity, barbarism and killing. They turned dissatisfaction with historical events into spite, into the aesthetics of challenging bad taste and rebelling against the totalitarian violence of history, defending the principles of individuality and personal freedom of each individual.

Thus, in the play *Logorilijada*, each of Jakovljević's words is a confession in solitude, each of his verses is a prayer of a loner. His every word is imbued with the idea of the defeat and defiance of individualism in a world of enormous injustices and inhumanities. Danilo Kiš also wrote: 'About strong individuals immersed in the stream of historical events in decisive moments of historical reality, about individuals carried by the flow of history, but who (individuals) want to preserve a clear sign and mark of their individuality, to 'swim with the flow' in spite of everything, to single themselves out in an anti-individualistic time from the endless mass of like-minded people, about people, therefore, for whom doubt is the basic compass, if doubt can still be a compass'<sup>10</sup>. From Kiš, we have obtained an archetypal image of intellectuals in all epochs of totalitarianism and a civilization of violence and death, which resists immersing with general vain standards and confessions of collective consciousness. The tragic hero of the play *Logorilijada* is recognized by his inner moral attitude, by his refusal to be a member of the 'haunted world'. Brought before the inquisitors of both systems, he does not agree to succumb to the humiliations he faces, does not admit his 'guilt', as if guided by the words of Danilo Kiš: 'I want to live in peace with myself, not with the world'<sup>11</sup> remains consistent with his beliefs and feelings.

The conflict between the individual and the institutions of totalitarian rule is not based on a rational opposition of arguments, because the guilt is fabricated, nor is its goal to establish the truth, because the investigator only seeks confession. The developmental dynamics of such a conflict takes on the characteristics of a 'negative dramaturgy of crime' because everything is subordinated to a predetermined goal "so the victim is bloodier if the distance from its fulfillment is greater"<sup>12</sup>. In addition, the conflict constantly loses its balance because the fictitious accusations are arbitrarily multiplied while the accused persistently remains bound to his truth following the tragic path of the victim. In such a perverted judicial performance, Solzhenitsyn sees a symbolic picture of a totalitarian system in which fiction acquires the attributes of supreme truth, and false values and lies themselves rise to the pedestal.

<sup>10</sup> Danilo Kiš, *Homo poeticus* (Podgorica: Narodna knjiga, 2010), p. 177-178

<sup>11</sup> Danilo Kiš, *Grobnica za Borisa Davidoviča* (Beograd: BIGZ, 1990), p. 132

<sup>12</sup> Solženjicin, *op. cit.*, p. 20

The tragic basis of the play *Logorilijada* is not the tragedy of man's ontological position, that is, his awareness of the mortality of being, of transience, of misunderstanding as sources of anxiety and loneliness. This play does not give a universal view of the position of the human being nor does it give a relief of the eternal pattern of human misery. *Logorilijada* follows the direction of the classical feeling of a tragic situation in a modern form, i.e. it observes a human being in a struggle between two irreconcilable forces: the demand and right for human freedom and the order imposed by violence. On the other hand, the classical pattern of tragedies leads from the conflict of Prometheus with the gods, Antigone with the law, Phaedra with the fatal legacy, Hamlet with the obsessions, while the world of *Logorilijada* is doubly tragic both in the context of the conflict and its resolution. Accordingly, the victim is tragic not only because of being subject to the fateful character of the conflict and its consequences, but also because in great historical predictions the ethics of suffering is deprived of any value and reduced to a mere liquidation technique or is an 'anonymous act' in service of state reasoning. Thus, again, those mechanisms of the so-called 'Historical rationalities' are revealed, which, in the name of rigid principles of ideological prophetism, accept and justify murder as a means of political reckoning and a measure of reason in matters of the human world.<sup>13</sup> In that sense, the play *Logorilijada* presents the tragic position of the individual in totalitarian systems as a drama of man in history and places the conflicts in the depths of the human soul in the context of the historical stage and the modern world. Ilija Jakovljević suffers as a victim of Camus-like fatality, which ends in the form of political punishment. Captured and accused without real evidence twice, he too suffers in the name of irrational principles that have absolutized their mindless power as supreme and inviolable authorities. In this tragic rift between reason and power, we can see how by absolutizing repressive logic and power, every value order turns into the fatality of its submission.

### **All the concentration camps of the world**

One of the *leitmotifs* of this sociological research of the play "*Logorilijada*" is Terry Eagleton's claim that "there is something inherently offensive to be oppressed"<sup>14</sup>. On the other hand, the expression "treat human beings as human beings" is very old, but that does not mean that it is completely comprehensible to everyone. According to Avishai Margalit, the explanation of this particular term is an important part of the attempt to describe the notion

<sup>13</sup> Salman Rushdie, *Džozef Anton: Memoari* (Beograd: Vulkan izdavaštvo, 2013)

<sup>14</sup> Terry Eagleton, *Kultura* (Beograd: CLIO, 2017), p. 101

of humiliation, since to humiliate someone means in most cases to treat a human being as a non-human, as an object or animal. His central thesis is that humiliation usually implies the humanity of people who are humiliated.<sup>15</sup> Humiliation, oppression, rejects another human as inhuman, but the act of rejection presupposes that man is rejected. Margalit claims that even the conditions that represent the highest form of cruelty reveal the fact that the people who are responsible for them know very well that they are dealing with human beings. "Nazi propaganda often compared Jews to rats: rats poison wells, and Jews were seen as "poisoners of culture." However, a prisoner cannot be a rat, despite the Nazi propaganda that equated them. Even Heinrich Himmler, the arch-racist, was forced to admit in his famous speech before the SS commanders in Poznan that killing people in the camps was not the same as killing rats. Thus, the effort that the killers invested in suppressing their natural feelings towards these wretches was incomparably "heroic" than if they only killed rats. The special cruelty towards the victims in the forced labor camps and death camps - especially the humiliation that took place there - happened the way it happened because they were people"<sup>16</sup>. It can be concluded that one of the explanations for humiliation is in fact exclusion from society. But this exclusion is not based on the belief or approach that the humiliated person is an object or an animal. It is based solely on this type of behavior, behavior towards people as lower beings. However, one should not be deceived by overestimating these elements. Much more striking is the dullness and fear in the face of the inhumanity that reigned in the camps. It would also be wrong to take comfort in the belief that there were - in addition to a few torturers - many people in the camps who could hardly be called selfish but only mediocre. Reality is infinitely worse.<sup>17</sup> Frankel also points out to us that human beings are divided into two categories: "the decent ones and the others"<sup>18</sup>. The word 'decent' incompletely explains the German word 'anständig' but it refers to behavior. "But how easily that behavior turned into disgust"<sup>19</sup>.

All the camps and political prisons that have been recorded in history represent, in Adorno's words, one universal pattern, and that is anger towards the weak. This pattern, according to Adorno, is directed, above all, towards those who consider themselves socially weak and - rightly or not - happy.<sup>20</sup> How-

<sup>15</sup> Avishai Margalit, *Pristojno društvo* (Beograd: Radio B92, 1998), p. 101

<sup>16</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 103

<sup>17</sup> Viktor Frankl, *Zašto se niste ubili, Uvod u logoterapiju* (Zagreb: Aurum, 2014), p. 13

<sup>18</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 14

<sup>19</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 15

<sup>20</sup> Theodor W. Adorno, *Vaspitanje posle Aušvica*, Treći Program, No. 127-128, III-IV, 2005, 245-258, p. 247

ever, if barbarism is hidden in the very principle of civilization, then there is something desperate in trying to rebel against it. Sociologically, Adorno believes that if we are trying to prevent the return of death camps, concentration camps, then that attempt must be in the shadow of the aforementioned awareness of despair. However, he says that the attempt to prevent their recurrence is a necessary and important attempt, although the basic structures of societies even today, cannot guarantee the world we want. Given that there are extremely limited opportunities to change the objective social and political conditions from which such events arise today, the desire to do something “so that it would never happen again” must be pushed to the subjective side.<sup>21</sup> Adorno here primarily thinks of the psychology of the people who commit such evils. He does not believe the appeal that we should turn to true and eternal values, values that would be shrugged off by those who are inclined to do wrong, would help. Furthermore, Adorno does not believe that enlightenment on what positive qualities adorn persecuted minorities would be of great help. Adorno emphasizes that the roots of what happened should be sought in the persecutors, not in the victims who were killed, tortured, and humiliated.<sup>22</sup> “Those killed are not guilty, in any sophistic and caricatured sense in which some are still trying to construct that guilt.” Only those who showed unscrupulous hatred and anger on the victims are guilty<sup>23</sup>.

In this context, the play “*Logorilijada*” is also a testimony, not unique, but of exceptional importance and value because of the tendency for such important testimonies to be nothing more than mere historical anecdotes. None of the horrors of the camps and prisons here are made relative or ‘sweetened’. Here the mental and physical states not only of the detainees they went through in the camp but also of their torturers and executioners are described with exciting accuracy, at a time we will primarily call “before going down to hell rather than the way of the cross” in a Frankel-like manner<sup>24</sup>. The theatrical ‘presentation’ of Jakovljević’s testimonies from the camp was composed skillfully and tensely, thus introducing us to Jakovljević’s narration and poetry itself, which makes the play deep and ambiguous. Thus, the play was never reduced to just a brutal story about ‘camping’. Viewers can learn a lot from such fragments. They can learn how human beings behave in situations where they can lose nothing but their bare lives. The alternation between the flows of emotionality, hopelessness, cruelty, apathy, bloodthirstiness, fear and deep despair is interesting. Here, and in a philosophical sense, we encounter the central theme of existentialism, and that is suffering. Life is suffering and

<sup>21</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 246

<sup>22</sup> *Ibidem*

<sup>23</sup> *Ibidem*

<sup>24</sup> Viktor Frankl, *Zašto se niste ubili: Uvod u logoterapiju* (Zagreb: Aurum. 2014), p. 13

to survive means to find the meaning of suffering. For if, in Nietzsche-like terms, life has any meaning at all, then both suffering and dying must have meaning. But there is no person who can tell another person what that meaning is. Every man must discover it for himself, and every man must take upon himself the responsibility which the chosen meaning of life and the principles he advocates inevitably impose on him. If he succeeds in this, man will rise and overcome regardless of the difficulties and sufferings he encounters, and ultimately, with death itself.

In this manner, we come to the notion of the concept of human dignity, which is very much reflected in the play "*Logorilijada*". 'Living with dignity' is not an empty phrase, because everyone knows - everyone without exception - how great the pressure is that will deprive him of his dignity. Everyone knows when they preserve their dignity and when they lose it, there are few who dare to say that they have never lost their dignity in any conditions and situations, and that in order to preserve it, they have resisted all small and large fears, big and small waitings. He who does not lie in this case knows very well what the salvation of individual dignity is, because of being tempted regularly. For Ilija Jakovljević, to be dignified in one's suffering and to be worthy of it (as Dostoevsky once wrote), means to take seriously that one can perish thanks to one's reluctance, that one cannot - under the pretext of being small, weakened, enslaved - renounce one's will, to be a subject for himself. To assert that only because of our own reluctance - that is, by our own will - can we fail and make the content of that decision come true and disclosed. Of course, dignity can be lost without losing reason - the capacity for irony.<sup>25</sup> According to him, one can die without dignity just by convulsing with helpless laughter. But living in dignity is neither funny nor carefree. Responsibility should be borne even for those who have lost all dignity and have not lost political or any other positions, who persuade and force others to deprive themselves of dignity. Because they too, although being 'rags' (Rushdie), belong to this world. They are its product.

### Theater - Ilija Jakovljević last refuge

When in the early twentieth century in Germany theaterology was introduced as an independent scientific discipline and as a new science of art, this sealed the end of the previous understanding of theater and theatrical art.<sup>26</sup> Since the time of the tendency to literalize in the 18<sup>th</sup> century, the idea of

<sup>25</sup> Milan Kundera, *Besmrtnost* (Sarajevo: Veselin Masleša, 1991)

<sup>26</sup> Erika Fischer-Lichte, *Estetika performativne umjetnosti* (Sarajevo/Zagreb: Šahinpašić, 2009)

theater has been created in Germany not only as an ethical institution but also as a “textual” art. At the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the artistic character of the theater was almost absolutely defined by the dramatic text and the attitude towards literary texts. In other words, the artistic character of a theatrical play was verified through a derived text.<sup>27</sup> According to her, the theater critic Alfred Klaar wrote back in 1918 in a controversy about theatrology that the full value of the stage can be confirmed if poetry also gives it content.<sup>28</sup> In defense of this claim, and in the context of the play “*Logorilijada*”, we can rely on the philosophical thinking given by Rorty when talking about creating social conditions for the most favorable monitoring of the imperative of self-realization, which primarily refers to poets, artists in general<sup>29</sup> and a “romantic intellectual” should be at the center of “self-actualizing culture.” “Romantic intellectuals who recognize contingency in the culture of ‘idols’ twilight’ should take the place of heroes and role models.” The romantic poet, working on his autonomy, on his self-realization, on his re-description, becomes a model of a new, postmodern undivine culture whose idiosyncrasy expands everyone’s vocabulary to deal with reality.<sup>30</sup> Analyzing Rorty’s reflections, Mujkić believes that the “self-description” of these “strong poets” could satisfy the utilitarian principle of “happiness of the largest number of people” by giving a “pattern” for self-creation based on the abilities of as many members of one community as possible. *Depriving the possibility of self-creation of a large number of people means a lack of freedom, it means a repressive society in which individuals are oppressed and humiliated because they are not allowed to “be”*<sup>31</sup>. Furthermore, from the aspect of the metaphors of a particular work and its impact on society, Rorty wrote the following: “Only when a romantic intellectual begins to want loyalty only to his own self to be a model for other human beings, only then does his policy tend towards anti-liberalism. When he begins to think that other human beings have a moral duty to achieve the same internal autonomy that he has achieved, then he thinks, in fact, of political and social changes that will help others achieve that. Then he might think he has a moral duty to provoke these changes, whether his fellow citizens want them or not”<sup>32</sup>. It can be concluded that this approach implies a process of transformation of our own moral self-understanding. The ethical imperatives of self-understanding and self-creation in their application are also

<sup>27</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 25

<sup>28</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 26

<sup>29</sup> Asim Mujkić, *Neopragmatizam Richarda Rortyja: Uvod u demokratizirano mišljenje* (Tuzla: PrintCom, 2000), p. 58

<sup>30</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 59

<sup>31</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 59 – 60

<sup>32</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 60

aesthetic. The problem of self-creation and realization of personality is the central problem of the time in which we live now, in which strong external pressures prevent this self-creation, i.e. the manifestation of the will of the individual, which is primarily directed to character. According to Golding, this is the central problem of modern thought, and that is the nature of human personality and the reflection of that personality on society. "It is an attempt to try to explain the shortcomings of a society in terms of human nature. The lesson is that the form of human society must depend on the ethical nature of individuals, not on the political system, no matter how logical or respectable it may be"<sup>33</sup>.

What the play "*Logorilijada*" confirms is that art is able to use different data for one authentic composition, to present a true life under one illusion. When, looking at a play like this, we notice the truth about life, we are not even aware of the role that something completely different plays in it - life itself. It is not just a work about life, one life is invested in it, it is life itself. Speaking of reality, art is reality itself, composed of speech. Art does not stand *vis a vis* reality, so that it could be presented coldly and uninterestedly, but at the center of reality, so that reality itself inevitably manifests itself through it. It is not only a reflection, but also a ground and a medium through which reality itself speaks for itself. In this way, that side of art is created, more precisely its power to realize and defend human beings, certain life attitudes and principles. In addition to the fact that art can speak about our reality, in addition to the fact that art, just like the play "*Logorilijada*" can reveal the truth about reality hidden behind the chaos of the past and its phenomena, and then in addition to its ability to provide reality, cold and alienated human meaning, art also possesses this ability to realize possibilities that perhaps without it would never have been a reality. In this way, art performs an ontological function, creative and poetic, to find an adequate example from reality (such as the life and death of Ilija Jakovljević), giving it a new real attire and turning it into reality again. In other words, striving to get even closer to reality, to its truth, art gives birth to another reality as the materialization of its attempts. What happens in theatrical performances can be described as "re-enchanting the world and transforming those who participate in them"<sup>34</sup>. At the same time, as we have seen in the play "*Logorilijada*", this character of theatrical performances is mostly articulated through the painting of realities from the past and can serve as a basis for even greater intervention, i.e., the endeavor of objectification of human being and human suffering.

<sup>33</sup> William Golding, *Gospodar muha* (Zagreb: Algoritam, 2014), p. 212 – 213

<sup>34</sup> Erika Fischer-Lichte, *Estetika performativne umjetnosti* (Sarajevo/Zagreb: Šahinpašić. 2009), p. 223

If we could say that theater lives with time and people “to whom it communicates revelations about the primordial society and about their very life, as it is, or as it is not, and it would strive to be”<sup>35</sup>, one can still not say the theater is disappearing with it. In this way, the need arises to avoid simplified sociological contemplation. According to Repovac, it is important to understand that theater, as any other art, is generally an artistic game, something that surpasses the frame of legislation and periodization of social progress, not allowing any limitation or detrition in the given time-space period.<sup>36</sup> If it succumbs to pressure, the theater is no longer a game, but an ideological matrix, or a banal reflection of social forms and circumstances. But if the aesthetic aspect prevails over the social, if the universal in art outgrows the paradigms of the time in which it is created, it also does not mean, and in the case of the play “Logorilijada”, that art has lost its social character. Through the aesthetic aspect, it has outgrown the framework of the ideologies of its own time, continuing its game, no less open than society and social life itself.

From the aspect of Kant’s philosophy, aesthetic play has its way of reflecting through institutions and education in them. It gained its unambiguous social character in theaters, art collections, libraries and museums. This way, in Kant’s terms, the restless spirit finds refuge. This subjectivist aspect has many meanings. It represents an endless provocation to find new aesthetic impulses in order to gain new knowledge, discover unknown knowledge or meet death itself like Ilija Jakovljević. And what could be more serious than life and death shaped into artistic expression? In this regard, the timelessness of art becomes an essential definition of aesthetic consciousness as well, which gives works of art authentic value. Since art also operates within a specific time, it draws special aesthetic experiences and ‘lessons’ from it, it further shapes, changes, and adapts them so that the work has some of the universal values of civilization.

Furthermore, when talking about aesthetic experience, it is important to mention the characteristics of the relationship between dramaturgy and theater. In most cases, the theater remains in its essence ‘entertaining’, and thus surpassed when today’s extremely complex social, political and aesthetic experiences are taken into account. In this context, we are wrong if we think that these are different experiences, they are only different levels and ranges of the above mentioned. The first aspect is the ability to crystallize the very essence of such experiences, and the second relates to the way in which a particular experience reaches the public. This is essentially a rule that applies to all arts. So, is there a need to emphasize the importance of a dramatic text

<sup>35</sup> Hidajet Repovac, *Eseji o književnosti i umjetnosti* (Sarajevo: Dobra knjiga, 2013), p. 405

<sup>36</sup> *Ibidem*

that manages to clarify to the viewers the very essence and intention of the work? It does not depend on the theater or the setting of the stage and the actors whether or not the drama will exist, it is rather a reverse approach, that the social, engaged importance and level of aesthetic range of the play, the very essence of the work of art, depends on whether there will be theater in terms of how we consider what the real role of theater is. Thus, a powerful dramatic text in which we can find elements of the mentioned characteristics, provokes today's theater in the true sense of the word, with all its means of expression. Such elements can be found in the text of "*Logorilijada*". These are scenes that we cannot imagine or predict in advance. They represent a way of understanding certain experiences until the essence of the very idea of the work and its reception is understood.

That is why it is not at all simple, in the sociological sense, to perceive and reflect on the social aspects and the social role of art. In order for this perception to be somewhat successful, it is necessary to derive this role from the overall culture of a particular society, in this case Bosnia and Herzegovina, from its historical, social, political, ethical and other conditions that directly or indirectly shape a play or its adaptation.

French sociologist of art Jean Marie Guyau<sup>37</sup> in his work *L'art du point de vue sociologique*, believes that art is threefold social, regarding its origin (from the first cultures to contemporary art, it is involved in social life), its purpose (art is not there for itself, it exists for the sake of society) and its essence<sup>38</sup>. In the context of the essence of the work itself, leading the authors themselves out of the unknown, aesthetic, social and ethical experiences and reflections are sublimated. In the case of the play "*Logorilijada*", we agree with Lukacs that the drama is preceded by a "program", and we can say that social intentions can be seen in it, but also those intentions that build aesthetic and ethical experience.

In this regard, Jean Divignaud contextualized theater with the history of "collective shadows" and showed that theater, understood as an artistic play carried by a striking dramatic text, has always been a mix of symbols and symbolic interpretation of the world, colliding with cruel reality, trivial in its essence, and that in all periods it needs both escape and suppression in order to preserve its autonomy and freedom as much as possible.<sup>39</sup> According to him, it has always been at a distance when it comes to cruel and bizarre reality, probably trying to resist the strong social determinants that inevitably

---

<sup>37</sup> Jean Marie Guyau is a French sociologist of culture and art at a time when this sociology was just being established as a separate sociological discipline, he is the successor of Hippolytue Taine (late 19<sup>th</sup> century). *Repovac, op.cit.*

<sup>38</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 421

<sup>39</sup> Jean Divignaud, *Sociologija pozorišta* (Beograd: BIGZ, 1978)

entered his field of action, especially political and ideological and its aesthetic experience. In this regard, the theater and this play about Ilija Jakovljević goes a long way in search of identity and freedom, for a newer expression that could correspond to the newer aspirations of theater, its aesthetic and ethical ideals, especially when considering issues such as intellectuals position, artists position, domination of one over the other, death camps, social and societal exclusion, injustice and the right to life. The answers to such and similar questions that art has always asked, and still asks today, may seem complicated, insufficient and even superficial, taking into account the prevailing technicality, relativism, and triviality of societies obsessed with consumer culture. But one thing is for sure, theater still must not ignore this factual situation. Theater lives only thanks to the fact that there are people, their destinies and their works which immutable values will always be able to refer to, from different angles and different aesthetic preferences. Didn't Brecht also say that the task of art is not to kill boredom but evil.

## Conclusion

The play *Logorilijada* is an important attempt to summarize the bitterness of the last century through the prism of the tragic fate of an intellectual and artist. In the scenes of this play, an artistically shaped trace of a gloomy time remains, a trace in which every spectator can find the real history of a personal, individual, but also collective universal human suffering. If art accepts the principle that testimonies are credible and valuable only if they are authentically individual, then it is more than certain that this principle is fully confirmed in the case of the play about Ilija Jakovljević. If its value is further measured by the way in which the representation responds to the challenges of the present i.e. its time, but also to the challenges of its own existence, then it is sufficient to say the goal has been achieved.

Faced with today's time, its ambiguities and contradictions, this play writes its moral history as well, human circumstances and situations which are not only one life biography of all characters in the play but also a symbolic image of today's world with a disturbed values system. An individual is both a witness and a victim of the historical element with which he is affected and to which he testifies. His rebellion has no power, and his truth is always in danger by force of ideological reasons. Justice is at the service of a fetish system of government that always operates on the principles of infallibility and cruel consistency. In Orwellian terms, the truth is the inviolable monopoly of the centers of power following the blind principle that the individual cannot be right 'against the party'.

The principles of freedom and justice in such distorted value systems are paid with the highest cost - human life. In this way, *Logorilijada* turns the universal theme of the conflict between aggressive force and helpless victim into a contemporary tragedy. Unlike the tragic characters of the classical type, blinded by the inevitability of the fateful mission that the tragic action made irreversible and unchangeable, the character of Ilija Jakovljević in the play is lucid and aware the world around him in closing in towards an impenetrable senseless circle, that the mechanism of that world unscrupulously destroys all human perceptions and all reasons invoking mercy, justice, or truth. Not only is the human being unable to change the character and nature of the aggressive and primitive world, which is no longer absurd by itself in the Camus-like sense, his own position to be a dignified stronghold and shelter that allows at least some free choice is also impossible.

It can be concluded that the tragic position in *Logorilijada* is not the result of exclusively unfavorable historical and social circumstances but is also tragic because it is deprived of all human, moral and legal assumptions related to the concept of man and his primordial existence and meaning in the world. It is the very destruction of ethical standards that is an acute problem for the authors of this play and becomes the focus of their critique of totalitarian ideologies.

The only thing left for Ilija Jakovljević is to rise above the world that denies his existence through his sacrifice, as a kind of tragic redemption, not accepting the shameless logic of that world.

## Literature

- Adorno, Theodor W. *Vaspitanje posle Aušvica*, Treći Program, No. 127-128, III-IV, 2005, p. 245-258
- Arendt, Hannah. *Izvori totalitarizma*. Beograd: Feministička izdavačka kuća 94. 1998.
- Divignaud, Jean. *Sociologija pozorišta*. Beograd: BIGZ. 1978.
- Eagleton, Terry. *Kultura*. Beograd: CLIO. 2017.
- Fischer-Lichte, Erika. *Estetika performativne umjetnosti*. Sarajevo/Zagreb: Šahinpašić. 2009.
- Frankl, Viktor. *Zašto se niste ubili: Uvod u logoterapiju*. Zagreb: Aurum. 2014.
- Golding, William. *Gospodar muha*. Zagreb: Algoritam. 2014.
- Golstein, Slavko. *1941. Godina koja se vraća*. Beograd: Službeni glasnik; Sarajevo: Synopsis. 2012.
- Kiš, Danilo. *Grobnica za Borisa Davidovića*. Beograd: BIGZ. 1990.

- Kiš, Danilo. *Homo poeticus*. Podgorica: Narodna knjiga. 2010.
- Kundera, Milan. *Besmrtnost*. Sarajevo: Veselin Masleša. 1991.
- Lasić, Mile. *Kultura sjećanja (Pledoaje za izgradnju kulture sjećanja i u regiji Jugoistoka Evrope)*. Sarajevo: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung. 2011.
- Lovrenović, Ivan. *Ilija Jakovljević i zemlji grobova*, <http://ivanlovrenovic.com/clanci/zapisi/ilija-jakovljevic-u-zemlji-grobova>, 07/02/2012, [17/06/2019]
- Margalit, Avishai. *Pristojno društvo*. Beograd: Radio B92. 1998.
- Mujkić, Asim. *Neopragmatizam Richarda Rortyja: Uvod u demokratizirano mišljenje*. Tuzla: PrintCom. 2000.
- Repovac, Hidajet. *Eseji o književnosti i umjetnosti*. Sarajevo: Dobra knjiga. 2013.
- Rushdie, Salman. *Džozef Anton: Memoari*. Beograd: Vulkan izdavaštvo. 2013.
- Solženjicin, Aleksandar. *Arhipelag Gulag*. Beograd: Rad. 1988.

**Milica B. Siljak<sup>1</sup>**

*University of East Sarajevo  
Faculty of Philosophy Pale  
Bosnia and Herzegovina*

**Short announcement**

*UDC 316.347:323.15(497.6)  
DOI 10.7251/SOCEN2120085S  
COBISS.RS-ID 133792513  
Accepted: 04/04/2021*

## **Ethnic identity(s) in post-Yugoslav Bosnia and Herzegovina**

### **Abstract**

*The coexistence of the three majority ethnic groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina (Serbs, Croats and Bosniaks) is a basic indicator of the ethnic plurality of the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina, and thus the identity of a divided society. What role ethnic identity plays in today's interethnic relations is the main topic of this paper, as well as the influence of stereotypes on the perception of other ethnic groups. The paper is based on the research of ethnic stereotypes in the Bosnian society by the method of surveys, and the results will show how ethnic stereotypes or already based attitudes affect the observation of "different" i.e. members of other ethnic groups living in Bosnia and Herzegovina and bearers of different ethnic identities.*

**Keywords:** *ethnic identity; Bosnia and Herzegovina; stereotypes*

### **Introduction**

Ethnic relations are represented in every society, it is impossible that ethnic groups, living in a common territory, do not have contacts, whether they are peaceful, or accompanied by misunderstandings or conflicts. With the disintegration of the former Yugoslavia, invoking ethnic identity in ethnically plural societies mainly contributes to intolerance between peoples belonging to different religions, cultures, ethnic and national groups. Ethnically plural societies, such as the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina due to the unfavorable socio-political situation throughout history, are often defined as unstable and conflicting societies. Mihailo Marković is of the opinion that the national issue in multinational socialist societies (Yugoslavia), although it has been

---

<sup>1</sup> Department of Sociology; E-mail: milica.ikanovic@gmail.com

claimed to be resolved, actually has not. "Old national conflicts appeared, at least temporarily, unresolved. Under the conditions of accelerated material growth and progressively improving standards of living, they assumed a latent form. They flared up soon after those societies entered a period of serious economic and political crisis."<sup>2</sup> Affirmation and emphasis on ethnic identities, during transition processes, can often be a cause of conflict with neighboring ethnic communities and cultures. This can be explained by citing the example of the break-up of Yugoslavia and the conflicts that erupted just at the time of the great transition process. Usually, by emphasizing one's own culture and ethnic community, the other is seen as less valuable and whose members feel intolerance and repulsion. "The difference between "us" and "them", between our culture and some other culture, is seen here as the difference between the only real and authentic culture and various forms of false, artificial culture or culture at a lower stage of development. In that situation, the task of "our" culture is not only to preserve and defend its identity among other cultures, but much more than that: to take on a messianic role, to enlighten, educate and save others from ruin."<sup>3</sup> Based on the above, the question arises, what factors are the main cause of disagreement between ethnic groups that share a common state, territory, language? Ethnocentrism, accompanied by the spread of nationalism, political and ideological differences, different religious teachings, conflicts throughout history, are fertile ground for widening distances and disagreements between ethnic groups, which is characteristic of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

According to Milosavljević and Jugović, prejudices and stereotypes are the basis for marginalization towards some social groups. Koković defines stereotypes as molded, typical and rigid representations, clichéd understandings of certain social objects (social class, ethnic, religious or racial group) which are very widespread and are acquired in the process of socialization and upbringing.<sup>4</sup> "Prejudices are types of attitudes that are not based on valid experience or rational arguments, but make tendentious generalizations that are affectively burdened and that are strongly resistant to change even when faced with new information."<sup>5</sup>

<sup>2</sup> Mihailo Markovic, *Tragedy of national conflicts in "real socialism": The case of the Yugoslav Autonomous Province of Kosovo* (United Kingdom: PRAXIS International, 408-424, 1989/4), p. 408

<sup>3</sup> Ivan Čolović, *Balkan – teror kulture* (Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek. 2008), p. 13

<sup>4</sup> Dragan Koković, *Društvo i medijski izazovi: Uvod u sociologiju masovnih komunikacija* (Novi Sad: Filozofski fakultet, Odsek za medijske studije, Novinarska biblioteka knj. 5, 2007)

<sup>5</sup> Milosav Milosavljević, Aleksandar Jugović, *Izvan granica društva: Savremeno društvo i marginalne grupe* (Beograd: Univerzitet u Beogradu, Fakultet za specijalnu edukaciju i rehabilitaciju – Izdavački centar CIDD, 2009), p. 14

Identity means all those characteristics of an individual or social group that distinguish them from other individuals or social groups. These individuals or groups may possess multiple identities because they have multiple roles, they are members of different groups, and therefore possess different personal or group characteristics. There are many types of identities, and the main division is into personal and social. Personal identity refers to the personal characteristics of an individual that he acquires at birth, but also builds them in the family, relationship with the environment and others, and refers to sexuality, physical constitution, characteristics, personal characteristics that distinguish him from other individuals. Personal identity is built in stages, starting from birth and throughout life. Social identity is realized through an individual's belonging to a certain social group and by creating a sense of belonging or identification with its members, and based on that there is a local, regional, ethnic, national, religious, class, racial identity. "A social group is a set of individuals who hold a common social identification or view themselves as members of the same social category. Through a social comparison process, persons who are similar to the self are categorized with the self and are labeled the in-group; persons who differ from the self are categorized as the out-group."<sup>6</sup> According to the degree of closeness, identities could be divided into primary ones, which are closely related to a person, such as family and peer identity. Secondary identities can usually be chosen or left by oneself, and those identities include cultural, political, party, work identity.

The paper will later expose a review of theoretical discourses that are useful for understanding ethnic identity, present the results of research on ethnic stereotypes and opinions about members of other ethnic groups in the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina, which affect the creation of ethnic distance.

### **An overview of theoretical discourses on ethnic identity**

Anthony Smith defines an ethnic group through six main attributes:

- Collective proper name,
- The myth of common origin,
- Common historical memories,
- One or more differentiating elements of a common culture,
- Connection with a particular homeland, and
- Sense of solidarity with significant sections of the population.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>6</sup> Peter Burke, Jan E. Stets, Identity theory and social identity theory, *Social Psychology Quarterly* Vol. 63, No. 3, American Sociological Association, 224-237, 2000, p. 225

<sup>7</sup> Antoni D. Smit, *Nacionalni identitet* (Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek, 2010), p. 40

Guided by Smith's definition of an ethnic group, we conclude that ethnic identity is stronger and more stable if all its elements are more present and that all these elements have a historical category and are prone to change. Smith points out that belonging to an ethnic group is a matter of attitudes, perceptions and sentiments, which depend on the situation in which the individuals find themselves. And as the situation changes, so will their identification with the group. This allows ethnicity to be "instrumentally" used to advance individual or collective interests according to which ethnicity becomes a "useful tool". Based on Smith's definition, we define an ethnic group as a category of people made up of myths about a common origin, a common language, customs, history, tradition, religion. "Each ethnicity, which can have its equivalent in a people, nation or ethnic group, represents a relatively complete set of national and cultural characteristics, from linguistic, moral, customary, religious to aesthetic. On the basis of them, collective and group moods are formed which create a feeling of belonging and togetherness, which is subsumed under identity."<sup>8</sup>

By ethnic group, Žarko Obradović means "members of the same or similar origin, and the group has a common dialect or language, customs, tradition and many specifics in the elements of material culture, as well as several other cultural and historical features. An ethnic group is, as a rule, but not necessarily, a grouped and territorialized community in a certain way."<sup>9</sup>

Identification with members of an ethnic group with the creation of a sense of belonging is important for the formation of ethnic identity. The formation of identity is very much influenced by the value system that the individual has adopted as a member of society, where the process of socialization comes to the fore. Belonging of an individual to a certain social group also affects the further orientations of the individual, their interactions and the way of acting. By identifying with the members of the group, the individual creates, modifies and adjusts their identity, whether it is personal or social. Stuart Hall believes that identification is constituted by recognizing a common origin or common trait with another person or group, or with an ideal. It is a process that works through difference, it requires discursive work, connecting and marking symbolic boundaries, producing a "border effect", so that what is left out strengthens that process.<sup>10</sup> For one ethnic group to be aware of its ethnic identity, it must involve contact and relationship with other ethnic groups.

<sup>8</sup> Биљана Милошевић Шошо, *Мултиетничко друштво и девијантне појаве* (Источно Сарајево: Завод за уџбенике и наставна средства, 2013), p. 127

<sup>9</sup> Жарко Обрадовић, *Балкански етнички мозаик* (Београд: Чигоја штампа, 2014), p. 29

<sup>10</sup> Stuart Hall, "Kome treba 'identitet'?", *Politika teorije, zbornik rasprava iz kulturalnih studija*, (priredio Dean Duda) (Zagreb 2006, 357 - 374), p. 217

Fredrik Barth explains that ethnic identity is built and changed in interaction within social groups, thanks to processes of inclusion and exclusion that establish boundaries between these groups.<sup>11</sup> Thus, ethnic identity is built on the basis of the “other” and diversity, creating a sense of belonging to one ethnic group, as opposed to another. “Every identity requires another: someone else in relation to whom and through whom self-identity is actualized. By their actions, others can impose an unwanted identity on their own.”<sup>12</sup>

Kecmanović explains the differences in ethnicity, religion, culture, language between ethnic groups in the former Yugoslavia as “narcissism of small differences”, since “enemies have a lot in common”.

“At the heart of this phenomenon lies every ethnic group’s need to establish and maintain its identity as permanently and firmly as possible. Painstaking skill is required to distinguish yourself from those who resemble you. This is accomplished by the members of one ethnic group projecting onto the members of another ethnic group all that is negative in themselves that they do not wish to acknowledge as part of themselves. The ideal object for this projection is not someone whose characteristics are quite different from ours, but someone who is similar to us – just like us, and yet different.”<sup>13</sup>

According to Ronald Laing, the other is a “tool for identity.” Complementarity in relationships where the other determines the “I” and vice versa is important for the creation of identity. In order to be aware of our ethnicity, we need to create boundaries with other ethnic groups, and thus distinguish the characteristics of “our” group from “other” groups. Others serve us to confirm our own identities by verifying them. If others do not react as we think they should and are in line with our identity and roles, then they are not verifying our identities. By interacting with others, we emphasize the importance of understanding behavior through the meanings we store in one’s identity.

Each ethnic community has special characteristics that distinguish it from other ethnic communities. These characteristics and special characteristics make up ethnic identity, as a general characteristic, and these can be a common language, territory, religious affiliation, culture, development of awareness of common belonging.

“By definition, ethnic groups are more or less isolated, but they are also aware that there are members of other ethnic groups

<sup>11</sup> Filip Putinja, *Teorije o etnicitetu* (Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek, 1997), p. 7

<sup>12</sup> Ronald D. Leing, *Jastvo i drugi* (Novi Sad: Biblioteka Svetovi, Bratstvo-jedinstvo, 1989), p. 81

<sup>13</sup> Dusan Kecmanovic, *Ethnic Times: Exploring Ethnonationalism in the Former Yugoslavia* (London: Preager, 2002), p. 4

somewhere, and they are always in some contact with them. Moreover, these groups or categories are, in a sense, created only by that touch. The identity of a group is always determined to some extent by what the group in question is not - in other words, by those who do not belong to the group.”<sup>14</sup>

In this regard, it is concluded that the identity of ethnic groups develops in mutual contact, and not isolated from others, and that group identities influence the perceptions, attitudes, opinions, affects and behavior of its members. When explaining social identity and activating it, Jan Stets and Peter Burke used the term depersonalization, taken from theorist Turner in 1987, as a central cognitive process in which a person perceives the normative aspects of group membership in a prototype, then acts in accordance with those norms. “Depersonalization is a basic process underlying group phenomena such as social stereotypes, group cohesiveness, ethnocentrism, cooperation and altruism, emotional contagion and collective action.”<sup>15</sup>

According to Tatiana Panfilova, ethnic identity includes, in addition to unconscious aspirations and feelings, a person's self-awareness as a representative of this community, their conscious assessment of the ethnic group to which they belong, unlike other groups. Since socialization is the basis for the formation of identity, if a person is deprived of their usual basis of socialization, they perceive their condition as a loss of identity. According to her, globalization eliminates cultural differences, and thus the borders between cultural and ethnic groups, and creates conditions for the loss of identity. One compensates for this lack of identity by excessive affection for a national or religious group. “Under these circumstances some ethnic or religious groups exalt their distinctive traits and religious beliefs to assume the right to be the only representatives of the appropriate culture or religion.”<sup>16</sup>

Stets and Burke from Hoggs and Abrams (1990) take up the terms self-categorization and social comparison, when explaining relationships among members belonging to the same group and possessing a common identity and relationships with members of other groups. Self-categorization is defined as emphasizing perceived similarities between oneself and other group members and emphasizing perceived differences between oneself and members outside the group. Such similarities and differences relate to attitudes, beliefs, and values, affective reactions, behavioral norms, speech styles, and other traits believed to correlate with relevant intergroup categorization. Social comparison refers to accents that will result in self-improvement of

<sup>14</sup> Tomas Hilan Eriksen, *Etnicitet i nacionalizam* (Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek, 2004), p. 28

<sup>15</sup> Peter Burke, Jan E. Stets, *op.cit.*, p. 232

<sup>16</sup> Panfilova, Tatiana, Identity as a problem of today, *FACTA UNIVERSITATIS*, Series: Philosophy, Sociology, Psychology and History Vol. 9, No1, 37 – 44; 2010, p. 41

outcomes for oneself, leading to being evaluated positively in the group and negatively outside the group.<sup>17</sup>

“Having a particular social identity means being like others in the group and seeing things from the group’s perspective. It is assumed that individuals as group members think alike and act alike. Thus, there is uniformity in thought and action in being a group member. Individuals do not have to interact with other group members in order to think and act like the group.”<sup>18</sup>

Such a statement can also be applied to ethnic identity, where there is uniformity in the actions and opinions of members of one nation, and especially when expressing opinions about members of others and different.

Christian Giordano believes that stereotypes in relations between cultures and ethnic groups should document their own superiority and that each of them always feels like a “better kind of people”. This is shown by Levi Strauss’s claim that ethnocentrism in intercultural relations is one of the basic constants of the collective thought schemes of every society.<sup>19</sup>

Contacts between different groups can be influenced by various factors, among which the most significant are the demographic, political, capitalist mode of production, the development of modern technologies, as well as the globalization changes of modern society. This contact enables ethnic groups to cooperate with each other, have harmonious relations, or to distance themselves from each other, differentiate, and sometimes even conflict. Therefore, it is important to follow the relations of ethnic and national groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina throughout history, so that we can understand the current state of interethnic and transnational relations in this country. The history of the Balkan countries has been accompanied by differences in cultural and ethnic identity and the struggle of these peoples over the redistribution of territories. Wars and conflicts between ethnic groups in this area are the reason why even today we live a “divided” life of people of different religions and ethnicities, which led to ethnic distance, misunderstanding, and intolerance between peoples and creating negative stereotypes towards other ethnic groups and spreading antagonism.

Christian Giordano believes that the redefinition of identity came with the fall of the Berlin Wall, which led to the rebirth of nationalism in the Balkans, and that current nationalism in post-socialist Europe is a product of socio-economic and cultural crisis caused by system collapse and destruction of communist ideology.<sup>20</sup>

<sup>17</sup> Peter Burke, Jan E. Stets, *op. cit.*, p. 228

<sup>18</sup> Burke, Peter, Stets, Jan E. *Identity theory* (Oxford: University Press. 2009), p. 118

<sup>19</sup> Kristijan Đordano, *Ogledi o interkulturnoj komunikaciji* (Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek, 2001), p. 10

<sup>20</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 171

Janković distinguishes between two types of nationalism, ethnic and political.

“Nationalism as a negative social phenomenon, which is reflected in intolerance, hatred, often violence against members of other nations, is most often associated with the ethnic understanding of the nation, while political understanding is most often associated with “positive nationalism” (patriotism), which is directed towards respect for the state and its symbols, not a specific nation.”<sup>21</sup>

That the issue of ethnic and national identity permeates the daily lives of ethnic groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina is evidenced by the very division of the warring parties in the past war, in which nationality and ethnicity were the main cause of the division. “During the war, as well as shortly after it, the basic existential issues of the people in Bosnia and Herzegovina and the region were related to belonging to a certain ethnic group. For most, being close to their own group meant security, and being exposed to someone else’s group meant potentially endangered.”<sup>22</sup>

Branimir Stojković believes that identity is constructed using identifiers that are the basis for the emergence of stereotypes. “Identifiers are the basis for the emergence of stereotypes - simplified and value-colored notions that social groups establish about themselves and other groups.”<sup>23</sup> Based on that, we conclude that differences are the basis for creating a feeling of antipathy towards others, rejection, or in the worst case, hatred and contempt. “The problem of a divided or blurred identity can be solved in a different way - by declaring one’s own people a proto-nation, and everyone else more or less decadent historical derivatives, i.e. apostates.”<sup>24</sup>

What characterizes the former Yugoslav peoples today is the emphasis on ethnic and cultural affiliation and the growing strengthening of their identities, along with religious and political identities, which stand out and are strengthened by the threat of authenticity and uniqueness by others. Ethnic and cultural identity is becoming more and more alive, as individuals are threatening to preserve their culture, language, tradition, and their own people through rapid changes. The revival of ethnic and cultural identities in the

<sup>21</sup> Aleksandar Janković, Nacionalizam kao strukturalna prepreka u demokratizaciji bosansko-hercegovačkog društva. *Sociologija*, Vol 61 – broj 1, Filozofski fakultet, Univerzitet u Beogradu, 87-112, 2019, p. 93 – 94

<sup>22</sup> O. Haneš, *Sociodemografske karakteristike socijalne distance i stereotipi kod studenata u Banjaluci*. Banja Luka: Univerzitet u Banjoj Luci, Filozofski fakultet, 59-79, 2012., p. 60

<sup>23</sup> Branimir Stojković, *Identitet i komunikacija* (Beograd: Fakultet političkih nauka u Beogradu, Čigoja štampa, 2002), p. 15

<sup>24</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 18

former Yugoslavia is the cause of instability and social crises, accompanied by ethnic conflicts, inequalities, the spread of negative stereotypes and prejudices about members of others.

### **Results of research on stereotypes and opinions about “other” ethnic groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina**

The survey on ethnic stereotypes, conducted in March and April 2017, tried to answer the question about the quality of relations between ethnic groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina, based on the attribution of given characteristics and opinions about members of other ethnic groups. This sets the main hypothesis that ethnic identity, through the spirit of ethnonationalism, in the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina plays a leading role in the perception and stereotypical attribution of the characteristics of their own and other ethnic groups. “Social stereotypes are most often defined as beliefs shared by members of one group about the common characteristics of members of their own or any other group of people.”<sup>25</sup>

As the thesis of “narcissism of small differences” shows, small differences are glorified, in order to present one’s own ethnic group as different and more valuable than others. The research was conducted on a sample of 300 respondents in 5 municipalities of Bosnia and Herzegovina, using the survey method. Respondents were offered 22 characteristics (positive and negative) that could be attributed to certain ethnic groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

The results will show how ethnic stereotypes, or already established attitudes, affect the observation of “different” i.e. members of other ethnic groups living in Bosnia and Herzegovina. The environment is an important factor in which a value system is adopted that follows the classifications of members of society (stereotypes and prejudices) through various institutions such as the school system (textbooks, falsification of history, etc.), religious institutions, political system, etc. In such an environment, different attitudes about the other and the different are formed, which also affect the behavior of individuals or social groups. Through this research, it is interesting to see what attitudes and ways of thinking are present in society of Bosnia and Herzegovina and how they affect their perception of members of their own or other ethnic groups, i.e. the emergence of an autostereotype or a heterostereotype. The negative aspect of the stereotype is that it is the basis for attributing negative traits to others and different.

---

<sup>25</sup> Danijela Majstorović, Vladimir Turjačanin, (ur.). *Percepcija etničkih grupa u BiH: U okrilju nacije; Etnički i državni identitet kod mladih u Bosni i Hercegovini* (Banja Luka: Centar za kulturni i socijalni oporavak, 2011), p. 220

Respondents could attribute both positive and negative traits to ethnic groups, and for each ethnic group, whether it is their own or members of “others”, one trait, which they consider to be distinctive. Respondents could attribute the following characteristics to ethnic groups: lazy - hardworking, cowards - brave, stupid - smart, cold - sensitive, insidious - honest, unfair - fair, impolite - polite, dirty - clean, insolent - kind, quarrelsome - peaceful, primitive - civilized.

**Table 1** Socio-demographic structure of the sample

Socio-demographic structure of the sample		Number	%
Gender of respondents	Male	146	48.7
	Female	154	51.3
	<b>Total</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>100</b>
Age of respondents	Less than 18	50	16.7
	From 18 to 35	123	41
	From 35 to 60	79	26.7
	Over 60	48	16
	<b>Total</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>100</b>
Cities where respondents live	Trebinje	60	20
	Banjaluka	60	20
	Mostar	60	20
	Brčko	60	20
	Sarajevo	60	20
	<b>Total</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>100</b>
Ethnicity of respondents	Serb	116	38.7
	Bosniak	95	31.7
	Croat	76	25,3
	Rom	6	2
	Other	7	2.3
	<b>Total</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>100</b>

The given table shows that females (51.3%) were included in the survey in a higher proportion than males (48.7%), while the majority of respondents are members of the younger population aged 18 to 35 (41%). The survey was conducted in 5 cities of Bosnia and Herzegovina (Sarajevo, Banja Luka, Mostar, Brčko and Trebinje), and the survey mostly included Serbs (38.7%), Croats (25,3%) and Bosniaks (31.7%) in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

**Table 2** *Opinion on certain characteristics in Bosniaks*<sup>26</sup>

<b>Opinion on certain characteristics in Bosniaks</b>			
	<b>SERB</b>	<b>BOSNIAK</b>	<b>CROAT</b>
<b>LAZY</b>	6.0%	9.8%	2.6%
<b>HARD-WORKING</b>	5.2%	8.7%	2.6%
<b>COWARDS</b>	17.2%	1.1%	9.2%
<b>BRAVE</b>	-	22.8%	2.6%
<b>STUPID</b>	6.9%	-	7.9%
<b>SMART</b>	0.9%	7.6%	-
<b>COLD</b>	2.6%	-	10.5%
<b>SENSITIVE</b>	-	1.1%	-
<b>INSIDIOUS</b>	6.9%	-	7.9%
<b>HONEST</b>	-	5.4%	5.3%
<b>UNFAIR</b>	1.7%	1.1%	-
<b>FAIR</b>	0.9%	1.1%	1.3%
<b>IMPOLITE</b>	3.4%	5.4%	3.9%
<b>POLITE</b>	1.7%	3.3%	3.9%
<b>DIRTY</b>	0.9%	-	1.3%
<b>CLEAN</b>	-	2.2%	1.3%
<b>INSOLENT</b>	6.9%	-	2.6%
<b>KIND</b>	6.0%	10.9%	9.2%
<b>QUARRELSOME</b>	16.4%	3.3%	13.2%
<b>PEACEFUL</b>	4.3%	10.9%	7.9%
<b>PRIMITIVE</b>	9.5%	1.1%	5.3%
<b>CIVILIZED</b>	2.6%	4.3%	1.3%
	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>

In the given table it is noticed that Bosniaks have pretty picture of themselves. 22.8% of Bosniaks see their people as brave, 10.9% as kind and peaceful, but also 9.8% as lazy, 5.4% as impolite. In any case, a higher percentage show positive characteristics. Serbs think of Bosniaks as 17.2% cowards, 16.4% quarrelsome, 9.5% primitive, and as for the positive qualities they attribute to them that 6% are kind, 5.2% hard-working. Croats see Bosniaks as 13.2% quarrelsome, 10.5% cold, 7.9% peaceful and 5.3% honest. We see that Croats also have different opinions about Bosniaks.

<sup>26</sup> The questions about the properties are taken, and modified, from the paper: Srđan Puhalo, *Kako opažamo druge etničke grupe i njihove članove: Socijalna percepcija i etnička pripadnost kod srednjoškolaca u Bosni i Hercegovini* (Sarajevo: Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, 2013).

**Table 3** *Opinions on the possession of certain traits among Serbs*

<b>Opinion on certain characteristics in Serbs</b>			
	<b>SERB</b>	<b>BOSNIAK</b>	<b>CROAT</b>
<b>LAZY</b>	5.2%	5.4%	2.6%
<b>HARD-WORKING</b>	5.2%	4.3%	2.6%
<b>COWARDS</b>	0.9%	14.1%	3.9%
<b>BRAVE</b>	16.4%	1.1%	6.6%
<b>STUPID</b>	-	4.3%	1.3%
<b>SMART</b>	8.6%	1.1%	-
<b>COLD</b>	-	5.4%	6.6%
<b>SENSITIVE</b>	0.9%	1.1%	5.3%
<b>INSIDIOUS</b>	1.7%	6.5%	3.9%
<b>HONEST</b>	8.6%	6.5%	5.3%
<b>UNFAIR</b>	0.9%	4.3%	3.9%
<b>FAIR</b>	2.6%	1.1%	1.3%
<b>IMPOLITE</b>	1.7%	6.5%	5.3%
<b>POLITE</b>	4.3%	2.2%	5.3%
<b>DIRTY</b>		0.4%	0.4%
<b>CLEAN</b>	2.6%	3.3%	5.3%
<b>INSOLENT</b>	3.4%	5.4%	7.9%
<b>KIND</b>	12.1%	8.7%	11.8%
<b>QUARRELSOME</b>	4.3%	7.6%	3.9%
<b>PEACEFUL</b>	12.1%	2.2%	11.8%
<b>PRIMITIVE</b>	-	4.3%	2.5%
<b>CIVILIZED</b>	8.6%	4.3%	2.5%
	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>

In the given table, it is noticed that Serbs have pretty picture of themselves. 16.4% of Serbs see their people as brave, 12.1% that they are kind and peaceful, 8.6% that they are honest, but also 5.2% that they are lazy, 4.3% that they are quarrelsome. In any case, a higher percentage have characteristics that are positive. Bosniaks think of Serbs as 14.1% cowards, 7.6% quarrelsome, 4.3% primitive, and as for the positive characteristics they attribute to them that 8.7% are kind, 6.5% honest, 4.3% hardworking. We see that there are different opinions, but there is a higher percentage of negative characteristics. Croats see Serbs as 11.8% calm and kind, 7.9% insolent, 6.6% cold and brave. We see that Croats also have different opinions about Serbs, but it is important to point out that a larger percentage of characteristics are rated as positive.

**Table 4** *Opinion on certain characteristics in Croats*

<b>Opinion on certain characteristics in Croats</b>			
	<b>SERB</b>	<b>BOSNIAK</b>	<b>CROAT</b>
<b>LAZY</b>	1.7%	4.3%	2.6%
<b>HARD-WORKING</b>	5.2%	4.3%	5.3%
<b>COWARDS</b>	9.5%	6.5%	2.6%
<b>BRAVE</b>		1.1%	5.3%
<b>STUPID</b>		2.2%	
<b>SMART</b>	3.4%	2.2%	13.2%
<b>COLD</b>	12.1%	10.8%	1.3%
<b>SENSITIVE</b>		1.1%	1.3%
<b>INSIDIOUS</b>	6.0%	7.5%	
<b>HONEST</b>	1.7%	3.2%	2.6%
<b>UNFAIR</b>		1.1%	1.3%
<b>FAIR</b>		1.1%	2.6%
<b>IMPOLITE</b>	1.7%	6.5%	
<b>POLITE</b>	9.5%	10.8%	18.4%
<b>DIRTY</b>	0.9%		
<b>CLEAN</b>	5.2%	4.3%	7.9%
<b>INSOLENT</b>	7.8%	8.6%	1.3%
<b>KIND</b>	6.9%	8.6%	10.5%
<b>QUARRELSOME</b>	8.6%	6.5%	1.3%
<b>PEACEFUL</b>	2.6%	3.2%	9.2%
<b>PRIMITIVE</b>	2.6%	1.1%	2.6%
<b>CIVILIZED</b>	14.7%	5.4%	10.5%
	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>100%</b>

In the given table it is noticed that Croats have a pretty picture of themselves. 18.4% of Croats see their people as polite, 13.2% as smart, 10.5% as kind and civilized, but also 2.6% as lazy, cowards and primitive. A higher percentage have characteristics that are positive. Bosniaks think that Croats are 10.8% polite and cold, 8.6% kind and arrogant. We see that there are different opinions, but that the same percentage has positive and negative characteristics. Serbs see Croats as 14.7% civilized, 12.1% cold, 9.5% polite, but also as cowards. We see that Serbs also have different opinions about Croats, but it is important to point out that a higher percentage of characteristics are assessed as positive.

## Discussion on research results and concluding remarks

Under the influence of ethnic identity, individuals possess opinions, and thus direct their activities towards others. We define “others” as members of other ethnic groups. Research on stereotypes in the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina with the hypothesis that ethnic identity influences the stereotypical attribution of traits to “others and different”, the results showed that opinions about members of their own ethnic groups are usually based on positive traits and glorification of the groups to which they belong. By attributing negative traits to members of others, the results show that in ethnically plural societies, such as the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina, exclusion or inclusion often happen based on ethnicity or nationality. Maintaining negative stereotypes during the war, but also in post-Yugoslav Bosnia and Herzegovina, is the main indicator that Bosnian society is still in a phase of trans-conflict.

An individual is aware of their personal identity only in contact with others, just as members of one ethnic group are aware of their ethnicity and ethnic characteristics in comparison and perception with other ethnic groups. The ethnic groups of the society of Bosnia and Herzegovina have historically come a long way together, followed by different relations, both mutual conflicts and hatred, and coexistence in peaceful epochs.

Attributing negative or positive traits to members of a different identity, at the same time affects the quality of relationships and mutual rapprochement.

“A group contributes to the self-esteem of its members only if it manages to strengthen and maintain a positively valued diversity in relation to other groups. Through the process of comparing one’s own and other groups, negative stereotyping of another’s group contributes to the increased evaluation of one’s own group, and thus of the individual himself.”<sup>27</sup>

The property of ethnicity is a category of distinguishing between those who belong to a given group and those who do not belong, with a division into “ours” and “theirs”, “us” and “them”. Such a phenomenon is especially present in the Bosnian society, which the research showed. Emphasizing the quality of one’s own group to which they belong, attributing negative traits to members of other ethnic groups, is an indicator that ethnic distance is still present in this society, as well as the spread of prejudice. In order to overcome such a situation, it is necessary to find factors that would reduce the negative consequences of social disintegration.

<sup>27</sup> Danijela Majstorović, Vladimir Turjačanin, (ur.), *op. cit.*, p. 223

Peaceful coexistence, good relations, cooperation between minorities and the majority in one country are a well-known factor in the development of democracy, progress and stability. If, in addition, the state and society take measures to protect minority rights, it is possible to preserve traditional values in such a community.

“Ethnic distance and ethnic tolerance are important indicators of both the democratic and conflict potential of a society. The smaller the distance and the greater the tolerance, the greater the democratic and lower the conflict potential, and vice versa, the greater the distance and the lower the tolerance, the lower the democratic and higher the conflict potential of the observed society.”<sup>28</sup>

Lack of information is one of the main sources of spreading negative information about others, in this case members of other ethnic groups. It is important to form the knowledge that intolerance, antagonism and conflict situations only bring harm to everyone in the community.

## Bibliography

- Burke, Peter, Stets, Jan E. *Identity theory*. Oxford: University Press. 2009
- Burke, Peter, Stets, Jan E. Identity theory and social identity theory. *Social Psychology Quarterly* Vol. 63, No. 3, American Sociological Association, 224-237, 2000
- Čolović, Ivan. *Balkan – teror kulture*. Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek. 2008.
- Đordano, Kristijan. *Ogledi o interkulturnoj komunikaciji*. Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek. 2001.
- Eriksen, Tomas Hilan. *Etnicitet i nacionalizam*. Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek. 2004.
- Hall, Stuart. “Kome treba ‘identitet?’”, *Politika teorije, zbornik rasprava iz kulturnih studija*, (prir. Dean Duda), Zagreb 2006., 357.-374.
- Haneš, O. *Sociodemografske karakteristike socijalne distance i stereotipi kod studenata u Banjaluci*. Banja Luka: Univerzitet u Banjoj Luci, Filozofski fakultet, 59-79, 2012.
- Janković, Aleksandar, Nacionalizam kao strukturalna prepreka u demokratizaciji bosanskohercegovačkog društva. *Sociologija*, Vol 61 – broj 1, Filozofski fakultet, Univerzitet u Beogradu, 87-112, 2019
- Kecmanovic, Dusan. *Ethnic Times: Exploring Ethnonationalism in the Former Yugoslavia*. London: Preager, 2002

<sup>28</sup> Слободан Миладиновић, *Етнички односи и идентитети* (Београд: Народна библиотека Србије. 2009), p. 87

- Koković, Dragan. *Društvo i medijski izazovi: Uvod u sociologiju masovnih komunikacija*. Novi Sad: Filozofski fakultet, Odsek za medijske studije, Novinarska biblioteka knj. 5, 2007.
- Leing, Ronald D. *Jastvo i drugi*. Novi Sad: Biblioteka Svetovi, Bratstvo-jedinstvo. 1989.
- Миладиновић, Слободан. *Етнички односи и идентитети*. Београд: Народна библиотека Србије. 2009.
- Majstorović, Danijela, Turjačanin, Vladimir. (ur.). *Percepcija etničkih grupa u BiH: U okrilju nacije; Etnički i državni identitet kod mladih u Bosni i Hercegovini*, Banja Luka: Centar za kulturni i socijalni oporavak, 2011.
- Markovic, Mihailo. *Tragedy of national conflicts in "real socialism": The case of the Yugoslav Autonomous Province of Kosovo*. United Kingdom: PRAXIS International, 408-424, 1989/4
- Milosavljević, Milosav, Jugović, Aleksandar. *Izvan granica društva: Savremeno društvo i marginalne grupe*. Beograd: Univerzitet u Beogradu, Fakultet za specijalnu edukaciju i rehabilitaciju – Izdavački centar (CIDDD). 2009.
- Panfilova, Tatiana. Identity as a problem of today, *FACTA UNIVERSITATIS*, Series: Philosophy, Sociology, Psychology and History Vol. 9, No1, 37 – 44; 2010
- Puhalo, Srđan. *Kako opažamo druge etničke grupe i njihove članove (Socijalna percepcija etnička pripadnost kod srednjoškolaca u Bosni i Hercegovini)*. Sarajevo: Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, 2013.
- Putinja, Filip. *Teorije o etnicitetu*. Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek. 1997.
- Smit, Antoni D. *Nacionalni identitet*. Beograd: Biblioteka XX vek, 2010.
- Stojković, Branimir. *Identitet i komunikacija*. Beograd: Fakultet političkih nauka u Beogradu, Čigoja štampa, 2002.
- Милошевић Шошо, Биљана. *Мултиетничко друштво и девијантне појаве*. Источно Сарајево: Завод за уџбенике и наставна средства, 2013.
- Обрадовић, Жарко. *Балкански етнички мозаик*. Београд: Чигоја штампа. 2014